

No.MCI-5(3)/2005-Med./

**MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA****EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 21<sup>st</sup> August, 2006 at 12 Noon in the Council office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110 075 where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20.11.2002 were also present.

\*\* \*\* \*

**Present:**

Dr..P.C. Kesavankutty Nayar	]President (Acting) ]Former Dean, ]Govt. Medical College, ]Trivandrum
Prof. P.N.Tandon	]Former Prof. & Head of Neuro- ]Surgery, A.I.I.M.S, New Delhi and ]Member, Adhoc Committee ]appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme ]Court
Prof. N. Rangabhashyam	]Emeritus & University Professor of ]Surgery, Dr. M.G.R. Medical ]University, Chennai and Member, ]Adhoc Committee appointed by the ]Hon'ble Supreme Court
Dr. K.P. Mathur	]Former Medical Superintendent, ]Ram Manohar Lohia Hospital, ]77, Chitra Vihar, ]Delhi-110092
Dr. D.K. Sharma	]Former Professor & Head, ]Department of Paediatrics, ]L.L.R.M. Medical College, ]Meerut
Dr. G.B. Gupta	]Prof. of Medicine, ]Pt.JNM Medical College, ]Raipur
Dr. Mukesh Kr. Sharma	]Deptt. of General Surgery, ]S.M.S. Medical College, ]Jaipur
Dr. G.K. Thakur	]Professor & Head, ]Department of Radiodiagnosis, ]S.K.Medical College, Muzaffarpur
Lt.Col. (Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad	- ]Secretary

The apology for absence was received from Dr. S. Kantha, Member, Adhoc Committee and Dr. B.C. Das & Dr. P.K. Sur, members of the Executive Committee.

**1. Establishment of new medical college at Palakkad, Kerala by Safe Development Alms Trust.**

Read: The compliance verification inspection reports (9<sup>th</sup> & 18<sup>th</sup> August, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Palakkad, Kerala by Safe Development Alms Trust u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council observed that as stated by the advocate of the Council, an order dated 07.08.2006 has been passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in WP [C] No. 326/2006 – Safe Development Alms Trust Vs. Union of India & Anr. observing that the MCI may carry out a compliance verification inspection and submit its report and recommendations to the Government of India on or before 28/08/2006.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection reports (09.08.2006 and 18.08.2006) alongwith the letter received from the college dated 11.08.2006 requesting that “an opportunity be given for presenting the staff as 09 August, 2006 was a religious auspicious day in South India – i.e. ‘Avni Avittam’ and ‘Raksha Bandhan’” and noted as under:-

1. The shortage of teaching staff is as under

(a) Faculty shortage is 40.6%

- i) Professor : 3 (Anatomy – 1, Physiology – 1, Biochem. - 1)
- ii) Associate Professor: 10 (Anatomy– 2, Physiology – 2, Biochemistry – 1, Pathology – 1, Microbiology – 1, Pharmacology – 1, Orthopaedic – 1, Radio Diagnosis – 1)
- iii) Assistant Professor 11 (Anatomy – 3, Physiology – 3, Pathology –1, Forensic Med.-1, Community Med.-1, Genl.Surg.-1 Ophthal. – 1)
- iv) Tutor : Nil

(b) Resident shortage is 13.1% as under:-

- i) Sr. Resident : 4 (General Med. –2, Paediatric – 1 & ENT -1)
- ii) Jr. Resident 1 (General Surgery –1)

2. Available clinical material is grossly inadequate as under :-

	Daily Average		Day of Inspection	
O.P.D. attendance	791		425	
Casualty attendance	65.7		8	
Bed occupancy%	79.33%		30%	
Operative work				
Number of major surgical operations	10.4		4	
Number of minor surgical operations	7.28		8	
Number of normal deliveries	01		0	
Number of caesarian Sections	0.57		1	
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	52.8	19.5	39	17
Ultrasonography	20.4	11	12	07
Special Investigations	2.8	1.4	1	2
C.T. Scan	-	-	-	-
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>				
Biochemistry	215.2	90.1	180	87
Microbiology	16.5	12.7	12	11
Serology	59.7	27	10	26
Parasitology	0.85	0.71	01	-
Haematology	584.28	174.85	384	170
Histopathology	0.25	3.25	01	01
Cytopathology	5.5	0.5	-	01
Others	-	-	-	-

- Bed occupancy figures submitted by the college authorities on the day of inspection was 83%. However, on scrutiny of the patients, majority of the cases were not found to be genuine. In actuality the bed occupancy was only 30% on the day of inspection.
  - Though, the wards were filled with so called patients, on scrutiny, it was found that OPD admission slips were available for less than 50% of the admitted cases. Evidence to the effect has been obtained in writing from the respective wards nurses duly countersigned by the respective HoDs and Medical Superintendent.
  - The statistics provided for the day of inspection (enclosed with the report) in respect of operative, radiological and laboratory investigations are far in excess of the actual calculated figures.
3. Dr. V.Baskaran continues to be the Medical Superintendent. He has only 8 years of administrative experience which is not as per norms. Dr. Baskaran is not qualified to hold the post of Medical Superintendent as Administrative experience of 10 yrs is required for the post of Medical Superintendent as per regulations.
  4. In the OT only one still camera has been fixed with no extension cable. CCTV is yet to be installed. Deficiency remains as it is.
  5. Registration counter is not cross linked with computer in the MRD as well as with the central laboratory. ICD X classification is not followed. Deficiency remains as it is.
  6. Paramedical staff is inadequate as under:-
    - Laboratory Technicians – 42\*
    - Laboratory Assistants – 2
    - Laboratory Attendants – 18
- \*The appointment letters of the laboratory technicians were not provided. The certificates of degrees and other qualifications were also not provided. Hence, they cannot be considered as Lab. Technicians. Deficiency remains as it is.
7. Nursing staff is grossly inadequate. Deficiency remains as it is.
  8. There are no cadavers in Anatomy Department. Deficiency remains as it is.
  9. No class rooms are available in the wards. Deficiency remains as it is.
  10. The rooms in the departments of Pharmacology, Microbiology, Pathology & Forensic Medicine are separated by wooden and aluminum partition only upto a height of 6 to 7 feet. Deficiency remains as it is.
  11. Medlar facility is not available in the Central library. Deficiency remains as it is.
  12. Other deficiencies and remarks in the reports.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision dated 14<sup>th</sup> & 15<sup>th</sup> June,2006 recommending to the Central Govt. to disapprove the scheme for establishment of new medical college at Palakkad, Kerala by Safe Development Alms Trust received u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956 and further reiterated that Central Govt. may consider debarring this college from any further consideration u/s 10A of the Act for a period of 2-3 years and for any further appropriate action by the Central Govt. to curb the menace of employment of teachers who have submitted fake and forged certificates of degrees and teaching experience.

2. **Establishment of new medical college at Beed by Aditya Education Trust, Beed.**

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (11<sup>th</sup> August, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Beed by Aditya Education Trust, Beed u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council observed that an order dated August 7,2006 has been passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in WP [C] No. 372/2006 – Aditya Education Trust, Beed Vs. Union of India & Anr. that “In the meanwhile, if any inspection is pending, the Medical Council of India/Dental Council of India would be at liberty to go on with the inspection and then file the status report before 28<sup>th</sup> August, 2006”. Accordingly, an inspection of the institute was conducted on 11<sup>th</sup> August,2006.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (11<sup>th</sup> August, 2006) and noted the following:-

1.(a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 52.54%

- |      |                     |    |  |
|------|---------------------|----|--|
| i)   | Professor           | 06 | (Anatomy-1, Physiology-1 Biochemistry-1<br>Pharma-1, Gen. Med.-1, Gen. Surgery-1)                                      |
| ii)  | Associate Professor | 12 | ( Anatomy-2, Physiology-2,Biochem-1<br>pathology-1, Micro-1, Paeds.-1,<br>Ortho-1, OBGY-1, Anaesthesia-<br>1, Radio-1) |
| iii) | Assistant Professor | 09 | (Anatomy-3, Physiology-1,<br>Lecture Biophysics-1, Forensic-1, Community<br>Medicine-1 ENT-1, Ophthal.-1)              |
| iv)  | Tutor               | 04 | (Anatomy-1, Physiology-1 Radiology-2)  |

(b) The shortage of Residents is 36.84% as under :-

- |     |              |   |
|-----|--------------|---|
| i)  | Sr. Resident | 8 ( Gen. Med-2, Paediatrics -1, Gen. Sur.-2,<br>Orthopedics-1 ,OBGY-2 ) |
| ii) | Jr. Resident | 6 (Gen. Med-4, Gen. Surgery-2, )  |

(c) The following faculty was not counted while computing faculty deficiency as under:-

S.N o.	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. Ambekar M.N.	Professor	Anatomy	No relieving order from previous institution. Not counted.

2. Clinical Material is grossly inadequate as under:

	Daily average	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	337	358
Casualty attendance	No separate casualty record. Record centralized with O.P.D. record.	07
No. of admissions / Discharge	69/53	50/24
Bed occupancy %	50%	41%
<b>Operative Work</b>		
Number of major surgical operations	0.69	--
Number of minor surgical operations	2.4	1

Number of normal deliveries	0.8		--	
Number of caesarian Sections	0.3		--	
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	2	2	1	--
Ultrasonography	--	--	--	--
Special Investigations	--	--	--	--
C.T. Scan	--	--	--	--
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>				
Biochemistry	7	4	4	2
Microbiology	--	--	--	--
Serology	4	4	2	4
Parasitology	--	--	--	--
Haematology	10	10	4	4
Histopathology	--	--	--	--
Cytopathology	--	--	--	--
Others – Clinical Pathology	--	--	--	--

- The clinical material is inadequate. The patients admitted in the wards are not of much clinical and teaching significance.
  - The operative workload is grossly inadequate. The Orthopaedic operative work has not yet started.
  - The central clinical laboratory is not having separate Biochemistry and Microbiology sections. Only the Pathology laboratory is functional in which all the clinical investigations are being done. The Blood Collection Centre is not properly equipped and is not following the laid down procedures for disposal of gloves and needles.
  - The radiology department is having only one 300mA static X-ray machine and one black and white ultrasound. No ultrasound has been done for last three months. The radiological work load is grossly inadequate. BARC permission and dosimeters are not available.
  - The casualty is ill equipped. The record of casualty is maintained alongwith general OPD register. Low casualty attendance was found on the day of inspection.
  - The ICCU and Medical ICU had 1 & 2 patients respectively on the day of inspection. The patients did not warrant admission.
  - Bed occupancy is low (41.00%).
  - 70% of the admissions were done on the day of Inspection.
3. In the OT's TV with camera attachment is not available.
  4. There is no separate Surgical, Gynae, Burn and Neonatal ICU. Bed occupancy was low in all the ICU's on the day of Inspection.
  5. No C arm is available in the O.T
  6. No. of static units are inadequate in Radiodiagnosis department. Protective measures as per BARC specification are not provided. No ultrasound has been done for the last three months.
  7. There is no CSSD.
  8. No incinerator is available. Biomedical waste disposal is non existent.
  9. The availability of Nursing staffs of different categories is grossly inadequate as under:- Total 2 Nursing Superintendents, 3 Deputy Nursing Superintendents, 7 Matrons, 18 staff nurses.
  10. The availability of para-medical staff of different categories is grossly inadequate as under:- 7 technical assistants and 14 other categories.
  11. There is no lecture theatre in the hospital. No Clinical demonstration rooms are available in OPD and wards.

12. Doctors duty room, nurses duty room, pantry, examination/procedure room, teaching area and side laboratory are not provided inside the wards. The Nursing station in each ward consists of a table and few chairs.
13. No Staff quarters are available for medical staff, Accommodation is available in the nurses hostel which is not as per norms.
14. There is no hostel for the residents.
15. In the Anatomy Department, the infrastructure is not as per Council Norms. The window panes are broken. The light and electrical fittings are not in place. There are no fans. The departmental library is not furnished and has 20 books. Dissection hall has no exhaust, no water supply and drainage facilities. Embalming room has no equipments. There is no band saw. Catalogues are not available in the museum. There is no cooling cabinet available. There are no X-rays and MRI displayed in the museum. Only one big room is available for the entire teaching staff of the department including the Head of Department. There is shortage of 1 Professor, 2 Associate Professors and 3 Assistant Professors. The department is non-functional.
16. In the department of Physiology, the infrastructure is not as per Council Norms. The window panes are broken. The light and electrical fittings are not in place. There are no fans. The laboratories do not have proper water and sewage connection. Departmental library has inadequate books. Research lab is ill equipped. Only one big room is available for the entire teaching staff of the department including the Head of Department. There is shortage of 1 Associate Professor, 1 Assistant Professor and 1 Lecturer Biophysics. The department is non-functional.
17. In the Biochemistry Department, Gas cylinders need to be kept in a separate enclosure. Departmental library has no books. Only one big room is available for the entire teaching staff of the department including the Head of Department. There is shortage of 1 Professor and 1 Associate Professor.
18. Other deficiencies and remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting held on 24.07.2006 recommending to the Central Government to disapprove the scheme for establishment of new medical college at Beed by Aditya Education Trust, Beed u/s 10 A of the Indian Medical Council Act,1956.

**Lt. Col. (Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad**  
**Secretary**

New Delhi, dated the  
21<sup>st</sup> August,2006

**A P P R O V E D**

**(Dr. P.C. Kesavankutty Nayar)**  
**President (Acting)**