

# Medical Council of India New Delhi

## Minutes of the 31<sup>st</sup> Meeting of Board of Governors

The 31<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Board of Governors was held on 10<sup>th</sup> & 11<sup>th</sup> September, 2013, at 11.00 A.M. in the Council office at Sector-8, Pocket-14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110077. The following members of the Board of Governors attended the meeting :-

- 1) Dr. R.K. Srivastava, Chairman, BOG; - In Chair
- 2) Dr. K. Mohandas, Member, BOG.
- 3) Dr. K.S. Sharma, Member, BOGs.
- 4) Dr. A.K. Bardhan), Member, BOG
- 5) Dr. Raja Babu Panwar, Member, BOG
- 6) Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao, Member, BOG
- 7) Dr. Manoj K. Singh, Member, BOG;

and Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary, MCI.

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

2. The following items, as per Agenda, were discussed by the Board of Governors and decisions taken thereon as under :

2.1 **Confirmation of minutes of 30<sup>th</sup> BOG Meeting held on 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup> & 4<sup>th</sup> September, 2013** : The minutes were confirmed.

2.2 **Consideration of documents submitted by the Healthcare Sector Skill Council with regard to occupational standards for Allied Health & Paramedics** : The matter was discussed when the DS(UG) was also present. The Board of Governors agreed with the observation of the UG Committee that the document is a very well crafted document that has given in detail the work profile and skills of each technical personnel. After discussion, the BOG decided that a copy of CD containing the well crafted document, received from the Healthcare Sector Council, be provided to all the Medical Superintendents of Hospitals so as to ensure that all the para-medical professionals working in their Hospitals are trained in the skill development within the time frame in the desired manner.



(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

**2.3 Continuance of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission University, Salem, in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College, Puducherry – Consideration of Assessment Report** : The Board of Governors observed that the same Trust under whom the Aarupadai Veedu Medical College is functioning, also own an offshore campus in Bangkok. The UG Section was directed to prepare a list of all such offshore campuses owned by various medical colleges permitted/approved by the MCI and place it before the BOGs along with this item in the next meeting.

**2.4 Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Sardar Patel University in respect of students being trained at Pramukhswami Medical College, Karamsad – consideration of compliance submitted by the college authorities** : The Board of Governors considered the matter and decided to conduct compliance verification of the deficiencies as conveyed to the College by the Council vide its letter dated 7.2.2013. The Board of Governors viewed the delay in placing the matter before the BOGs. The Section is to clarify the position. The Section was advised to avoid all such delays in future.



(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

**2.5 Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore :** The Board of Governors directed the Council to present details of all offshore campuses owned by the Trust which is running the College, in the next meeting along with this item. The Board of Governors viewed the delay in placing the matter before the BOGs. The Section is to clarify the position. The Section was advised to avoid all such delays in future.

**2.6 Recognition of Azeezia Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Kollam, Kerala for award of MBBS Degree granted by the Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Trissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 :** The Board of Governors noted the complaint against the College received on 17.5.2013 upon which the Chief Secretary of Govt. of Kerala was requested to take necessary action vide letter dated 14.6.2013. Thereafter the Council has received a letter dated 22.7.2013 from the office of the Health & Family welfare(s), Thiruvananthapuram, wherein they have stated that a local enquiry was conducted in respect of the said College which revealed that the allegations raised in the complaint are not true. In the light of above position and also considering the position

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

indicated in the letter dated 17.7.2013 received from MoH&FW, the Board of Governors have decided to recommend grant of Recognition to the Azeezia Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Kollam, Kerala.

**2.7 Consideration of grant of permission to Sh. Manish Saxena (Batch-1998) for appearing in coming 2<sup>nd</sup> professional Examination at BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur :** The Board of Governors considered the matter and directed the Council to get a copy of the Ordinance of the University under which the BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur, is affiliated and the comments of the Registrar of the said University. The candidate should also be asked to submit copies of all documentary evidences for his repeated absence from the College.

**2.8 Complaint regarding deficiency of teaching faculty and clinical material in the department of CTVS :** The Board of Governors considered the matter and decided that as the Doctor is registered with Maharashtra State Medical Council, the complaint may be sent to that Council (with a copy marked to the complainant for his information) with the request to investigate the matter and provide their concluding report within the stipulated time period of six months.



(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

2.9 **Starting of various PG Courses at Melmaruvathur Adhiparasakti Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Tamil Nadu for the academic year 2013-14** : It was noted by the Board of Governors that the College was debarred from admitting the students for MBBS Courses for the academic years 2014-15 and 2015-16 on the grounds that many teaching faculties employed by the College were found to be with fake and forged documents. It was also noted that the Hon'ble High Court of Madras has set aside the above Order of the Council debarring the College. The Law Officer apprised the Board of Governors that SLP is being filed in the Hon'ble Supreme Court against the above mentioned Order of Hon'ble High Court of Madras. The Board of Governors directed the Law Officer to expedite filing of the SLP in the matter.

2.10 **Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada A.P. Recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification against increased intake from 06 to 12 seats in respect of students being trained at Narayana Medical College, Nellore – Trust – Andhra Pradesh** : The matter was considered by the Board of Governors. The PG Section in-charge was directed to place the matter before the BOGs after review of the



(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

Declaration Forms of the Faculty Members by the PG Committee and with their observation.

**2.11 The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai – Recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 06 seats in respect of students being training at Christian Medical College, Vellore – Trust – Tamil Nadu :** It was noted by the Board of Governors that this item was already decided in the previous meeting of the BOGs wherein the proposal was recommended.

**2.12 Review Application in the light of the orders passed through letter No.MCI-66(22)/2013-Med./114694 dated 18.6.2013 in view of the latest Supreme Court Judgment for increase of PG MD (General Medicine), MS(Obst.&Gynae.) & MD(Pathology) seats at Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore :** The Board of Governors was apprised of the large number of RTI queries regarding the legality of the constitution of PG Committee. Therefore, the Board of Governors directed the Council to examine the issue relating to the constitution of advisory PG Committee and the justification for its operation since the BOGs system came into existence, in the light of IMC Act, 1956. The Board of Directors also directed that the matter related to this case may be

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

placed before the Board in the light of Hon'ble Supreme Court's Judgment dated 30.7.2013 in WP(C) 244/2013.

**2.13 A.P. Singh University – recognition of MD (Anaesthesia) & D.A. Qualification at SS Medical College, Rewa :** The Board of Governors observed that the Council had written to the Central Government apprising the deficiencies in the faculty, infrastructure and clinical material, as per the letter dated 30.3.2007. Regarding the issue of Recognition of the Course, it was decided by the Board of Governors that the matter may be placed before the PG Committee to make their observation. The Board observed that the Central Government, despite the deficiencies having been informed has not conveyed its decision to the Council or the College authorities. As the deficiencies continue to exist despite writing to the College/Central Government, the MoH&FW may be apprised of the fact for appropriate action at their end.

**2.14 Marathwada University/Dr. Babsaheb Ambedkar Marathwada University – approval of SRTR Medical College, Ambajogai for the award of MD (Radio-diagnosis/Radiology) & DMRD Qualification :** This item was deferred.

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman



2.15 **Bangalore University - (1) Recognition of MD(TB&CD) in respect of students being trained at Bangalore Medical College & Research Institute, Bangalore; and (2) Permission to restart MD (TB&CD) (Pulmonary Medicine) course at Bangalore Medical College, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore** : This item was deferred.

2.16 **Mahatama Gandhi University, Kottayam – Recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 03 (three) to 05(five) seats in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Kottayam** : This item was deferred.

2.17 **Recognition cases of PG Courses (1 to 250) (Broad Specialty)** : The matter was considered and the decisions of the Board of Governors are as indicated in the Annexure-1.



(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

**2.18 Recognition of Medical Qualification granted by St. Martinus University, Curacao** : The Board of Governors considered the matter and directed the Council to place a list of all the Medical Colleges abroad for which the Council is presently not issuing Eligibility Certificate. Thereafter, the Board of Governors will take a holistic view in the matter.

**2.19 Issue of Eligibility Certificate u/s 13(4b) of IMC Act, 1956 in r/o Ms. Rashmi Srivastava – passed 12<sup>th</sup> Class from ISCE Board but Physics and Chemistry subject failed and also she has passed B.Sc. from University of Lucknow** : The Board of Governors considered the legal opinion regarding grant of Eligibility Certificate and noted that the Council had sent a regret letter on a similar case of Mr. Sudam Dash on 24.11.2010. As Ms. Rashmi Srivastava has not obtained the qualifying marks in 10+2 and in B.Sc. she has not obtained required percentage of marks for qualifying for admission to MBBS Course, she is not eligible for grant of Eligibility Certificate.

**2.20 Matter pertaining to issuing of Eligibility Certificate to the candidates who wish to study/studying MBBS Course at Yeravan State Medical University and Tbilisi State Medical University** : After discussion, the Board of Directors decided that in the first

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

instance, the Council should write to the Central Government seeking clarification with reference to instructions contained in MoH&FW's letter F.No. V.11025/38/2012-MEP.I dated 12.12.2012 - regarding discontinuation of issuing of eligibility certificate to the candidates who wish to study MBBS course at St. Martinus University and Avalon University School of Medicine, Curacao - as to what should be done in the case of candidates who wish to study/studying MBBS Course at the other two Universities, viz., Yeravan State Medical University and Tbilisi State Medical University, Curacao.

The Board also desired to have a list of countries for which Eligibility Certificates are being issued and details of offshore campus of such institutions, if any, so that a uniform policy could be formulated in case of foreign institutions providing primary medical education to Indian citizens/OCI.

**2.21 Govt. of Kerala's move to reduce the Minimum Qualification mark for Postgraduate Super Specialty Course Admission – 2013 to less than 50% against MCI norms:** After discussion, the Board of Governors directed the Law Officer to obtain legal opinion in the matter and convey the same to the State Govt. of Kerala.

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

2.22 **Supplementary Agenda – Matter relating to the suspension of Shri A.K. Ahluwalia, Accounts Officer** : The Additional Secretary briefed the Board of Governors about the subject matter. After discussion, the Board of Governors decided to obtain legal opinion of the Law Officer.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.



(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman

2. In the light of urgency expressed by the Additional Secretary, the Board of Governors took up for consideration of Item No. 14 of the Agenda, viz., "Dr. P.S. Jain, former Secretary, Medical Council of India's computation of pensionary benefits". The Board of Governors noted that the proposal involved a payment of arrears amounting to Rs. 21,56,586/- (Rupees Twenty one lakh, fifty six thousand five hundred eighty six only) to Dr. P.S. Jain, on account of computation of arrear of his pay plus pensionary benefits towards the service rendered by him before his retirement from MCI. The Board of Governors also noted that this payment is in full and final implementation of the Orders dated 29.11.2010 and 22.5.2013 passed by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Principal Bench, New Delhi in CP 687/2012 in TA No.1128/2009. The Board of Governors directed the Council office to ensure release of the above payment to Dr. P.S. Jain on 4<sup>th</sup> September, 2013 and inform the Hon'ble Tribunal on the next date of hearing of the CP fixed on 5.9.2013.



(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Additional Secretary

(Dr. Manoj K. Singh)  
Member, BOG

(Raja Babu Panwar)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. K. S. Sharma)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. Brijendra Kumar Rao)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. K. Mohandas)  
Member, BOG.

(Dr. A.K. Bardhan)  
Member, BOG

(Dr. R.K. Srivastava)  
Chairman