

**No.MCI-5(3)/2002-Med./**

**MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA**

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on Thursday, the 13<sup>th</sup> March, 2003 at 11.00 am in the Council office, Aiwan-E-Galib Marg, Kotla Road, New Delhi-110 002 which was also attended by the members of the Adhoc Committee as appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court vide its order dated 20.11.2002.

**Present:-**

Dr. P.C. Kesvankutty Nayar	-	President (Acting )
Prof. N. Rangabashyam	]	Members
Prof. P.N. Tandon	]	Adhoc Committee
Dr. (Mrs.) S. Kantha	]	
Dr. D.K. Sharma		
Dr. Nitin S. Vora		
Dr. F.U. Ahmed		
Dr. P.M. Jadhav		
Dr. Ajay Kumar		
Dr. V.K. Puri		
Dr. B.P. Dubey		
Dr. M.K. Sharma		
Dr. Ved Prakash Mishra	-	Chairman, PG Committee Special Invitee

**DR. K.K. ARORA - JOINT SECRETARY**

Apology for absence was received from Dr. K.S. Chugh.

After welcoming the members of the Executive Committee, the President (Acting) – Chairman of the Executive Committee informed the members that due to sudden demise of father of the Secretary, Dr.(Mrs.) M. Sachdeva, she will not be attending the meeting. The Committee observed two minutes silence in the memory of departed soul.

Dr.P.M.Jadhav, a member of the Executive Committee drew the attention of the Committee towards his communication to the Actg. President enclosing the text of the news report published in English Daily Indian Express in the Chennai City Edition, dated 28<sup>th</sup> February, 2003 wherein Dr. Rangabashyam, a member of the Adhoc Committee has been quoted, and as said quotation is prejudicial to the interest and fair name of the Medical Council of India, he sought a discussion on the same. The members expressed grave concern on the issue in response to which Dr.Rangabashyam said that he had not made any such statement to the Indian Express and the same has been published incorrectly. He contradicts the same in totality.

He further informed he has already written to the Press in this regard and also had sent a letter to the President (Acting) on the subject dated 4<sup>th</sup> March, 2003 in response to the communication from the President (Actg.) in this regard dt. 3<sup>rd</sup> March, 2002. He further informed that he has approached the Editor of the Newspaper and that he is in the process of sending a letter through his legal counsel as well. His clarification sent to the said newspaper has been published in the said Daily on 11.3.2003. He also expressed his apologies for the avoidable misunderstanding created by a totally false statement having appeared in the newspaper.

Dr.S. Kantha, another member of the Adhoc Committee observed that in view of the contradiction brought out by Dr. Rangabashyam in the meeting, a letter therefore should be sent to the Press Council for an appropriate action in the matter in terms of false publication.

Dr.Ajay Kumar, another member of the Executive Committee suggested that the Executive Committee should petition with the Press Council of India on behalf of Medical Council of India. Dr.Ved Prakash Mishra, proposed that the Medical Council of India should clarify to the concerned newspaper for publication in respect of the observation of Dr. Rangabashyam in the meeting that every word published in his name was totally false and also approach the Press Council of India for remedial action.

The Executive Committee accordingly resolved that a clarification for publication be sent to the English Daily Indian Express and authorized the President (Acting) to seek legal advise in respect of remedial action.

1. **Minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 9.1.2003 – Confirmation of.**

The minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee held on 9.1.2003 were confirmed.

2. **Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.**

The Executive Committee noted the action taken by the office on the various item included in the agenda of the Executive Committee meeting held on 9/1/2003 with the following observations/modifications:-

On page no.2 para 1 – reading as “The members of the Adhoc-Committee ..... in need of Medical colleges.” Prof. P.N. Tandon member of the Adhoc-Committee referred to the report of the Working Group on Development of Human Resources for Health appointed by the Planning Commission in the context of the formulation of tenth five year plan (1997-2002) – regarding opening of new medical college and increase of admission capacity in the existing institutions.

Since the members of the Executive Committee wanted to read the report of the Working Group a copy of the same was handed over to them and it was decided that the same will be discussed in the next meeting.

On Page No.2 under the action taken report of Executive Committee meeting held on 17/10/2002 it was decided that in compliance of the decision taken by the Committee a letter be sent to the Administrator requesting him to submit the report of his visits.”

In the Action Taken Report of the meeting held on 9/1/2003 placed before this meeting it was reported that a letter was sent to Administrator on 11/2/2003. No reply has been received.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided that a strong/concluding reminder be sent to the Administrator for sending the report of his visits immediately.

Page 2 last para reading as The Inquiry Committee ..... next meeting. It was reported that “Report not received” Dr. D.K. Sharma informed that just now he is submitting the report.

Item No.3- **Khaja Banda Nawaz Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga – Renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students**

Item No.4- **Baseveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga – Renewal of permssion for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of students.**

In the above two medical colleges the students are admitted in pursuance of the interim order passed by the Hon’ble High Court of Karnataka. The Hon’ble High Court in its order had also directed that in the event of the petitioner failing to obtain the necessary permission from the Central Government u/s 10A of this order will not aid any equities in petitioners institutions and those students who were admitted in pursuance to the interim order passed by the court. Since action taken by the Central Government on the decision of the Executive Committee which was communicated to them on 14.1.2003 has not been received, the Committee decided to write a D.O. letter to the Secretary to Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. to intimate the same.

Item No.6 – **“MNR Medical College at Sangareddy Distt., Medak – renewal of permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of students during the academic session 2002-03.”**- Action taken was updated as under:-

It was informed that on receipt of the recommendations of the members of the Executive Committee/Adhoc Committee the recommendations of the Council recommending to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of students during 2002-03 was communicated to the Central Government on 4.3.2003 and item is included in the agenda of this meeting for information.

Item No.34-**Standardisation of Digital Information to facilitate implementation of Tele Medicine systems using IT – Enabled services.**

In the action taken report under this item it was informed that the Expert Committee has been constituted consisting of the following:

1. Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad, MCI
2. Dr. B.V. Adkoli, AIIMS

The Committee also decided following two names to be included in the Expert Committee:

1. Dr. Mahender Bhandari, Director, SGPGI as Convenor
2. Dr. Ganpati, Neuro-Surgeon, Apollo Speciality Hospital, Chennai as member.

Item No.40-**To consider the matter where the students of Govt. Medical College, Amritsar were permitted to appear in the Ist Prof. MBBS examination only after completion of 5 months of study; comments of Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot.**

“The Committee noted that Baba Farid Univ. of Health Sciences, Faridkot.....u/s. 19 of the IMC Act,1956”.

In the action taken report under this item it was reported that “letter conveying the decision of the Executive Committee was sent to the Vice Chancellor, Baba Farid Univ. of Health Sciences, Faridkot, Secretary (Health), Govt. of Punjab on 31.1.2003”. Since no reply was received the Committee decided to send strong reminder to expedite the reply to the Council within four weeks from the date of issue of the letter.

Item No.67-**Functioning of the Sub-Committee of the Council – Reg.**

In the minutes recorded under this item “the Executive Committee appointed Dr. L.S. Chawla in place of Dr. B.Ray Chaudhuri, who has been expired, for the following Sub-Committees”.

In the second line the word “been” be deleted and be read corrected as “the Executive Committee appointed Dr. L.S. Chawla in place of Dr. B.Ray Chaudhuri, who has expired, for the following Sub-Committees”.

3. **Establishment of new medical college at Thrissur by Jubilee Mission Hospital Trust, Thrissur.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) for establishment of new medical college at Thrissur by Jubilee Mission Hospital Trust, Thrissur u/s. 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) and decided to recommend to Central Government to issue Letter of Intent for establishment of new medical college at Thrissur by Jubilee Mission Hospital Trust, Thrissur u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 with an annual intake of 100 (one hundred) students for the academic session 2003-04.

4. **Establishment of new medical college at Rajahmundry, A.P. by GSL Educational Society, Rajahmundry.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) for establishment of new medical college at Rajahmundry, A.P. by GSL Educational Society, Rajahmundry u/s. 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) and decided to recommend to Central Government to issue Letter of Intent for establishment of new medical college at Rajahmundry, A.P. by GSL Educational Society, Rajahmundry u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 with an annual intake of 150 (one hundred & fifty) students for the academic session 2003-04.

The Committee also decided to draw the attention regarding the observations on the number of OPD attendance and bed occupancy as against the number of investigations, operations, deliveries and other laboratory work as brought out by the inspectors in their report.

5. **K.S. Hegde Medical Academy at Mangalore by NIITE Educational Trust, Mangalore-renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students at K.S. Hegde Medical Academy at Mangalore by NIITE Educational Trust, Mangalore

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> January, 03) and decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of 100 (hundred) students at K.S. Hegde Medical Academy at Mangalore by NIITE Educational Trust, Mangalore for the academic session 2003-04.

6. **Kamineni Instt. of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda – renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students.**

Read: Council Inspectors report (17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students at Kamineni Instt. of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> February, 03) and decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of 100 (hundred) students at Kamineni Instt. of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda for the academic session 2003-04.

7. **KAP Viswanathan Govt. Medical College, Trichy – Approval of the college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai.**

Read: Council Inspectors report (21<sup>st</sup>, 22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> Jan.2003) for approval of the college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (21<sup>st</sup>, 22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> Jan.2003) and noted the following:

- (i) University affiliation for the academic year 2003-04 is not available. Only provisional affiliation was granted by the University upto 2002-03 vide its letter # Affln.(1)/16/96 dated 28<sup>th</sup> Jan. 2003.
- (ii) Water supply is inadequate in certain blocks of the hospital like the Obstetrics & Gynaecology OPD block, etc. There are open drains in the hospital complex at some places.
- (iii) In the central library 7,290 books are available which includes Text & Reference books out of which 3,000 books categorized as reference books and are 50-80 years old which need to be replaced. No journals have been subscribed in 2002.
- (iv) One more hostel for boys and one hostel for male interns residents are required to be constructed. There is overcrowding in the rooms particularly where three persons have been accommodated in small rooms. Only a cot is provided to each inmate. All the inmates of a room share one table & chair. No other furniture is provided. The hostels require total reorganization and proper furniture needs to be provided.
- (v) Intercom with 18 lines has been provided in the college and with 54 lines has been provided in the hospital which is much less than required. All the departments, wards, laboratories, O.T.s and other ancillary facilities need to be provided with intercom lines.
- (vi) The college has only 8 quarters for teaching staff in the campus. Besides, 42 teaching staff members are provided with quarters from the general pool of the housing board. No nursing staff has been provided with residential accommodation in the hospital campus. Very few non-teaching staff have been provided with quarters in the housing board colony which is 5 km. away from the hospital.
- (vii) The generator capacity for the hospital needs to be expanded.
- (viii) OPD registration should be computerized.
- (ix) The workload in Histopathology, Cytopathology and Microbiology needs to be augmented.
- (x) In O.P.D the waiting space is less and it needs reorganization. Teaching space is inadequate in many cubicles which needs to be reorganized. The departmental registers maintained in different OPDs are varying in pattern and each doctor maintains a separate register for himself. Common registers of a uniform pattern should be provided in all the OPDs. In some OPDs, cubicles require to be reorganized to provide adequate teaching area. X-ray viewbox should be provided where it has not been provided so far. The duty rooms and side laboratories have not been provided in each ward. O.P.D. registration should be computerized.
- (xi) All the cots in ICUs are not Fowler's cots. Some of the cots in ICUs are plain patient cots which need to be replaced with Fowler's cots. Nurses in ICCU / ICU are less. They should be provided in the ratio of 1:1 as recommended by the Nursing Council.
- (xii) The incinerator has been provided but it is not functional. At present arrangements have been made with municipality for disposal of waste.
- (xiii) The nursing staff is inadequate. The nursing staff in ICU / ICCU / O.T. is not as per the recommendations of the Nursing Council.
- (xiv) Mortuary Block has not yet been constructed.

- (xv) Books in the departmental libraries of TB & Chest, Skin & VD and Psychiatry, Orthopaedics, E.N.T. and Ophthalmology departments require to be augmented.
- (xvi) The arrangements in clinical pharmacology laboratory need to be reorganized.
- (xvii) The museum needs to be shifted and reorganized in the department of Microbiology & Forensic Medicine. In the department of Community Medicine, museum also needs to be reorganized with more number of charts and models and charts and posters should be upgraded periodically.
- (xviii) In the deptt. of Comm. Medicine, research laboratory should be equipped for water analysis, food analysis and other tastes of public health.
- (xix) Duty rooms and side laboratories are not provided in the wards.
- (xx) The total number of x-ray machines should be as per the MCI norms in the deptt. of Radio-Diagnosis.
- (xxi) Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided not to recommend approval of KAP Vishwanathan Govt. Medical College, Trichy for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr.MGR Medical University, Chennai.

The Committee further decided to write a letter to the Registrar, The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai as to how the university vide its letter dated 6/1/2003 had forwarded its request through the Central Govt. as required u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for carrying out the inspection of KAP Vishwanathan Govt. Medical College, Trichy for approval of the college without granting the affiliation for the academic session 2003-2004.

8. **Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar – Approval of the college for the award of MBBS degree for the increased number of seats i.e. 125 to 150.**

Read: Council Inspectors report (29<sup>th</sup>, 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2003) for approval of the college for the award of MBBS degree for the increase number of seats i.e. 125 to 150.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (29<sup>th</sup>, 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2003) and decided to recommend that Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar be approved for the award of MBBS degree granted by Annamalai University for the increased number of seats i.e. 125 to 150.

9. **Ruxmanbein Deepchand Medical College, Ujjain – renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students at Ruxmanbein Deepchand Medical College, Ujjain.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> February, 2003) and noted the following:-

The Executive Committee noted that the Committee at its meeting held on 31/1/2002 in view of the various deficiencies pointed out in the Council Inspectors report (Dec., 2001) did not

recommend to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of students at Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain for the academic year 2001-02. However, the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2002 renewed the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 100 students at the college during the academic session 2001-2002 subject to the condition that 85% students are admitted at the college through the State Govt, and college authorities was also asked to rectify the deficiencies pointed out in the MCI inspection report and send a compliance report to the Ministry within 6 months.

The Committee further noted that on receipt of request of college through the Central Govt. inspection for renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students during 2002-03 was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 4<sup>th</sup> & 5<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2002.

On going through the inspection report the Committee noted that 100 students were admitted at the college against the permission granted by the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2002 for the academic session 2001-2002 in the following manner:-

29 <sup>th</sup> & 30 <sup>th</sup> May, 2002	-	53
27 <sup>th</sup> June, 2002	-	06
12 <sup>th</sup> July, 2002	-	07
24 <sup>th</sup> August, 2002	-	11
20 <sup>th</sup> September, 2002	-	02
28 <sup>th</sup> October, 2002	-	06
Management	-	15

From the above, the Committee noted that the admissions were started from May, 2002 and completed in October, 2002. It decided to seek clarification from the college authorities the manner in which the admissions were made and also cut off date for starting/closing the admissions by the university for the academic session 2001-2002 be also obtained immediately from the University and on all those admissions made after the cut off date for the academic year 2001-02, section 10B of the IMC Act, 1956 be applied.

The Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students at Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain for the academic session 2002-2003 in view of the following deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report:

- (i) As per the time bound programme submitted by the college authorities in February 2001, a new hospital building was to be constructed in the college campus itself in phased manner with 100 beds to be made functional by 31<sup>st</sup> December 2002, 250 beds by 31<sup>st</sup> December 2003 and 150 beds by 31<sup>st</sup> December 2004. Some wards for the hospital have been constructed but neither any bed has been made functional nor any diagnostic services have been provided in the new hospital. No other facility has been made functional in the new hospital building in the college campus. Only a general OPD has been established in the new building in the college campus.



In the old hospital, though the teaching beds are adequate in number and distribution in different specialties is as per Council requirement but some departments are housed in several small rooms which make them unsuitable for teaching. E.g., Main ward of Paediatrics is having 38 beds and the remaining 12 beds are spread in 3 rooms. 34 beds of Obstetrics and 22 beds of Gynaecology are spread in 7 rooms on two floors. 16 beds of Ophthalmology are spread in 6 rooms and 50 beds of Orthopaedics are spread in 9 rooms. These beds should be reorganized and properly arranged. Male & female patients of E.N.T. are kept in the same room which should be segregated. In some wards, the space between two beds is less and the wards are over-crowded which needs to be removed. Common nursing station provided for multiple departments / wards should be replaced with proper discrete arrangements.

- (ii) In the Central Library 22 foreign and 48 Indian journals are available out of which 8 foreign and 27 Indian journals are subscribed by the college. The college needs to subscribe to full quota as required from time to time.
- (iii) Health Centers: (a) R.H.T.C.: There is no residential facility for staff, students and interns. No beds or labour room have been provided. No teaching activity is carried out as yet. Non-teaching staff is deficient by 1 medical social worker, 2 health inspectors, 1 health educator, 1 clerk & 1 driver. {b} U.H.C.: No teaching activity is carried out as yet. Non-teaching staff is deficient by 1 medical social worker, 2 health inspectors, 2 technicians, 1 clerk & 1 driver.
- (iv) Intercom with 40 lines has been provided in the hospital, which is much less than required. The intercom in the college campus is not yet provided. All the departments, wards, laboratories, O.T.s and other ancillary facilities need to be provided with intercom lines.
- (v) The generator capacity for the hospital needs to be expanded.
- (vi) OPD registration should be computerized.
- (vii) In O.P.D – Psychiatry has only 1 cubicle and more teaching area should be provided. Separate dressing, plaster and plaster cutting rooms should be provided. Audiometry room should be totally soundproof & air-conditioned.
- (viii) There is no central Oxygen supply and no ventilator which needs to be provided.
- (ix) Clinical material in the hospital was grossly inadequate, particularly in OPD attendance, number of deliveries, laboratory investigations and radiological investigations. The bed occupancy is approximately 75 % but many of the patients were having such minor ailments, which did not require admission. All the clinical services need to be augmented.
- (x) There is no separate ICCU. A combined ICU functions for Medicine & Surgery. Nurses in ICU are less. They should be provided in the ratio of 1:1 as recommended by the Nursing Council.
- (xi) CSSD; Facilities need to be augmented.
- (xii) There is no incinerator in the hospital.
- (xiii) The nursing staff is inadequate and not as per the recommendations of the Nursing Council.
- (xiv) Only 16 residents' quarters have been provided against the requirement of 100.
- (xv) Books in the departmental libraries of Tb & Chest, Skin & VD and Psychiatry, Surgery, Orthopaedics, E.N.T., Ophthalmology, Radiology and Anaesthesia departments need to be augmented.

- (xvi) Non teaching staff is inadequate in the departments of Anatomy and Community Medicine {R.H.T.C. & U.H.C.} which need to be augmented as per Council norms.
- (xvii) Shortage of Staff:-

The shortage of teaching faculty is more than 5% (5.95 %) as shown below:

Professor: 2 {Forensic Medicine: 1, Radiodiagnosis: 1}

Associate Professor: 1 {Physiology: 1}

Assistant Professor: 2 {Anatomy: 1, Community Medicine  
{Lecturer cum M.O. at R.H.T.C.} : 1.

- (xvi) Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

10. **Establishment of medical college at Dichpalli by Church of South India Trust, Association Medak Diocesan Education Society u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956.**

Read: the compliance verification report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> Feb.2003) for establishment of medical college at Dichpalli by Church of South India Trust, Association Medak Diocesan Education Society u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee considered the compliance verification inspection report (21<sup>st</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> Feb.2003) and decided to recommend to Central Government to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of medical college at Dichpalli by Church of South India Trust, Association Medak Diocesan Education Society u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 with an annual intake of 100 (one hundred) students for the academic session 2003-04.

11. **To consider the matter with regard to approval of Maharashtra Instt. of Medical Education & Research, Talegaon for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pune University-Pending for legal opinion.**

The Executive Committee considered the matter with regard to approval of Maharashtra Instt. of Medical Education & Research, Talegaon for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pune University alongwith the legal opinion obtained from Ld. Solicitor General of India which reads as under:-

*“That all the queries can be resolved by the simple mechanism of calling upon the Trust to get the lease deed registered for a period of at least 99 years, for land and building registered in favour of the Trust. If this is not done then the legal consequences of unregistered lease deed is a matter which the Querist may have to follow. Rather than going into this area, it will be far more advisable for the Querist to send a communication to the Trust in question. They should get the lease deed in favour of the Trust registered failing which they will not fulfil the requirements of the regulations of owning and possessing 25 acres of land and owning and managing a hospital not less than 300 beds with necessary Infrastructural facilities and capable of being developed into a teaching institution as prescribed by the Medical Council of India, in the vicinity of proposed medical college.*

*If the Trust does not respond to this, then the Querist can consider any further appropriate future course of action”.*

The Committee adopted the legal opinion of Ld. Solicitor General of India and decided to communicate it to the college authorities accordingly.

12. **List of Inspectors and suggestions for inspectors.**

Read: the list of inspectors and suggestions of Adhoc Committee with regard to appointment of inspectors.

The Executive Committee considered the following suggestions; of the members of the Adhoc Committee as appointed by the Hon’ble Supreme Court vide its order dated 20.11.2002; for appointment of Inspectors for carrying out various inspections on behalf of the Council:-

1. Should be a senior faculty member of well established medical colleges/institutes : Professors of at least 7 years standing.
2. Preferably a Fellow of the National Academy of Medical Sciences
3. One member of the inspection committee should preferably belong to discipline of Hospital Administration or with experience as Medical Superintendent. At least during a second/third renewal a hospital administration should be a part of the team.
4. In case of repeat inspection to verify the removal of deficiencies pointed out by the first committee it is desirable to send the same team as at the time of first inspection.
5. Inspection report should include a clause that the authorities must communicate to Medical Council of India if any faculty member leaves within one year of inspection.
6. Inspection report should include – (a) Research Publications record of the faculty, (b) Research Laboratories, if any.
7. Consider the possibility of changing the yearly schedule to once in two years.
8. It is advisable to create zonal inspectors, but they cannot be a member of team of inspectors of their zone.
9. Names of Inspectors should not be communicated to the institution in too much advance (only a few days prior to the date of inspection).
10. Provision for surprise inspection whenever in doubt.
11. Member of the Council/Executive Committee should not be a member of the Inspection Committee.

The Committee approved the suggestions with modification as under:-

Point No.2 - Preferably a Fellow of National Academy of Medical Sciences be modified as “Fellow of National Academy of Medical Sciences may also be considered”.

Point No.3 - One member of the inspection committee should preferably belong to discipline of Hospital Administration or with experience as Medical Superintendent. At least during a second/third renewal a hospital administration should be a part of the team. The word “Medical Superintendent” be replaced with “Dean/Principal”.

Point No.5 - Inspection report should include a clause that the authorities must communicate to Medical Council of India if any faculty member leaves within one year of inspection. The last line “leaves within one year of inspection” be modified as “leaves/joins within one year of inspection alongwith date”.

Point No.7 – Consider the possibility of changing the yearly schedule to once in two years be deleted.

Point No. 8 - It is advisable to create zonal inspectors, but they cannot be a member of team of inspectors of their zone be replaced as The zonal inspectors appointed by the Council shall not be a member of team of inspectors of their own State.

Point No.11 – Member of the Council/Executive Committee should not be a member of the inspection committee be modified as “Executive Committee and Postgraduate Committee members should not be a member of the inspection committee”.

13. **To note the letter dated 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2003 from Dr. Shrish K. Bhansali, addressed to the Asstt. Registrar, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi and copy endorsed to the Secretary, MCI amongst others.**

The Executive Committee noted the letter dt. 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2003 from Dr. Shrish K. Bhansali addressed to Asstt. Registrar, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi submitting his resignation as a member of the Adhoc Committee. After detailed deliberations considering the stature, eminence and expertise it was unanimously decided that Dr. Bhansali may be requested to reconsider his decision of resignation in the larger interest of the medical education.

14. **To consider the request of Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pimpri to postpone the inspection for increase of seats from 100 to 150 by 5 months application of which was received as per provision of section 10A of the IMC Act,1956 during the year 2002.**

The Council has received the communication from the college authorities that they are ready for carrying out the inspection for the purpose of increase of seats from 100 to 150. The Committee decided to carry out the inspection.

15. **Establishment of new medical college – utilization of clinical material of Govt. Hospitals-Administrative control of such hospitals under the control of concerned medical college-reg.**

Read: the matter with regard to utilization of clinical material of Govt. Hospitals-Administrative control of such hospitals under the control of concerned medical college for establishment of new medical college.

The Executive Committee considered the letter dt.11.4. 2002 of the Principal Secretary, Govt. of A.P. HM&FW received through the Central Government with regard to utilization of clinical material of Govt. hospitals and the administrative control of such hospitals under the

control of concerned medical college and decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken by the General Body of the Council at its meeting held on 5.11.1999 wherein it was decided as under:-

“The applicant must own & manage a 300 bedded hospital. For having adequate clinical material for teaching purposes (which may not be available initially in a new hospital) the authorities of the medical college may be permitted to utilise other Govt/District hospitals where the beds of those hospitals should be under the total administrative and academic control of the authorities of the concerned medical college, provided the facilities of the hospital so utilized is within a radius of 5 kms. from the medical college. The facilities of clinical material thus utilized shall be over & above the facilities available in their own hospital.

The Council further decided that the Central Government be informed that this provision shall be permitted for a period of 3 years i.e. from the date of issue of LOP for starting a new medical college and not beyond in any circumstances.”

16. **MBBS (Devi Ahilya Vishwavidyalaya)Continuance of recognition in respect of students being trained at MGM Medical College, Indore.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition in respect of students being trained at MGM Medical College, Indore.

The Executive Committee noted that the Council at its meeting held on 27.8.2002 upon considering the matter of continuance of recognition in respect of students being trained at MGM Medical College, Indore alongwith the recommendations of the Executive Committee decided to reduce the number of seats from 140 to 100 in Ist MBBS course in consonance with the teaching facilities available at the college from the academic session 2003-04 and the decision of the Council was communicated to the concerned authorities of the college vide MCI letter dt. 27.9.2002.

The Committee further considered the list of staff working at the college received from the Dean, MGM Medical College, Indore vide his letter dt. 8.1.2003 and noted that the staff shortage has increased as compared to the last inspection report carried out in September, 2001. The Committee decided to reiterate its earlier decision to reduce the number of seats from 140 to 100 in Ist MBBS course at MGM Medical College, Indore from the academic session 2003-04.

17. **To note the letter dated 10.2.2003 received from the Trustee & Director, Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College for Women, Pimpri, Pune, with regard to grant of status of deemed university by Govt. of India, Ministry of Human Resoruce Development.**

The Executive Committee noted the letter dated 10.2.2003 received from the Trustee & Director, Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College for Women, Pimpri, Pune, with regard to grant of status of deemed university by Govt. of India, Ministry of Human Resoruce Development.

18. **To consider the report of the Sub-Committee with regard to admission of visually handicapped person and method of training, assessment evaluation of such candidates at various stages of their curriculum.**

Read: the report of the Sub-Committee meeting held on 24.1.2003 with regard to admission of visually handicapped person and method of training, assessment evaluation of such candidates at various stages of their curriculum.

The Executive Committee approved the following recommendations of the Sub-Committee meeting held on 24.1.2003 with regard to admission of visually handicapped person and method of training, assessment evaluation of such candidates at various stages of their curriculum:-

“The Committee considered the above issues under the broad headings of –

1. Admission of visually handicapped persons for MBBS.
2. The time of onset of blindness and continuation of their curriculum from thereon.
3. Methods of training, assessment and evaluation of such handicapped persons at various stages of their curriculum.
4. Method of giving them the training during the internship prior to the award of MBBS degree.
5. Analysing the avenues of employment for visually handicapped candidates after awarding them the degree.
6. Any restrictions for visually handicapped doctors in clinical practice.

The Committee is of the view that the sympathetic consideration to a handicapped person should not be at the expense of causing risk to the society or its members. In the event of allegations arising from the mis-diagnosis, wrong medicines prescriptions and the eventual casualties, many litigations are filed under the Consumer Forum in various States. In these circumstances, allowing the visually handicapped persons to practice medicine and prescribe drug will cause enormous harm to the public and will bring the entire profession into disrepute. They will also raise questions about the validity of the norms adopted for registration of such candidates by the competent authorities. Though National Human Rights Commission has quoted instances wherein blind persons are being appointed as Lecturers and performing their duties satisfactorily; these are only exceptional cases and cannot be made basis for framing new rules to enable blind persons to be medical professionals.

1. **Admission of visually handicapped persons for MBBS:**

It is mandatory that the students who are selected to join MBBS course should undergo an eye examination by a qualified Ophthalmologist and must be certified to have best corrected visual activity of 6/9 in each eye. In case of one-eyed persons, the best corrected visual activity should be 6/6. The candidate should be able to identify the three primary colours.

2. **The time of onset of blindness and continuation of their curriculum from thereon:**

Retention of normal vision is an absolute need for undergoing the training in medical curriculum unlike in other streams of education like Arts, and Science. Medicine is a course

where perfect vision is the absolute need. The Committee recommends that a candidate who becomes visually challenged after having been admitted to the course and completed to a reasonable extent his clinical training may still be considered fit for assessment and final examination. However, if the candidate develops visual challenge before acquiring reasonable amount of knowledge and skill in clinical and basic sciences he/she should be discharged from the course.

3. Methods of training, assessment and evaluation of such handicapped people at various stages of their curriculum:

The Committee recommends that suitable method of evaluation and assessment can be framed by a Local Committee consisting of an Ophthalmologist, Physician, Surgeon and Obstetrician. The broad guidelines framed by AIIMS in case of Shri C.S.P. Anka Toppo may be taken into consideration while framing such guidelines. It is expected that these guidelines would depend upon the severity of visual handicap.

4. Method of imparting training during the internship prior to the award of MBBS degree:

During the period of internship the student requires to learn skills and knowledge in the actual management of patients in various disciplines of Medicine and Surgery, and as such presence of normal vision is essential for internship training. In case of visually handicapped, the training programme would need to be modified depending upon the severity of handicap. The component of patient care may be reduced in order to minimize the potential of harm arising from the handicap. At the same time, the candidate would be encouraged by faculty and the resident staff to achieve maximum knowledge and skills within the constraints of his vision.

5. Analysing the avenues of employment for such of those candidates after awarding them the degree:

Such of the visually challenged individuals who have successfully completed their studies and internship would become eligible for employment in those areas which do not include patient care either directly or indirectly. The Committee feels from the instances quoted by National Human Rights Commission they may be accommodated in areas such as teaching, research and counseling.

6. Recommendations to Medical Council of India:

When the Medical Council of India or respective State Medical Councils issue the medical registration certificate to such of these candidates who are visually handicapped should clearly mention in the registration certificate itself that they are debarred from doing clinical practice either directly or indirectly. Suitable amendment to the existing constitution should be made for inscribing such words.

To conclude it is wise to remember the judgement passed by Ohio Supreme Court in the denial of admission to a blind student in a medical school in Ohio, USA which reads as under:-

“An otherwise qualified handicapped person is one who is able to safely and substantially perform an educational program’s essential requirements with reasonable accommodation. An accommodation is not reasonable where it requires fundamental alterations in the essential nature of the program or imposes an undue financial or administrative burden”, the majority decision states.

“Furthermore, an educational institution is not required to accommodate a handicapped person by eliminating a course requirement which is reasonably necessary to the proper use of the degree conferred at the end of study,” the ruling noted.”

It is also a well-settled proposition of law that the rights of the society as a whole cannot be subservient to the rights of an individual or even a section of society.”

19. **Use of alternative in study of the effect of drugs.**

Read: the report of the Sub-Committee meeting held on 3.2.2003 with regard to use of alternative in study of the effect of drugs.

The Executive Committee approved the following recommendations of the Sub-Committee meeting held on 3.2.2003 with regard to use of alternative in study of the effect of drugs:-

“The present Committee was constituted by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> January, 2003, (vide item No.55), to deliberate and make recommendations in regard to a letter dated 26<sup>th</sup> Sept., 2002 sent from the Ministry of Environment and Forests, Govt. of India to the Secretary, Medical Council of India.

It has been brought out in the said letter that “various animals viz. rabbits, rats, frogs and dogs are being used repeatedly in the study of the effect of drugs on the eye, heart and other physiological responses have been observed in all medical, pharmacology and veterinary colleges. Most of these colleges do not have well maintained animal house. In most of the colleges, animals are found to be sick. These animals are being kept in dark and damp rooms. Generally these animals are being found to be neglected in terms of feed and veterinary care.

As an alternative to these tests involving animals, JIPMER, Pondicherry has developed EX-PHARM Blank CD. This CD has been specially prepared as a 100% replacement to animals used in undergraduate courses in Medicine, Pharmacology, and Veterinary Science. The programmes available on this CD are :-

1. Effects of drugs on isolated heart of frog
2. Effects of drugs on Blood Pressure, HR and Respiratory Rate of frog
3. Effects of drugs on locomotor activity of rat
4. Effects of drugs on rabbit’s eyes
5. Effects of drugs on ciliary motility of frog’s esophagus
6. Ileum – Dose response curve and matching assay
7. Mouse – Evaluation of analgesics – Hot plate method



The Committee would like to observe that the creation and maintenance of animal house is a part of minimum requirement included under the Governing Regulations in the Council which are binding in character so also the curriculum that has been devised with reference to practicals includes animal experiments, specially in the subjects of Physiology, Microbiology and Pharmacology.

As of now it is observed generally that for various reasons, the said animal experiments operationally have been reduced to “demonstrative” in character. In view of the same, the Committee is of the considered opinion that the proposal included in the aforesaid letter deserves to be accepted, for it will be a radical purposive exercise fulfilling the academic requirements in lieu of animal experiments.

However, this will mean that the institutions will have to fulfil the requirements of computerised network including personal computers for the individual usage by the students. This will mandate bringing out appropriate and matching alterations in the Governing Regulations of the Council in respect of minimum requirements and also necessary substitution in the prescribed curriculum whereby animal experiments are in vogue, as of now.

The Committee further proposes that during the pendency of these alterations being effected, alternative experimental exercises in place of the animal experiments in concerned subjects should be worked out for the information of all concerned, giving liberty to the concerned university to add to the said list if they deem necessary. However, no curtailment of the list so devised and circulated by the Council should be permissible.”

20. **Negotiations on trade in services – Health Sciences-WTO**

The Executive Committee considered the matter with regard to negotiations on trade in services and authorized the President to constitute a Sub-Committee of the members of the Council to go into details on the various subjects and submit their report.

21. **Holding of a single entrance test for undergraduate and postgraduate admission in the country – Letter regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to holding of a single entrance test for undergraduate and postgraduate admission in the country.

The Executive Committee considered the matter with regard to holding of a single entrance test for undergraduate and postgraduate admission in the country and decided to refer the matter to the General Body being a larger issue.

22. **Areas where more attention has to be given in future.**

Read: the matter with regard to areas where more attention has to be given in future by the MCI.

The Executive Committee considered the matter and authorized the President to constitute a Sub-Committee of the members of the Council on various issue. The Sub-Committee's report be brought back for consideration of Executive Committee.

23. **Request for relaxation as per Home Ministry order for SC/ST of Medical Registration for Indian nationals with foreign medical qualifications.**

Read: the matter with regard to request for relaxation as per Home Ministry order for SC/ST of Medical Registration for Indian nationals with foreign medical qualifications.

The Executive Committee considered the letter received from Shri R. Lakshmi, Research Officer, National Commission for SC & ST seeking comments of the Council for relaxation/concession of qualifying marks i.e. 50% to SC/ST students in the screening test for registration who has completed the medical graduation abroad and decided not to agree for any relaxation.

24. **Ex-post facto approval of 2 months in respect of Mr. Tapan R. Mehta for undergoing internship training abroad-reg.**

Read: the matter with regard to grant of Ex-post facto approval of 2 months in respect of Mr. Tapan R. Mehta for undergoing internship training abroad.

The Executive Committee decided not to agree for grant of ex-post facto approval of 2 months period for internship training undergone abroad by Mr. Tapan R. Mehta

25. **Empanelment as Standing Counsel for Medical Council of India in the High Court of Punjab & Haryana at Chandigarh.**

Read: the matter with regard to empanelment as Standing Counsel for Medical Council of India in the High Court of Punjab & Haryana at Chandigarh.

The Executive Committee approved the name of Mr. Gurminder Singh, Advocate, Punjab & Haryana High Court as Standing Counsel for Medical Council of India in the High Court of Punjab and Haryana at Chandigarh.

26. **CMP No.27336 of 2002 in OP No.16142 of 2002 between Mary Louis Manavalan & Ors. Vs. State of Kerala and others (Medical Council of India being respondent No.6/9 and Union of India being respondent no.9/9)**

Read: the matter with regard to CMP No.27336 of 2002 in OP No.16142 of 2002 between Mary Louis Manavalan & Ors. Vs. State of Kerala and others (Medical Council of India being respondent No.6/9 and Union of India being respondent no.9/9)

The Executive Committee noted the letter dt. 1.2.2002 received from the Advocate appearing on behalf of the Council in the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala in CMP No.27336 of 2002 in OP No.16142 of 2002 between Mary Louis Manavalan & Ors. Vs. State of Kerala and

others (Medical Council of India being respondent No.6/9 and Union of India being respondent no.9/9).

27. **Recognition of Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj for the award of MBBS degree granted by B.N. Mandal University, Madhepura (Bihar).**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition of Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj for the award of MBBS degree granted by B.N. Mandal University, Madhepura (Bihar).

The Executive Committee noted that the General Body of the Council at its meeting held on 21-22 June,2001 approved the recommendations of the Executive Committee recommending recognition of Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj for the award of MBBS degree granted by B.N. Mandal University, Madhepura (Bihar) with an annual intake of 60 students for the purpose of its inclusion in the first schedule to the IMC Act,1956. This recognition was granted subject to any order which may be passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in Civil Appeal No.2194/96 – Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj vs. State of Bihar & ors. pending before it.

The Committee further noted that Civil Appeal No.2194/96 has been finally disposed off by the Hon'ble Supreme Court on 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2002 in favour of Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj. In compliance of the order passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court the Registrar, B.N. Mandal University vide his letter dt. 5<sup>th</sup> Feb. 2003 has granted permanent affiliation to Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj.

In view of above the Committee decided to recommend that MBBS degree granted by B.N. Mandal University, Madhepura be recognised and included in the Ist Schedule to the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 in respect of students being trained at Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College & Lions Seva Kendra Hospital, Kishanganj.

28. **Appointment of Inspectors for carrying out the inspection of Postgraduate Medical Courses – reg.**

The Executive Committee authorised the President to appoint inspectors for conducting the inspection for recognition of DRM & Diploma in Marine Medicine in respect of Instt. of Naval Medicine, Mumbai.

29. **Teacher's Eligibility Qualifications – Counting of teaching experience of specialities graded doctors of AMC.**

(Deferred item no.30 of the Executive Committee held on 9.1.2003)

Read: the report of the Sub-Committee for counting of the teaching experience of Specialities graded doctors of AMC.

The Executive Committee approved the following recommendations of the Sub-Committee with regard to counting of teaching experience of specialities graded doctors of A.M.C:

“The Sub-Committee deliberated in the issue in detail and noted that the office of the DGAFMS has by & large accepted and agreed to adhere to Council Regulations on “Minimum Qualifications for Teachers in Medical Institutions Regulations, 1998”. The Committee therefore recommends to the Executive Committee for consideration of the following teaching experience of specialists in the Armed Forces; for appointment as Teachers:

1. Specialist Medical Officers of the Armed Forces having requisite recognised postgraduate qualification in the subject can be considered eligible for appointment as Lecturer/Asstt. Prof. in the concerned subject.
2. Specialist Medical Officers of the Armed Forces having minimum 5 years teaching experience as Graded/Classified Specialist after possessing requisite recognised postgraduate qualification in the subject or having minimum 5 years experience as Lecturer/Asstt. Prof. in a teaching hospital of the Armed Forces can be considered eligible for appointment as Reader/Assoc. Prof.
3. Specialist Medical Officers of the Armed Forces appointed as Sr. Adviser/having minimum 4 years’ teaching experience as Classified Specialist possessing requisite recognised postgraduate qualification in the subject or having minimum 4 years experience as Reader/Assoc. Prof. in a teaching hospital of the Armed Forces, can be considered eligible for appointment as Professor;

Provided further that other requirements of research publications as contained in the “Minimum Qualifications for Teachers in Medical Institutions Regulations, 1998” are also met with.

The Committee further recommends that the above provisions shall be applicable prospectively.”

30. **Vinayaka Mission Medical College, Karaikal, Pondicherry – Approval of the college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pondicherry University**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (25<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) for approval of Vinayaka Mission

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (25<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> Feb.2003) carried out for approval of Vinayaka Mission Medical College, Karaikal, Pondicherry which also tagged with renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students at the college and noted the following:-

1. CT Scan facilities and renal dialysis are not available.
2. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided not to recommend approval of Vinayaka Mission Medical College, Karaikal, Pondicherry for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pondicherry University.

The Committee further noted that the Central Government vide its letter dt. 14.6.2002 had already renewed permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students during 2001-02 subject to

the condition that there should be minimum 240 teaching days between two batches before they conduct examination as per the MCI regulations without waiting the recommendations of the Council and the MCI was requested to verify the compliance as already forwarded by the Ministry and sending the recommendations of the Council thereon. Hence the compliance verification inspection was carried out alongwith the recognition inspection. Upon consideration of the inspection report which also includes the compliance verification report, the Committee decided to renew the permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> batch of students during 2002-03.

31. **Approval of B.J. Medical College, Ahmedabad for the award of MBBS degree granted by Gujarat University for the increased number of seats from 210 to 250.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (4<sup>th</sup> – 6<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) for approval of B.J. Medical College, Ahmedabad for the award of MBBS degree granted by Gujarat University for the increased number of seats from 210 to 250.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (4<sup>th</sup> – 6<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) and noted the following:-

1. As per MCI requirements three lecture theatres with sitting capacity of 300 students are needed with audio visual aids which are not available.
2. There is no auditorium with sitting capacity of 1750-2000 as per MCI requirements.
3. There is no separate examination hall as required.
4. There is no animal house.
5. Construction in clinical department is not completed.
6. Govt. approval in respect of unit Incharge in the deptt. of Medicine which is headed by Honorary teacher is awaited.
7. Large number of vacancies of non-teaching staff.
8. About 13 teachers transferred from other colleges just before the inspection.
9. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to give six months time to the institution to comply with the deficiencies and send a compliance for further consideration of the matter.

32. **NHL Municipal Medical College, Ahmedabad - renewal of permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e 100 to 150.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at NHL Municipal Medical College, Ahmedabad.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> March, 03) and decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 100 to 150 at NHL Municipal Medical College, Ahmedabad for the academic session 2003-04.

Further, the institution be advised to comply the following observations within 3 months and send a compliance thereof:

- (i) In SCL Hospital the OPDs of Orthopaedics, Eye & ENT are being conducted on alternate days. There is need to conduct all these OPDs on all the working days. Similarly, in LG Hospital the OPDs of Orthopaedics and ENT are being conducted on alternate days. These also need to be conducted daily.
- (ii) The availability of rooms in both boys and girls hostels is less (60 room in boys hostel and 43 rooms in girls hostel). There is need to construct more hostel rooms for both the boys and girls so that the students of bigger batches can be accommodated into the hostels.
- (iii) There is a need to install mechanized laundries in SCL and LG Hospitals.
- (iv) The furniture which has not been painted in the college and hospitals, need to be painted and repaired wherever needed on priority basis. The repair/white washing of the buildings need to be completed.

33. **Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Medical College, Bangalore – Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 120 – Renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch.**

Read: the compliance verification inspection report (10<sup>th</sup> & 11<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students against the increased intake from 100 to 120 at Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Medical College, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee considered the compliance verification inspection report (10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) carried out on receipt of the compliance through the Central Government on the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report (20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> November, 2002) and noted the following:

1. Affiliation for the increased 20 seats for the year 2002-03 has not yet been granted. As per the decision of the Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore the affiliation was continued for 100 seats only in the M.B.B.S. course for the year 2002-03.
2. No auditorium is available. As per the compliance sent by the college authorities they undertake to construct the same by the year 2004.
3. In the college hospital, all the departmental OPDs have 2/3 rooms in which all the departmental facilities like departmental library cum seminar room, clinical examination rooms, etc. are located. All the clinical departments have inadequate equipment for examination & treatment in all the rooms / cubicles. The departmental offices are not functional.
4. In the Government hospital, there is no clear demarcation of beds into college and Government beds in all the wards. Space between two beds is too less for teaching purposes and movement of patients / trolleys. In the OPDs, all the departments have only 1 room for each department which is used in common by all the unit personnel. No

computerization of any nature is available. It does not maintain any separate record of patients of teaching / non-teaching beds. There is no hostel for interns or residents.

5. The clinical material available at the own hospital of the college is still inadequate in terms of OPD attendance, bed occupancy, casualty attendance, major & minor surgeries, delivered performed, laboratory investigations of clinical Pathology, Biochemistry, Microbiology, Histopathology & Cytopathology and x-ray investigations.
6. All the rooms in all the OPDs have not yet been provided with examination tray, X-ray view box, etc. Teaching areas have been provided in some OPDs. As regards the office space for clinical departments, they are still non-functional and neither any clerical or steno staff are available. The office furniture in various staff rooms also requires to be augmented.
7. The Registration & Medical Record section is still not fully computerized. WHO ICD X classification is still not followed.
8. In the central casualty there are only 6 beds against 20 required. Attendance at the casualty is only 6.56 per day which has not been improved since the last inspection carried out.
9. There is a need to increase the workload of the central laboratory.
10. There is no ICCU. Medical ICU has only 4 & Surgical ICU has 6 beds. Equipment like Fowler cots, bedside monitors, etc. have not been provided for each bed in ICUs. PICU has 2 beds which are not Paediatric beds at all. NICU is functional and has 6 beds. The monitoring & resuscitation equipment is not sufficient.
11. No separate CSSD is functional.
12. There are only 3 Nursing Superintendents, 90 nurses and 7 ANMs {i.e. Total 100 nursing staff} against total requirement of 161 nurses. Paramedical and non-teaching staff is inadequate in many departments. The paramedical staff of the college for RHTC / UHC is inadequate.
13. There is no central workshop in the college.
14. Intercom facilities to various department/sections have not been provided. Total 74 lines – 26 in college & 48 in the hospital – have been connected. Areas like Medical ICU, mortuary block, nursing stations on I & II floors, ladies' hostel, canteen, etc. are not yet connected.
15. The facilities and staff for animal house in the department of Microbiology are grossly inadequate and not as per MCI norms. Veterinary hospital is not yet appointed still. The second animal house in the hospital is still not functional.

16. Hostels: There are no separate hostels for interns and residents. Male interns and residents are accommodated in boys' hostel and female interns and residents are accommodated in girls' hostel. No separate residents' quarters are available.
17. Nurses Hostel: Accommodation is available for 58 nurses in 10 rooms in the Nursing hostel against the requirement of accommodation for 161 nurses.
18. ICCU is not available in both college & Government hospitals.
19. CT Scan & Dialysis facilities are not available either at college or Government hospital.
20. Shortage of teaching staff including requirements for P.G. is as under:  
 Professor: Nil  
 Reader: 5 {Anatomy-1, Physiology-1, Tb & Chest-1, Radiology: 2}  
 Lecturer: 3 {Anatomy-2, Psychiatry: 1}  
 Pharmaceutical chemist: 1  
 Tutor/ Sr. Resident: 10 {Physiology: 1, Pharmacology: 2, P.S.M.: 4, L.M.O. at RHTC / UHC: 2, Radiology: 1}  
 Jr. Resident: 3 {Paediatrics: 1, Psychiatry: 2}  
 Total faculty shortage: 9 {i.e. 7.37 %}  
 Total Tutor/Resident shortage: 13 {i.e. 12.75 %}
21. Other remarks / deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 100 to 120 at Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Medical College, Bangalore.

34 **Govt. Medical College, Tirunelveli – Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (3<sup>rd</sup> & 4<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) for increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Tirunelveli u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) and noted the following:-

1. O.P.D. requires rearrangement with more privacy required for female patients. Plaster room and plaster cutting room are common which needs to be separated. Proper teaching areas with examination trolleys, examination couches, instrument trays, X-ray viewing boxes, etc. have not been provided in many rooms / cubicles. O.P.D. case sheet is very small thin sheet of paper on which very few details of the patient and the case can be written. It needs to be replaced with bigger and thicker paper which would facilitate the record keeping. O.P.D. case sheet should include more details. A uniform register needs to be provided in which proper details of the patient with provisional / final diagnosis can be entered.



2. Medical, Paediatric & Surgical ICU need to be strengthened with more monitoring equipment.
3. In the casualty there are 21 beds which are put in 2 wards on different floors with no linkage between them. There is no ventilator, no duty rosters exhibited.
4. The central clinical laboratory is not properly equipped or organized. There is no unified control and the departments of Pathology, Microbiology and Biochemistry work independently of each other in the laboratory. There is a common collection center. There is no computerization or automated equipment. Only routine tests are done in this laboratory. Culture facilities are not available in this laboratory and the culture tests are done in the college. Histopathology, Cytopathology and other specialized investigations are also done in the college laboratories. Equipment like ELISA reader are available in the college laboratories only. The workload is also less. It needs to be strengthened with auto analyzer and automatic cell counters and the whole setup needs to be reorganized.
5. No separate statistical unit has been provided. Central records section needs to be computerized.
6. The furniture in the lecture halls, demonstration rooms, laboratories and in the examination hall requires to be refurbished and more number of benches / tables / chairs are required to be provided and broken benches need to be repaired.
7. Departmental libraries of Tuberculosis & Chest Diseases, Skin & V.D., Psychiatry, Ophthalmology, E.N.T., Radiology need to be upgraded and that of Dentistry needs to be established.
8. No lecturer cum medical officer having M.D. {P.S.M.} is posted at R.H.T.C. /U.H.C. The senior faculty of P.S.M. department need to be regularly posted at R.H.T.C. / U.H.C. Only 1 room each with 1 bed has been provided for male and female internees. No other hostel facilities are available at R.H.T.C. No messing facilities are available. Hostel facilities at R.H.T.C. need to be expanded. Teaching facilities and aids also need to be provided at U.H.C. / R.H.T.C. Duty rosters and records of various activities and investigations are not maintained properly at U.H.C. Sign boards and display boards of various rooms also need to be realigned at U.H.C.
9. Residents' quarters have been provided only for 48 residents against the requirement of 150 quarters at this stage. Nurses' quarters have been provided for 60 nurses against the requirement of 193.
10. Common rooms for boys and girls have not been provided in the college building.
11. There is no generator in the college campus.
12. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to issue LOI for increase of seats in Ist MBBS course from 100 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Tirunvelli u/s. 10A of the IMC Act,1956.

35. **Narayana Medical College, Nellore - renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> March, 2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of students at Narayana Medical College, Nellore.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> March, 03) and decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of 100 (one hundred) students at Narayana Medical College, Nellore for the academic session 2003-04.

36. **Establishment of new medical college at Enathur by Meenakshi Ammal Trust, Chennai.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (28<sup>th</sup> Feb., & 1<sup>st</sup> March, 2003) for establishment of new medical college at Enathur by Meenakshi Ammal Trust, Chennai.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (28<sup>th</sup> Feb. and 1<sup>st</sup> March, 2003) and decided to recommend to Central Government to issue Letter of Intent for establishment of new medical college at Enathur by Meenakshi Ammal Trust, Chennai u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 with an annual intake of 100 (one hundred) students for the academic session 2003-04.

37. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at medical colleges in M.P.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at medical colleges in M.P.

The Executive Committee considered the matter of continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at medical colleges in the State of M.P. and noted that the periodical inspection from continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by the respective universities in respect of students being trained in the following medical colleges functioning in the state of Madhya Pradesh was carried out by the Council Inspectors on the dates mentioned against each and no proper compliance, rectifying the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report has been received from the college authorities inspite of sufficient time granted to them by the various meetings of the Committee: -

- |    |                                 |   |           |
|----|---------------------------------|---|-----------|
| 1. | G.R. Medical College, Gwalior   | - | Oct, 95.  |
| 2. | Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal. | - | Jan., 98. |
| 3. | M.G.M. Medical College, Indore. | - | Feb., 98. |
| 4. | NSCB Medical College, Jabalpur  | - | April, 98 |
| 5. | S. S. Medical College, Rewa.    | - | Nov., 98. |

It further noted that the matter was last considered by the Committee on 24-07-2000 when it was informed that Govt. of Madhya Pradesh has increased certain number of seats in all the State owned medical colleges without making any reference u/s 10 A of the IMC Act, 1956. It also noted the letter dt. 8/6/2000 received from the Principal Secretary, Government of Madhya Pradesh intimating that for the medical colleges of Bhopal, Gwalior, Indore and Jabalpur, initial sanctioned intake capacity was 150 seats for each college. Over the last several years instead of 150 admissions only 140 students were being admitted to the above colleges. Since last year (1999) the State Govt. in pursuance of the Cabinet decision decided to grant admission to the full sanctioned capacity i.e. 150 seats to each of the medical colleges and more than 60 admissions were being made in the medical colleges at Rewa. The break up of the seats given by the Principal- Secretary was as under:-

G.R. Medical College, Gwalior	-	140+ 10 Payments/NRI
Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal	-	140+ 10 Payments/NRI
M.G. M. Medical Colleges, Indore	.-	140+ 10 Payments/NRI
NSCB Medical Colleges, Jabalpur	-	140+ 10 Payments/NRI
S.S. Medical Colleges, Rewa.	-	60+ 10 Payments/NRI.

However, as per the records available the sanctioned capacity of the medical colleges Bhopal, Gwalior, Indore, and Jabalpur is only 140 and in Rewa it is 60.

The Committee also noted that the Central Govt. has addressed one letter dated 21-06-2000 to the Chief Secretary Govt. of Madhya Pradesh intimating therein that the State authorities advised to restrict the number of admissions as certified by the Medical Council Of India in the medical colleges and further the Central Govt. will be allocating 15% of the seats under the All India Quota only as per the total number of the seats sanctioned by the MCI. Any admission made in excess of the seats sanctioned will be irregular and the students admitted against those seats shall not be entitled to obtain registration from the Council. The Central Govt. advised the State authorities not to admit extra seats against the excess capacity beyond the sanctioned intake and take corrective steps for the current year admissions so that the students are not misled.

The Committee also decided to obtain from the authorities concerned a copy of the letter of MCI conveying therein the sanctioned seats for the medical colleges in Bhopal, Gwalior, Indore and Jabalpur as 150 and further that no admission be made for the extra seats in all the medical colleges in Madhya Pradesh in excess of the sanctioned capacity i.e. 140 in the above 4 medical colleges, 60 at medical college Rewa and 100 at medical college Raipur till the issue is resolved.

The Committee further noted that the Hon'ble High Court of M.P. in WP No. 45/2001 – Mr. Shailendra Chaudhary Vs. State of M.P. & ors vide its order dt. 19.9.2002 had directed MCI to decide the MBBS intake of 5 medical colleges in M.P. which has not yet been decided.

The Committee considered the letter dated 21-02-2003 now received from the Secretary, Govt. of Madhya Pradesh Medical Education Department regarding the number of admissions to the MBBS course in Medical Colleges of Bhopal, Gwalior, Indore Jabalpur and Rewa which

states that the number of MBBS seats sanctioned by MCI for admission in medical colleges of Indore, Bhopal, Gwalior & Jabalpur were 150 & 60 for Rewa upto the year 1978. This has been verified by the MCI inspectors in their periodical inspection reports. Due to some reason the intake of candidates was reduced to 140 in 4 medical colleges (Bhopal, Indore, Gwalior & Jabalpur) from the year 1979 onward by the State of MP as its own internal arrangements and not by MCI.

The MCI recommendations and norms are directed for the admission & sanction at levels of 50, 100, 150 and so on. The figure of 140 does not fall in MCI sanction/ regulation.

The State of MP was admitting 150 students in MBBS Course in the medical college at Bhopal, Indore, Gwalior and Jabalpur & 60 students in Rewa with the due permission & recognition by MCI inspectors, periodically verified this number & never directed the State Govt. to reduce the seats in 4 medical colleges from 150 to 140. The medical college does not take permission for admission to MBBS courses & no. of seats every year once recognition is granted & no. of seats sanctioned by MCI.

The infrastructure & other facilities were adequate as per MCI norms even in 1978 & before. There is lot of improvement in last few years. The State of MP has created 122 posts of asstt. Professor & promoted 26 Asst. Professor to Associate Professor & 20 Associate Professor recently.

In view of above-mentioned facts, the Health Secretary has requested to make amendments in the no. of sanctioned seats of MBBS course to 150 in medical college of Bhopal, Indore, Gwalior & Jabalpur from academic year 2003-2004. The State Govt. undertakes to maintain the allocation of All India quota seats within these numbers and as per direction.

The Committee further noted that no proper compliance has been received from the college authorities on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the periodical inspection reports and decided to issue a show cause notice to the concerned authorities as to why steps should not be initiated to recommend to the Central Government to derecognise the institutions for the award of MBBS degree granted by the respective universities for not sending a compliance report rectifying the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report. The Committee further decided to give one month's time to the institutions to respond to the show cause notice. If no reply is received within the specified period, action be initiated as decided.

The Committee further decided to send a copy of the letter to the Chief Secretary, Health Secretary and Director Medical Education of the State Govt., Registrar of the concerned university, Health Secretary to Govt. of India and member of the Council representing the State Govt. for information and necessary action.

38. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Mahatma Gandhi University, Kottayam in respect of students being trained at Medical College, Kottayam.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at medical college, Kottayam.

The Executive Committee considered the compliance report received from the college authorities on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the periodical inspection report (April, 1998) and decided to verify the same by way of an inspection.

39. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained in the Medical Colleges functioning in the State of Uttar Pradesh.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained in the medical colleges in the State of Uttar Pradesh.

The Executive Committee considered the matter of continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at medical colleges in the State of Uttar Pradesh and noted that the periodical inspections in the following medical colleges functioning in the State of Uttar Pradesh was carried out by the Council Inspectors on the dates mentioned against each and no proper compliance rectifying the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report has been received from the college authorities inspite of sufficient time granted to them by the various meetings of the Committee: -

1. GSVM Medical College, Kanpur – (Feb. 1997)
2. SN Medical College, Agra (Feb. 1997)
3. MLN Medical College, Allahabad (Sept. 1995)
4. KG Medical College, Lucknow (Oct. 1995)
5. MLB Medical College, Jhansi (Sept. 1995)
6. LLRM Medical College, Meerut (May. 1997)

The Committee further noted that a letter dt 04<sup>th</sup> Oct. 2000 was received from the Chief Secretary, Government of Uttar Pradesh intimating that the State Government has decided to form the individual societies to run the Medical Colleges of the State. This order of the State Government was struck down by the Hon'ble High Court and they have appealed against this order, but not to loose further time the State Government has already moved requisition to the Uttar Pradesh Public Service commission to make selection for the existing teaching posts to be filled. It was also intimated that action to hold D.P.C. has been initiated so that number of vacancies, which are to be filled by promotion, would be filled up during the next two months.

Since no further communication/compliance report was received either from the College or State authorities rectifying the deficiencies pointed out in the periodical inspection report, the Committee decided to issue a show cause notice to the concerned authorities as to why steps should not be initiated to recommend to the Central Government to derecognise the institutions in the State of U.P. for the award of MBBS degree granted by the respective universities for not sending the compliance report. The Committee further decided to give one month's time to the institutions to respond to the show cause notice. If no reply is received within the specified period, action be initiated as decided.

The Committee further decided to send a copy of the letter to the Chief Secretary, Health Secretary and Director Medical Education of the State Govt., Registrar of the concerned

university, Health Secretary to Govt. of India and member of the Council representing the State Govt. for information and necessary action.

It was further brought to the notice of the Committee that the recommendations of the Council derecognising B.R.D. Medical College, Gorakhpur forwarded to the Govt. of India has not been acted upon till date. The Committee expressed its grave concern over the same and decided to send a reminder to Govt. of India to act urgently in the matter.

40. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at J.N.M. Medical College, Raipur.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at J.N.M. Medical College, Raipur.

The Executive Committee noted that periodical inspection for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at J.N.M. Medical College, Raipur was carried out by the Council Inspectors in September 1996 and the inspection report was considered by the Committee on 14/12/1996. In view of the various deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report with regard to staff and other infrastructure facilities, six months time was granted to the institution to rectify the same and send a compliance. As no response was received from the college authorities, the matter was again considered by it at its meeting held on 02/07/1998 where it was decided to issue a show-cause notice to recommend to the Central Government to derecognise the institution for the award of MBBS degree for not sending the compliance and one month's time was granted to the institution to respond to the show cause notice.

The Committee further noted that compliance in response to the show-cause notice received from the college authorities was considered by the Committee at its meeting held on 14/10/1998. Since the deficiencies with regard to staff were still persisting three months time was granted to rectify the same and to send a compliance.

As no compliance rectifying the deficiencies have been received from the college authorities, the Committee decided to issue a show cause notice to the concerned authorities as to why steps should not be initiated to recommend to the Central Government to derecognise the institution for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Pt. Ravishankar Shukla University, Raipur for not sending the compliance report. The Committee further decided to give one month's time to the institution to respond to the show cause notice. If no reply is received within the specified period, action be initiated as decided.

The Committee further decided to send a copy of the letter to the Chief Secretary, Health Secretary and Director Medical Education of the State Govt., Registrar of the concerned university, Health Secretary to Govt. of India and member of the Council representing the State Govt. for information and necessary action.

41. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Amravati University in respect of students being trained at Dr. Panjabrao Alias Bhusaheb Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at Dr. Panjabrao Alias Bhusaheb Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati.

The Executive Committee noted that periodical inspection for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Amravati University in respect of students being trained at Dr. Panjabrao Alias Bhusaheb Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati was carried out by the Council Inspectors in July, 1997. Compliance report on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report was verified by the Council Inspectors on 3 occasions i.e. in April, 1999, Feb., 2000 and Nov., 2000. The last compliance verification inspection report was considered by the Committee on 22/01/2001 and the Committee did not recommend continuation of recognition of MBBS degree and gave three months time to the institution to comply with the deficiencies and send the compliance.

The Committee further noted that the compliance report on the deficiencies was received from the College authorities vide their letter dated 13/06/2001 which was considered by the Committee on 02/08/2001. Since the compliance was not satisfactory and staff deficiencies still persisted, the Committee gave another three months time to the institution to comply with the same.

As no compliance rectifying the deficiencies have been received from the college authorities, the Committee decided to issue a show cause notice to the concerned authorities as to why steps should not be initiated to recommend to the Central Government to derecognise the institution for the award of MBBS degree granted by Amravati University for not sending the compliance report. The Committee further decided to give one month's time to the institution to respond to the show cause notice. If no reply is received within the specified period, action be initiated as decided.

The Committee further decided to send a copy of the letter to the Chief Secretary, Health Secretary and Director Medical Education of the State Govt., Registrar of the concerned university, Health Secretary to Govt. of India and member of the Council representing the State Govt. for information and necessary action.

42. **Continuance of recognition in respect of students being trained at Assam Medical College, Dibrugarh.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at Assam Medical College, Dibrugarh.

The Executive Committee noted that the periodical inspection for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at Assam Medical College, Dibrugarh was carried out in April, 1997 and the same was sent for obtaining the observations of

the University/college authorities on 25.5.1997. As the University/college authorities did not respond, the matter was considered by the Committee on 17.9.1997 where it was decided to send a final reminder. The final reminder was sent on 15.10.1997, which also stood unreplied, hence the matter was again considered by the committee at its meeting held on 2.7.1998. On a month's time was granted to the institution to respond to the show cause notice. In response to the show cause notice compliance received from the Registrar, Dibrugarh University vide letter dt. 20.8.1998 which was considered by the Committee at its meeting held on 14.10.1998. Since certain deficiencies noted in the inspection report were still to be complied with, 3 months time was granted to the institution to send a proper compliance. Further compliance received from the college authorities was considered by the Committee on 26.5.2000. As the compliance was not satisfactory, 3 months time was again granted to the institution to send a proper compliance.

In response to above, a compliance was again received from the college authorities and was considered by the Committee at its meeting held on 8.9.2000. On going through the compliance report the Committee noted that the inspection report is more than 3 years old and the latest staff position has not been furnished by the college authorities, hence it was decided to obtain the latest list of staff working at the college with full details.

Since no further communication has been received from the college authorities, the Executive Committee decided to send last and final reminder to the college authorities giving one month time to send the latest list of staff working at the college with full details for further consideration of the matter.

43. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by NTR University of Health Sciences in respect of students being trained at Guntur Medical College, Guntur.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at Guntur Medical College, Guntur.

The Committee noted that a compliance verification inspection report (10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> July, 2001) was considered by it at its meeting held on 2<sup>nd</sup> August, 2001. On going through the compliance verification inspection report, it noted the following deficiencies of staff and other infrastructure facilities for 150 admission and decided to grant 3 months time to the institution to comply with the above deficiencies and send a compliance to that effect for further consideration in the matter:-

1. Staff:
  - a) Associate Professor – 2 (Anatomy-1, Radiology – 1)
  - b) Assistant Professor – 2 (Anatomy –1, Lecturer in Biophysics- 1)
  - c) Tutor/Sr. Resident – 10( Anatomy –1, Pharmacology –4, Forensic Medicine –1, P.S.M. – 3)
  - d) Jr. Residents – 5 (Surgery – 3, Orthopaedics – 2). ===== Total 19.
2. The college is running postgraduate courses in almost all the subjects. Additional staff required for running postgraduate courses in Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry, Pharmacology, Pathology, Microbiology and Forensic Medicine is not appointed.



3. Composition of Units – Medicine Unit IV, V, VI are having two Sr. teachers instead of three. Paediatric Unit II is having one Sr. Teacher only.
3. Journals are not subscribed in the central library due to non availability of funds.
4. Microfilm reading facilities are not available.
5. There is shortage of accommodation in ladies hostel. Construction work of ladies hostel though started but it will be completed in 6 to 9 months as reported in the inspection report.
6. There is shortage of rooms for interns.
7. Pathology and Microbiology laboratories needs upgradation with equipment.
8. Incinerator is not functional.
10. Auditorium and lecture theatres are used for conducting examination. No separate examination hall is available.
11. Mortuary cooler is not in working condition.
12. Departmentwise deficiencies:
  - a) Anatomy Department:
    - Histology practical laboratory is having 75 seats instead of 90.
  - b) Physiology Department:
    - Each practical laboratory does not have the required number of seats i.e. 90 seats.
    - Haemacology practical laboratory does not have required number of microscopes and provision for artificial light.
  - c) Biochemistry Department:
    - Biochemistry practical laboratory is having 38 seats instead of 90 as required.
  - d) Pharmacology Department:
    - Experimental Pharmacology lab. Is having 40 seats instead of 90 and clinical pharmacology/pharmacy practical laboratory is having 60 seats instead of 90. Experimental pharmacology lab. is shared by PSM department.
  - e) Pathology Department:
    - Both the Histology and Clinical Pathology laboratories are having 75 seats instead of 90 as required.
    - The institution has not yet developed demonstration room.
  - f) Microbiology Department:
    - Practical laboratory is having 50 seats instead of 90.
  - g) PSM Department:
    - The department does not have its own laboratory.
13. In hospital clinical laboratory there is no arrangement to carry out any emergency investigations for 24 hours.

As no compliance rectifying the defects/deficiencies has been received from the college authorities, the Committee decided to issue a show cause notice to the concerned authorities as to why steps should not be initiated to recommend to the Central Government to derecognise the institution for the award of MBBS degree granted by NTR University of Health Sciences for not sending the compliance report. The Committee further decided to give one month's time to the institution to respond to the show cause notice. If no reply is received within the specified period, action be initiated as decided.

The Committee further decided to send a copy of the letter to the Chief Secretary, Health Secretary and Director Medical Education of the State Govt., Registrar of the concerned university, Health Secretary to Govt. of India and member of the Council representing the State Govt. for information and necessary action.

44. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Gauhati University in respect of students being trained at Gauhati Medical College, Gauhati.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at Gauhati Medical College, Gauhati.

The Executive Committee noted that the periodical inspection for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree in respect of students being trained at Gauhati Medical College, Gauhati was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> November, 2001 and the same was sent to the University/college authorities for their observations.

The Committee noted that as no observations were received till date hence decided to give final reminder to the authorities to send the observations and rectify the defects and deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report within four weeks.

45. **Ratification of 121 excess admissions made in MBBS course by Govt. of Tamilnadu in various Medical Colleges during 1996-97, 1998-99, 1999-2000 and 2000-2001 – Regarding.**

Read: the request of Govt. of Tamilnadu received through the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 19<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2003 for ratification of 121 excess admissions made in MBBS course by Govt. of Tamilnadu in various Medical Colleges during 1996-97, 1998-99, 1999-2000 and 2000-2001.

The Executive Committee decided to adopt the following course of action as suggested by the legal Counsel:-

1. In terms of the powers vested with the Medical Council of India under the 1997 Regulations, it be verified as to whether the State of Tamilnadu is admitting students to the MBBS course in the respective medical colleges in accordance with the sanctioned annual intake for them by the Council.
2. As to whether there is any order passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in favour of the State of Tamilnadu any time after the academic year 1995-96 for making admissions for the reserved category candidates for more than 50% seats and then

- making admissions over & above the sanctioned annual intake capacity fixed for the Govt. Medical Colleges in the State of Tamilnadu ?
3. In case the concerned authorities are able to furnish a copy of the order said to have been passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court referred to above, then the Council should immediately file an appropriate application in the SLP © No. 1352693 and Consumer Care Council Vs. State of Tamilnadu or any other such petition in which any such order has been passed.
  4. In case the State of Tamilnadu confirms to the MCI that there was no specific order by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its favour in this regard then necessary action as per Section 10B for all the excess admissions made in the Govt. Medical Colleges over & above the sanctioned intake capacity be initiated.

46. **Non-teaching Hospital – Continuance of recognition of Holy Cross Hospital, Kerala for internship.**

Read: the Council Inspectors report (Dec., 2002) for continuance of recognition of Holy Cross Hospital, Kerala for internship training.

The Executive Committee on going through the inspection report (Dec.2002) decided to continue the recognition of Holy Cross Hospital, Kerala for internship training.

47. **To consider the matter with regard to appointment of non-medical teachers for carrying out the inspection for U.G./P.G. level on behalf of the Medical Council of India.**

Read: the matter with regard to appointment of non-medical teachers for carrying out the inspection for U.G./P.G. level on behalf of the Medical Council of India.

The Executive Committee did not agree for appointment of non-medical teachers for carrying out the inspection at U.G./P.G. level on behalf of the Medical Council of India.

48. **NBE – Equivalence of Board's qualifications with MD/MS/DM/MCh of other Indian Universities, conduct of All India Entrance Examination – regarding appointment of Chairman for Sub-Committee.**

The Executive Committee noted that a Sub-Committee had been constituted by the Postgraduate Committee at its meeting held on 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> Sept.2002 with the following members for consideration of NBE - Equivalence of Board's qualifications with MD/MS/DM/MCh of other Indian Universities, conduct of All India Entrance Examination:

1. Dr. B.Ray Choudhari-Chairman
2. Dr. Shyam Sunder and
3. Dr. Subash Penkar

The Committee further noted that due to sad demise of Dr. B. Ray Choudhari, the post of Chairman of the Sub-Committee fell vacant and decided that Dr. L.S. Chawla may act as Chairman of the Sub-Committee.

49. **To note the Letter of Intent/Renewal of permission for establishment of medical college/increase of seats.**

The Executive Committee noted the Letter of Intent/Renewal of permission for establishment of medical college/increase of seats:

<b>Name of the Medical College</b>	<b>Date of LOI/LOP/renewal of permission by the Central Govt..</b>
Smt. N.H.L. Municipal Medical College, Ahmedabad	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 3 <sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 for the academic session 2002-2003 issued by the Central Govt. on 27.1.2003
Dr.Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of 50 students for the academic session 2002-2003 issued by the Central Govt. on 27.1.2003.
Medical College at Eulru by Alluri Sitaram Educational Society, Hyderabad.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 3 <sup>rd</sup> batch of 100 students for the academic session 2002-2003 issued by the Central Govt. on 20.1.2003.
Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> batch of 100 students for the academic session 2002-2003 issued by the Central Govt. on 20.1.2003.
Aarupadai Veedu Medical College, Pondicherry	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 3 <sup>rd</sup> batch of 100 students for the academic session 2002-2003 issued by the Central Govt. on 20.1.2003.
Establishment of new medical college at Latur by Govt. of Maharashtra	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee, the Central Govt. vide its letter dt. 30.1.2003 has issued LOI for establishment of the college with annual intake 100 students with prospective effect.
Establishment of new medical college at Chinoutpally by Siddhartha Academy of General & Technical Education, Vijayawada	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee the Central Govt. vide its letter dt. 30.1.2003 has issued LOI for establishment of the college with annual intake 150 students for the academic session 2003-04.
Establishment of new medical college at Akola by Govt. of Maharashtra	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee, the Central Govt. vide its letter dt. 30.1.2003 has issued LOI for establishment of the college with annual intake 100 students with prospective effect.

Guru Ram Das Instt. of Medical Sciences, Amritsar	The Central Govt. vide letter dt. 24.1.2003 recognised the college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, in or after January 2002 with an annual intake capacity of 50 students.
---	--

50. **Payment of Bills to the Advocates appointed by the Administrator.**

Read: the matter with regard to payment of bills to the Advocates appointment by the Administrator.

The Executive Committee considered the matter and decided that the bills to the Advocates appointed by the Administrator as well as for the Advocates appearing in the SLP ©-CC No. 5354-56/2002 and CA No.599-600/2002 preferred by the Vice-President and the other Civil Appeal No.601-602/2002 preferred by the Executive Committee members be paid by the Council.

51. **Increase of MBBS seats in Govt. Medical Colleges of Andhra Pradesh.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats in Govt. Medical Colleges of Andhra Pradesh.

The Executive Committee deliberated in detail on DO letter dt. 25.2.2003 from Principal Secretary, Health, Medical & F.W. Deptt., Govt. of Andhra Pradesh and observed that certain statements are factually incorrect. On verifying from the records available with the Council particularly the reference of the letter dt. 11.9.2002 and fax messages dt. 31.8.2002 and 19.9.2002 it is observed that at no point of time any delay was caused on part of MCI. As a matter of fact in most of the cases it is the institution who had asked for postponement of the inspections time & again. In view of this, the Committee decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting held on 9.1.2003.

52. **W.P. (C) No.317/2000-Malay Ganguly –Vs - Medical Council of India in the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.**

Read: the W.P.(C ) No.317/2000-Malay Ganguly – Vs - Medical Council of India before the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.

The Executive Committee noted the matter with regard to WP © No. 317/2000-Malay Ganguly Vs. Medical Council of India before the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India indicating time frame for referring matters to State Medical Council(s) and the response of the Council to the queries raised by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and response of the Council as included in the reply affidavit.

53. **Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad - Increase of seats in MBBS course from 50 to 150 – application received u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 50 to 150 at Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad.

The Executive Committee considered the Central Government letter dated 25.2.2003 with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 50 to 150 at Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad and decided to carry out inspection of the facilities available at the college.

54. **K.J.Somiaya Medical College, Mumbai - renewal of permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 50 to 100.**

Read: the compliance received through the Central Govt. for renewal of permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 50 to 100 at K.J.somiaya Medical College, Mumbai.

The Executive Committee noted that compliance verification inspection report (15<sup>th</sup> Nov.,2002) carried out on receipt of the compliance on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report (16<sup>th</sup> & 17<sup>th</sup> July,2002) was considered by the Committee at its meeting held on 9.1.2003 and noted that the following deficiencies still persist and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 at K.J. Somaiya Medical College, Mumbai for the academic session 2002-03:-

1. Clinical material is inadequate (Bed occupancy is 43.5% to 68% instead of 80% as required).
2. Space available in the OPDs. like Surgery, Orthopaedics, Obst. & Gynae., Eye and ENT, Pediatrics, continue to be in the same condition. The space available in these OPDs is less and need to be increased as per MCI norms.
3. No auditorium has been constructed so far in the college campus.
4. The college does not have its own rural health training centre. The rural health centre at Nareshwadi which is under the administrative and financial control of the college is at a distance of 70 kms. The supervision by the Community Medicine department continues to be poor because of this distance.
5. The college has provided only three rooms on the ground floor as hostel for girls at Sion. On the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> floor the facility is meant for boys hostel. So far no girl students are staying in the hostel. This arrangement of keeping the girls hostel in the same building along with the boys is not proper.
6. No quarters have been provided for teaching and non-teaching staff in the college campus.
7. No accommodation has been provided for non PG House Surgeons, Tutors/Demonstrators, Nursing Staff and Interns.
8. The same Medical Superintendent who is above the age of 65 years continues, hence, deficiency not complied with.
9. 800 MA x-ray machine has not been purchased so far and neither any time frame has been given to procure the CT Scan.
10. In the central casualty still there is no separate examination room/facility with wash area for examination of the patients. The casualty space continues to be less.
11. There is no separate central sterilisation department.
12. There is no mechanised laundry.

13. In some O.Ts. two operation tables are placed as reported in the last inspection report, hence deficiency not corrected.
14. Space is too less in the changing rooms for various staff members and pre and post operative areas.
15. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

The Executive Committee further noted the letter dated 20.2.2003 received from the Central Government forwarding therewith the compliance report submitted by the college authorities. On going through the compliance report it was noted that the reply given by the college authorities was vague. No time frame was given for completion of the same. The college authorities vide MCI letter dt. 27.2.2003 were requested to clarify the same and to send a detailed reply giving therein the time when the deficiencies will actually be rectified. In response to the letter, the Dean K.J.Somaiya Medical College, Mumbai vide letter dt 28.2.2003 has sent clarification giving therein the time frame for rectification of the same. The Committee observed that the compliance is still unsatisfactory and the whole time frame is prospective.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 50 to 100 at K.J. Somaiya Medical College, Mumbai.

55. **Chhatisgrah Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur - renewal of permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of students**

Read: the compliance received through the Central Govt. for renewal of permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of students at Chhattisgarh Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur.

The Executive Committee considered the letter dated 10<sup>th</sup> March, 2002 received from the Central Government, Ministry of Health & F.W. forwarding therewith a compliance report submitted by the college authorities on the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report and decided to verify the same by way of an inspection.

56. **To grant provisional/Permanent Registration to the candidates possessing foreign medical qualifications obtained from foreign countries u/s 12(2) & 13(4) where the candidates possessed either pass certificate or the provisional degree certificate.**

Read: the matter with regard to grant provisional/Permanent Registration to the candidates possessing foreign medical qualifications obtained from foreign countries u/s 12(2) & 13(4) where the candidates possessed either pass certificate or the provisional degree certificate.

The Executive Committee decided to defer the consideration of the matter for its next meeting.

57. **Appointment of Maj.Gen (Retd.) Virendra Singh for the post of Director, Pt. B.D.Sharma PGIMS, Rohtak.**

Read: the matter with regard to appointment of Maj.Gen. (Retd.) Virendra Singh for the post of Director, Pt. B.D.Sharma, PGIMS, Rohtak.

The Executive Committee decided to refer the matter back to the Teacher's Eligibility Qualification Sub-Committee for its consideration.

58. **Filling –up of the post of Principal, Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh on Deputation Basis – reg.**

Read: the matter with regard to filling up of the post of Principal, Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh on Deputation basis.

The Executive Committee considered the letter dated 20.2.2003 received from Dr. Krishan Vij, Prof. & Head of Forensic Medicine at Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh and did not accept for filling up of the post of Principal at Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh on deputation basis.

59. **To note the action taken on the inspection reports of Establishment of new medical colleges/renewal of permission in view of the letter dt 28.1.2003 received from the Central Govt.**

The Executive Committee noted the action taken on the inspection reports of Establishment of new medical colleges/renewal of permission in view of the letter dt 28.1.2003 received from the Central Govt.

60. **Regulations of the Council on Graduate Medical Education 1997-Migration rules modification thereon.**

Read: the matter alongwith the legal opinion for modification in the Migration rules contained in the regulations of the Council on Graduate Medical Education, 1997.

The Executive Committee noted that as per Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 under the Migration Rules, one of the compassionate grounds criteria for consideration of migration from one recognised medical college to another recognised medical college as given in Note 2 - 'death of a supporting guardian'. The application of definition of the supporting guardian was interpreted as under by the Hon'ble Delhi High Court vide its order dated 14.11.2000 in the matter of Shri Manas Kumar Dutta for his migration from Rural Medical College, Loni to Medical College, Calcutta:-

“If the word “guardian” alone had been used, it could mean guardian or natural guardian but when the word supporting guardian is mentioned, then this word includes a quasi guardian or a guardian of the poor also who is financially supporting the education of the student. These regulations being related to the education, will have to be interpreted in a manner which helps expansion of education and does not deprive a person of medical education in case the financial support which was available is no more available on account of death of the said guardian late Mr. Trisul Chatterjee. If the matter is seen in this light, the word “guardian” could have a larger connotation than what is understood



generally, and then insertion of the word “supporting” before “guardian” would certainly include a person who provides financial support for medical education of any student in any medical college. In this light, it appears that probably sensing this kind of interpretation, learned counsel for the respondent rightly submitted that if this court interprets the word “supporting guardian” in a wider sense, then the matter should be remanded for the appropriate decision of the Medical Council of India.

Learned counsel also appears to be justified in making submission that while exercising jurisdiction in the absence of any allegation of mala-fides, this court should concern itself about the decision making process and not with the actual judgement.”

The Committee further noted that the matter regarding application of “supporting guardian” as interpreted by the Hon’ble High Court was considered by it at its meeting held on 31.10.2002 where it was decided to obtain legal opinion.

The Executive Committee now considered the legal opinion obtained from the Council Advocate which interalia states as under:

“.....if the Council (on the basis of large number of applications being received) finds that the continuation of the word supporting is not being used properly or is being mis-used for seeking migration, then in my opinion, there would be no impediment in the Council considering the deletion of the word supporting from the relevant portion of the migration regulations. There would also be no impediment of the Council to decide to insert the word ‘natural’ in place of the word supporting before the word guardian – so as to prescribe the term ‘natural guardian’ in the migration regulations.

Needless to state, it is for the Council to take a decision in this regard on the basis of cogent and relevant reasons and upon objective consideration of this issue. It is reiterated that there is no legal bar for the Council to make a suitable and justified recommendations to the Central Government for either framing a new and/or amending any existing regulations, as stated above, on the basis of the objective consideration of the relevant factors”.

The Executive Committee decided that the word “supporting guardian” be replaced with “natural guardian” in the recommendations of the Council on Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 under Migration Rules in Note 2 “Death of a supporting guardian”.

61. **Removal of the name of deceased person from the Indian Medical Register.**

The Executive Committee noted the letter dated 12.11.2002 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council intimating that Dr. Brijandra Prashad (Regn. No.332 dt. 3.4.1961) has expired and his name has been erased from the register of Registered Medical Practitioners. The Committee decided to remove the name of above mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also to give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

62. **Removal of the name of deceased person from the Indian Medical Register.**

The Executive Committee noted the letter dated 6.3.2003 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council intimating that Dr. Om Prakash Yada (Regn. No.2095 dt. 12.8.1968) has expired and his name has been erased from the register of Registered Medical Practitioners. The Committee decided to remove the name of above mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also to give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

63. **Security in the premises of the Council Building.**

The Executive Committee considered the matter and decided to invite fresh tenders by public advertisement in leading dailies (atleast two English and one Hindi)

64. **Selection of (i) Deputy Secretary (Non-Medical) and (ii) Assistant Secretary in the office of the Medical Council of India.**

The Executive Committee approved the following recommendations of the Selection Committees which met in the Council Office on 26.2.2003 and 27.2.2003 respectively to select candidates for the post of (i) Deputy Secretary (Non-Medical) and (ii) Assistant Secretary (s), where the following were recommended for the posts as mentioned against each: -

- |     |                            |                                |
|-----|----------------------------|--------------------------------|
| (1) | Shri Ashok Kumar Harit     | Deputy Secretary (Non-Medical) |
| (2) | Sh. Surinder Swarup Sharma | Assistant Secretary            |
| (3) | Sh. Jagtar Singh           | Assistant Secretary            |

The Executive Committee further decided that the above posts be filled on deputation basis for a period of one year which may be extended at the discretion of the Executive Committee.

65. **Constitution of the DPC/Selection Committee for the post of Secretary, MCI, Zonal Inspectors and Administrative Officer.**

The Executive Committee decided as follows:

- (a) **Secretary, MCI-**  
(1) Dr. Indirajit Ray  
(2) Dr. Nitin Vora  
(3) Dr. D.K. Sharma
- (b) **Zonal Inspector**  
(1) Dr. Usha Sharma  
(2) Dr. F.U. Ahmed  
(3) Dr. B.P. Dubey
- (c) **Administrative Officer**  
(1) Dr. S.N. Mishra  
(2) Dr. Ajay Kumar

The Committee decided that in case of any causal vacancy the President may fill the same appropriately.

The Executive Committee decided to hold the next meeting of the Committee on 19<sup>th</sup> April, 2003 at 11 a.m. in the Council Office.

**( DR. K.K. ARORA )**  
**JOINT SECRETARY**

New Delhi, dated the  
13<sup>th</sup> March, 2003

**APPROVED**

**(Dr. P.C. Kesvankutty Nayar)**  
**President (Actg.)**

