

**No. MCI-5(3)/2015-Med.Misc./**

**MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA**  
**NEW DELHI**

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 28<sup>th</sup> October, 2015 at 11:00 a.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

**Present:**

Dr. Jayshree Mehta	<b>President</b> Medical Council of India, Former Professor of Surgery, Govt. Medical College, <b>Vadodara, Gujarat.</b>
Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham	Vice-President, Medical Council of India, Former Vice-Chancellor of Dr. M.G.R. Health University, <b>Tamil Nadu</b>
Dr. Radha Madhab Tripathy	Professor and Head, Department of Community Medicine, MKCG Medical College, <b>Berhampur.</b>
Dr. Anil Mahajan	Professor & HOD, General Medicine, Government Medical College, <b>Jammu, J&amp;K.</b>
Dr. V.N. Jindal	Vice Chancellor, S.R.K. University, <b>Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh</b>
Dr. Baldev Singh Aulakh	Professor of Urology and Transplant Surgery, Head Transplant Unit, Dayanand Medical College, <b>Ludhiana</b>
Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh	Professor & Head, Department Of Gastroenterology, Patna Medical College, <b>Patna, Bihar</b>
Dr. K K Gupta	Principal, LLRM Medical College Campus, Garh Road, <b>Meerut (UP)</b>

Dr. Reena Nayyar, Secretary I/c.

Apology for absence was received from Dr. G.B. Gupta and Dr. Ravindra H.N.

At the outset, the Committee was grieved to hear of the sudden demise of Prof. (Dr.) Ranjit Roy Chaudhury, former Member, Board of Governors, MCI and observed one minute condolence in reverence to the departed soul.

1. **Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 21<sup>st</sup> September, 2015 – Confirmation of.**

The Executive Committee of the Council confirmed the minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 21<sup>st</sup> September, 2015.

**2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the action taken on the minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 21<sup>st</sup> September, 2015.

**3. Pending Items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

**4. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Chandulal Chandrakar Memorial Medical College, Durg, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences, University, Raipur, Chhattisgarh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Chandulal Chandrakar Memorial Medical College, Durg, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences, University, Raipur, Chhattisgarh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (09<sup>th</sup> & 10<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith letter dated 05/10/2015 received from the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at Chandulal Chandrakar Memorial Medical College, Durg, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences, University, Raipur, Chhattisgarh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**5. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Hyderabad, Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Hyderabad, Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (10<sup>th</sup> & 11<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 10.73 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 53.73 % as detailed in the report.
3. Bed occupancy is 43 % (i.e. 202 out of 470) on day of assessment.
4. Workload of special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
5. Histopathology workload is only 2 on day of assessment.
6. Laboratory investigations workload is inadequate on day of assessment.
7. CT scan is not available.
8. OPD: Dark room & Refraction room in Ophthalmology OPD are combined.
9. There were only 2 Major & NIL Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment. Although 2 patients were waiting for operation in Orthopaedics O.T. it had not yet started till 10 a.m.
10. There is no separate septic labour room.

11. Lecture Theaters: Only 3 Lecture Theaters are available against requirement of 4. Hospital lecture theater is not of gallery type.
12. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is only 108 against requirement of 375.
13. Staff Quarters: Only 07 quarters are available for Non-teaching staff against requirement of 36 as per Regulations. Teaching staff quarters are taken on lease.
14. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.
15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the following recommendations of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015 with regard to MD (Pathology) of the said Institute:-

*"The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee had noted that the investigative work of all departments have been outsourced to a private laboratory, which is not permissible as per Regulations. However, the Dean and heads of the Departments did not disclose this information in the SAF and thus, the investigative data supplied by them is non-genuine. The Committee decided to seek explanation of Dean and heads of the departments of Biochemistry, Pathology and Microbiology about non-disclosure of this information.*

*The Committee is of the opinion that without these investigations being done in the department, the training of PG as well as UG students will be deficient and decided to refer this matter to the President, Medical Council of India for consideration along with their UG Assessment reports. A copy of the Assessor's remark in the department of pathology is enclosed for the kind perusal of the President.*

1. *License of blood bank is not in the name of the college. It is in name of Apollo Hospital Enterprises Ltd. Professor & Asso. Prof. of the college have no control over blood bank. Medical Officer i/c Blood Bank is not a staff member of the college.*
2. *The institute has entered into a MOU with for utilization of Apollo Hospital Enterprises Limited for service laboratories which is not as per Regulations.*
3. *Histopathology laboratory is a small laboratory where only grossing is done. Tissue is sent to corporate laboratory. The facility mentioned on SAF Part II, Page 16, Point 20 is with the corporate laboratory and not with the college itself. Pathologists working in corporate laboratory are not on staff of the college.*
4. *There is no service laboratory for Haematology in the department. All the samples collected are sent to the corporate laboratory and the department has no control over its functioning. Facility shown in SAF at Point 21, Page 16 are of the corporate laboratory & not in the college. Available faculty of the department are not involved in processing or evaluation of reports of these samples.*
5. *Workload of PT, APTT, TT is NIL. That of Bone Marrow aspiration is only 03/year.*
6. *There is no service laboratory for Clinical pathology. All the samples are sent to corporate laboratory.*
7. *Histopathology samples are 98 in 115 days implying daily average of < 1.*
8. *No instruments of modern technology are available in the department.*
9. *It is not clear whether Teachers & PGs would be permitted in corporate laboratory for training.*
10. *Cytopathology workload is NIL on day of assessment.*
11. *Pathological post-mortems are not performed."*

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Hyderabad, Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**6. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of IQ-City Medical College, Burdwan, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of IQ-City Medical College, Burdwan, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at IQ-City Medical College, Burdwan, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**7. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Murshidabad Medical College & Hospital, Murshidabad, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Murshidabad Medical College & Hospital, Murshidabad, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of MBBS students at Murshidabad Medical College & Hospital, Murshidabad, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**8. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Subbaiah Medical College & Hospital and Research Centre, Shimoga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Subbaiah Medical College & Hospital and Research Centre, Shimoga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith letter dated 14/09/2015 from the Principal, Subbaiah Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga and noted the following:-

1. The assessors were not allowed assessment by the institute citing a week's holiday in the college from 10/09/2015 to 17/09/2015 which is not permissible.

2. A functioning hospital cannot remain closed for a period of 1 week as it would seriously hamper clinical & teaching work schedule.
3. Leave letters of Medical Superintendent & Person who is looking after during his absence were not submitted.
4. Quick round of the hospital before the assessment was called off revealed empty OPDs with vacant chairs. Only 2 wards with 60-70 beds in each were seen & there were about 10 patients in each.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Subbaiah Medical College & Hospital and Research Centre, Shimoga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**9. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Maharishi Markandeshwar Medical College & Hospital, Solan, Himachal Pradesh under Maharishi Marakandeshwar University, Solan u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Maharishi Markandeshwar Medical College & Hospital, Solan, Himachal Pradesh under Maharishi Marakandeshwar University, Solan u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at Maharishi Markandeshwar Medical College & Hospital, Solan, Himachal Pradesh under Maharishi Marakandeshwar University, Solan u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**10. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Vardhman Institute of Medical Sciences, Pawapuri, Nalanda, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Vardhman Institute of Medical Sciences, Pawapuri, Nalanda, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 35.05 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 52.54 % as detailed in the report.
3. OPD: Separate registration counters for OPD/IPD are not available. There is only 1 examination room in each OPD against requirement of 4 in each department. In Ophthalmology OPD, Dark Room is not available. Teaching areas are not available.
4. Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	General Medicine	100	77	23
2	Paediatrics	40	30	10
3	Psychiatry	10	NIL	10
4	DVL	10	NIL	10
5	General Surgery	100	98	02
6	Orthopaedics	40	14	26

7	ENT	10	08	02
8	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	50	48	02
	TOTAL			85

5. Bed occupancy is 62 % against 75 % required.
6. There were only 04 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
7. Radiological Investigations: Only 03 plain X-rays were taken on the day of assessment. No other Radiological investigation was carried out.
8. Laboratory Investigations: Workload of Microbiology, Serology, Histopathology, Cytology is NIL on day of assessment. Overall laboratory investigations are inadequate.
9. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification is not used.
10. Casualty: Central O<sub>2</sub> & Central Suction are not available. No data of posting of Doctors & Nurses were provided. Defibrillator, Ventilator are not available.
11. O.T.s: \$ O.T.s are available against requirement of 5. There are no ceiling light, no modern equipment in all Major & Minor O.T.s. Equipment like Multipara Monitors, Defibrillators, Infusion Pumps are not available. Preoperative & Postoperative wards are not available.
12. ICUs: ICCU, MICU, SICU are not available.
13. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 mobile machine is available against requirement of 2 as per Regulations. Only 1 static X-ray machine of 100 mA capacity is available against requirement of 3 as per Regulations. CT Scan is not available. Only 1 USG machine is available against requirement of 2 as per Regulations; even this was non-functional at time of assessment.
14. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are not available.
15. Wards: Pantry is not available. Ancillary facilities are shared between departments.
16. Blood Bank: No data are available.
17. CSSD is not available.
18. Intercom is not available.
19. Examination Hall: It is not furnished.
20. Lecture Theaters: Hospital Lecture Theater is not available.
21. Central Library: Available books are only 1,560 against requirement of 4,000.
22. Central Research laboratory is not available.
23. Nursing staff: Only 24 Nurses are available against requirement of 198.
24. Website: It is not updated. Citizens' charter is not available.
25. Anatomy department: Cold storage facilities are not available. Museum facilities are inadequate.
26. RHTC: Facilities are inadequate as detailed in the report.
27. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Vardhman Institute of Medical Sciences, Pawapuri, Nalanda, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

11. **Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College, Barpeta, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College, Barpeta, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 23.58 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 10.44 % as detailed in the report.
3. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
4. CPC is not held.
5. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College, Barpeta, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**12. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture theater is yet to be furnished.
2. Central Library: Available books are 2,943 against requirement of 4,000 as per Regulations.
3. Students' Hostel: Available accommodation is 226 against requirement of 300 as per Regulations.
4. Nurses' Hostel: Available accommodation is 36 against requirement of 42 as per Regulations.
5. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in ICU on day of assessment.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**13. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Ashwini Rural Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Solapur, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Ashwini Rural Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Solapur, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of MBBS students at Ashwini Rural Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Solapur, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**14. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of North Delhi Municipal Corporation Medical College, Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of North Delhi Municipal Corporation Medical College, Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 21.25 % as detailed in the report.
2. Teaching Beds: There are 249 beds in General Medicine for 3 Units which is not as per Regulations.
3. There are only 02 Major Surgical operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment which is inadequate.
4. O.T.s: Surgery O.T. is shared with Orthopaedics; ENT O.T. is shared with Ophthalmology.
5. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available in any lecture theater. Hospital lecture theater is not available.
6. Central Library: Number of books available are 2,466 against requirement of 4,000 as per Regulations. Total 34 journals are available against requirement of 54.
7. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 70 against requirement of 150 as per Regulations.
8. Residents' Hostels: Available accommodation is 35 against requirement of 53 as per Regulations. Details of ancillary facilities are not provided.
9. Nurses' Hostel: Available accommodation is 28 against requirement of 37 as per Regulations. Details of ancillary facilities are not provided.
10. Residential Quarters: Only 4 quarters are available for faculty against requirement of 20. Only 20 quarters are available for non-teaching staff against requirement of 32.
11. MRD is manual.
12. Paramedical staff: Only 61 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 159.
13. Integrated teaching programme is not available.
14. Anatomy department: Mounted specimens available are only 45. Students' lockers are inadequate.
15. Pathology department: Available specimens are only 40. Only 3 catalogues are available.
16. Central Photography section is not available.
17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at North Delhi Municipal Corporation Medical College, Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.



15. **Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Shaheed Hasan Mewati Govt. Medical College, Nalhar, Mewat, Haryana under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Shaheed Hasan Mewati Govt. Medical College, Nalhar, Mewat, Haryana under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the matter for the next meeting.

16. **Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Bangalore, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Bangalore, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 15 % as detailed in report.
2. There were only 04 Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
3. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
4. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 4. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5.
5. Examination Hall: It is under construction; area which would be available is only 150 sq.m. against requirement of 250 sq.m.
6. Lecture Theaters: 3 lecture theaters are available against requirement of 4. E class facility is not available.
7. Central Library: Available seating capacity is 168 against requirement of 200. Only 6,268 books are available against requirement of 7,000. Most of these are old editions. No new books have been purchased in last 2 ½ years. Indian journals are inadequate. Library staff is inadequate. Internet Nodes are less.
8. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are smaller than required.
9. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 346 against requirement of 375.
10. Residents' Hostels: No spate hostel is available for male residents. Total accommodation available is for 40 Residents against requirement of 67.
11. Nurses' Hostel: No accommodation is available in the campus.
12. Residential Quarters: NIL staff quarters are available for faculty & non-teaching staff in the campus.
13. Dietician is not available.
14. Nursing staff: Only 205 Nurses are available against requirement of 247.
15. Details of number of Paramedical staff are not provided.
16. Anatomy department: Lockers are still kept in Stair case.
17. Community Medicine department: Demonstration room, Practical laboratory & Research laboratory are not in use.

18. RHTC: It is under dual control of Govt. of Karnataka & ESIC which is not permissible. It is owned by Govt. of Karnataka. Staff present during assessment was of Govt. of Karnataka. No roster of posting of college staff could be found. Residential accommodation is not available. Specialists' visits are not organized. Survey/Family Planning\MCH\Immunization registers could not be found on day of assessment. Transport arrangement is not available.
19. UHC: It is under dual control of Govt. of Karnataka & ESIC which is not permissible. It is owned by Govt. of Karnataka. Specialists' visits are not organized. Survey/Family Planning\MCH\Immunization registers could not be found on day of assessment.
20. Beds of Tb & Chest, Psychiatry and Skin & VD are shown separately in General Medicine wards.
21. Playground has been outsourced.
22. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Bangalore, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**17. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Sivagangai Medical College, Sivagangai, Tamilnadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Sivagangai Medical College, Sivagangai, Tamilnadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of MBBS students at Govt. Sivagangai Medical College, Sivagangai, Tamilnadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**18. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 14.14 % as detailed in the report.
2. Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	Paediatrics	40	30	10
2	Psychiatry	10	08	02
3	DVL	10	08	02

4	Tb & Chest	10	08	02
	TOTAL			16

3. There are only 10 Major & 08 Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
4. O.T.s: General Surgery & Obst. & Gyn. O.T. is shared. Emergency O.T. is not available.
5. ICUs: There is no clear-cut demarcation between ICCU, MICU & SICU.
6. Radiodiagnosis department: 300 mA static X-ray machine is non-functional. CT scan is not available.
7. MRD is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed.
8. Casualty: Only 10 beds are available against requirement of 15.
9. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are inadequate.
10. Examination Hall: It is not furnished.
11. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: No meeting of Pharmaco Vigilance Committee has taken place in the previous year.
12. Lecture Theaters: E class facility is not available in any lecture theater. Audiovisual aids are not available. Hospital lecture theater is not available.
13. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Available seating capacity is only 158 against requirement of 200. Only 31 journals are available against requirement of 40.
14. Central Photography Section: Staff & Equipment are not available.
15. Students' Hostels: Accommodation available is 224 against requirement of 300. Drainage system is not proper. In the boys' hostel, there is no lift which is G + 7 structure.
16. Residents' Hostels: Residents are not residing in the campus. Available accommodation is 32 against requirement of 59. Hygiene is poor. Ancillary facilities, mess are not available.
17. Nurses' Hostel: Hygiene is poor. Ancillary facilities, mess are not available.
18. Playground, outdoor games are not available.
19. Speech Therapy is not available.
20. Nursing staff: Only 150 Nurses are available against 198 required.
21. Teaching Programme is inadequate. CPC, Grand Rounds, Statistical Meetings, Seminars are not held.
22. Anatomy department: In museum, specimens are placed on slabs as racks are not available. Only 55 specimens are available. Stools are not available. MRI & CT films are not available. Embalming room is not demarcated. Inbuilt storage tank is not available.
23. RHTC: It is under control of Govt. of West Bengal. Specialists' visits are not organized. Students are not yet posted.
24. UHC: It is under control of Director ESIC & not under Dean. Only ESIC population is covered which is not permissible. No records/registers of MCH\Family Planning\Immunization\Surveys are available. Transport is not available.
25. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**Office Note:** The Executive Committee directed the office to send a stern letter to the Health Secretary of the respective States informing them that it had been observed that inspite of undertaking given by them in the preceding years on the basis of which permission had been granted by the Council for admission of fresh batch of students, deficiencies still persisted/were not rectified and therefore subsequent assessments/admissions would not be permitted. Copy of the letter be marked to the Central Government, Ministry of Health & F.W., Director

Medical Education of the concerned State, Dean of the respective college and Member(State Govt. nominee), MCI.

The Executive Committee of the Council further reiterated its earlier decision dated 14.03.2014 and 16.04.2014 and directed the office to once again write to all the concerned State authorities directing them to strictly enforce the three teaching cadres as prescribed in the MCI Teachers Eligibility Qualification Regulations, 1998.

**19. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela, Odisha under Sambalpur University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela, Odisha under Sambalpur University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 28.5 % as detailed in report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 25.7 % as detailed in the report.
3. OPD: Separate registration counters for male/female are not available. Separate registration counters for OPD/IPD are not available. No person was available at Enquiry Desk at 11:00 a.m. on day of assessment. Injection room is common for males & females. Dressing room is common for males & females. In Ophthalmology OPD, Dressing Room / Minor Procedure Room is not available. In Plaster Cutting Room, there is no plaster cutting scissors or saw. Minor O.T. is available but appears to be not in use. There is no ECG Technician in ECG room.
4. Teaching beds: There is shortage of 20 beds in Orthopaedics.
5. Wards: For Orthopaedics, 13 beds are shown in an empty hall & other 8 beds in verandah. These are naked beds without bed sheets. There is no Nursing Station. There were no patients on these beds. Pantry is without water supply or drainage.
6. Workload of special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
7. Data of bed occupancy and number of Major & Minor operations as provided by the institute could not be verified.
8. O.T.s: Only 4 O.T.s are available against requirement of 7; out of these 4, 1 is not having Boyle's apparatus. Proper facilities as detailed in report are not available in Minor O.T.
9. ICUs: Total 5 beds are available for ICCU & ICU against requirement of 5 beds separate for each. SICU has only 2 beds against requirement of 5 & there was no patient. PICU/NICU has 4 beds against requirement of 5. Equipment are inadequate.
10. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 mobile Units are available against requirement of 4. Only 2 static Units are available against requirement of 4. IITV is not in working order. Only 1 USG is available against requirement of 3.
11. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: No meeting of Pharmaco Vigilance Committee has taken place in the previous year.
12. Examination Hall: It is not available. It is under construction.
13. Lecture Theaters: Only 2 lecture theaters are available against 4 required as per Regulations. Hospital Lecture Theater is not in use. Old rusted chairs are placed. Audiovisual aids are not available. E class facility is not available.

14. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Even after repeated requests, area plan was not provided. Staff reading room & Residents' reading room are not available. Internet nodes are less.
15. Common rooms for Boys & Girls are not separate which is not permissible.
16. Central Photography Section: Staff & Equipment are not available.
17. Students' Hostels: Accommodation available is 288 against requirement of 375. Ancillary facilities are inadequate.
18. Residents' Hostels: Accommodation available is for 56 against requirement of 67. Some rooms are occupied by female non-medical employees of the trust. Other rooms are being used as patient cabins.
19. Nurses' Hostel: it is under construction.
20. Residential Quarters for Non-teaching staff are not available.
21. Gender Harassment Committee is not yet constituted.
22. Speech Therapist is not available.
23. MRD: ICD coding is improper and not correlating with the actual diagnosis.
24. Central O<sub>2</sub> & Central Suction are available but not functioning properly.
25. Pharmacy: Details of Pharmacy staff are not provided.
26. Intercom is not available.
27. Central Kitchen: It is in a verandah, filthy & unhygienic. There are no trained cooks or periodical medical examination of cooks.
28. Central research Laboratory: Equipment are not adequate; none is in working order.
29. Website: It is not totally updated. List of students admitted category wise, Toll free number to report ragging are not shown.
30. Anatomy department: Only 74 specimens are available. A small room was designated as Locker Room but no lockers are available. Number of cooling chambers are less. Half standard Dissection Tables are not available. (P. 33)
31. Audiovisual aids are not available in any Demonstration room of any department.
32. Pathology department: Only 85 specimens are available.
33. Microbiology department: Service laboratories are not available. Media preparation facility, Autoclaving, washing facility are not available.
34. Pharmacology department: There are NIL models, catalogues in museum. History of medicine charts are not available.
35. RHTC: There is no adopted population. It is in rented premises for 5 years. There is no record of posting of students. Residential accommodation is not available. Specialists' visits are not organized. Cold chain equipment is not available. No investigations are carried out. Haemoglobinometer tube is blocked with blood. No registers are available. No activities under National Health programmes are carried out.
36. UHC: It is a polyclinic. There is no facility for ante-natal women. All the chambers are of private practitioners. There is no adopted population. There is no record of posting of students. Specialists' visits are not organized.
37. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela, Odisha under Sambalpur University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**20. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Kannauj, Uttar Pradesh under King George's Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Kannauj, Uttar Pradesh under King George's Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following: -

1. Deficiency of faculty is 10.37 % as detailed in the report.
2. Bed occupancy is 60 % on day of assessment
3. There were only 06 Major operations for the whole hospital on the day of assessment.
4. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in PICU/NICU on the day of assessment.
5. Radiodiagnosis department: There are only 2 mobile X-ray machines against requirement of 4. There are only 3 static X-ray machines against requirement of 5. CT Scan is under repair.
6. Blood Bank: Only 3 Units are disbursed / day.
7. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
8. MEU: College is yet to start TOT for the faculty.
9. Lecture Theaters: MEU is not available.
10. Central Library: It is no air-conditioned.
11. Intercom is not available.
12. Anatomy department: MRI/CT films are not available in the museum. Disarticulated skeletons are inadequate.
13. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available.
14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of Govt. Medical College, Kannauj, Uttar Pradesh under King George's Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**21. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Chennai, Tamilnadu under the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Chennai, Tamilnadu under the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following: -

1. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of Hospital lecture theater is 100 against requirement of 150. E class facility is not available.
2. Speech Therapy is not available.
3. Wards: Male Psychiatry and Skin & VD patients are accommodated in TB ward. Female Psychiatry and Skin & VD patients are accommodated in female General Medicine ward.
4. There were only 07 Major operations on day of assessment.
5. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
6. CT Scan is under PPP tie up. Details of PPP are not provided.

7. Nursing staff: 175 Nurses are available against 198 required.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at ESIC Medical College, Chennai, Tamilnadu under the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**22. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Manjeri, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Manjeri, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 25 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 96.6 % as detailed in the report.
3. Outdoor recreation facilities are not available.
4. There are 2 hospital Superintendents. Dr. Bakubutty, Medical Superintendent has only 2 m of administrative experience; hence not eligible to hold the post.
5. OPD: Teaching area are not available. Cubicles are very small to accommodate doctors, Residents & students. Injection room is common for males/females. Dressing room is common for males/females. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are common. Sterility & Cancer Detection clinics are not available in O.G. OPD.
6. Wards: In all wards distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Nursing stations are common for several wards. Ancillary facilities like Treatment/Examination Room, Pantry, Duty Room, Demonstration Room are not available. There is no separate ward for Tb & Chest. General Surgery ward comprises of several cubicles which were private wards with narrow passage and which are unfit for being teaching beds. Ophthalmology ward is common for males/females. There is no separate ward for ENT. These patients are kept in Orthopaedics ward. All wards of O.G. are renovated & not in use. Patients were adjusted in Paediatrics, Surgery wards & floor beds. On many beds, there were 2 patients on 1 bed.
7. Faculty & resident space and Departmental office are located in a single room for all 10 clinical departments.
8. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not available.
9. ICUs: SICU is not in use.
10. Labour Room: Separate rooms for Septic & Eclampsia cases are not available.
11. Radiodiagnosis department: No mobile X-ray machine is available. Only 1 static machine is available against requirement of 3.
12. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available MEU: It is in a small room. Only a computer & printer are available.
13. CSSD: Receiving & Distribution points are not separate.
14. Examination Hall: Available capacity is 100 against requirement of 250.
15. Lecture Theaters: Only 2 lecture halls are available against requirement of 3 lecture theaters. They are not of gallery type. E class facility is not available.

16. Central Library: Available capacity of seating rooms for students is 100 against requirement of 300. Capacity of staff reading room is only 15 against requirement of 30. Residents' reading room is not available. No print journals are available. Internet nodes are less.
17. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 286 against requirement of 300. Total 14 rooms are 5 bedded which is not permissible. Mess is not available. Visitors' room is not available in Girls' Hostels. Study room is not available.
18. Residents' Hostel is not available.
19. Nurses' Hostel is not available.
20. Residential Quarters for faculty and Non-teaching staff are not available in the campus.
21. Nursing staff: 187 Nurses are available against requirement of 198.
22. Paramedical & Nonteaching staff: 140 paramedical & Nonteaching staff are available against requirement of 160.
23. Area of Demonstration rooms is smaller than required in Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology & Community Medicine departments:
24. Common rooms for Boys & Girls are small & not furnished.
25. MRD is partly computerized.
26. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Govt. Medical College, Manjeri, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

23. **Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Manyavar Kanshi Ram Ji Government Allopathic Medical College, Jalaun, Uttar Pradesh now known as Rajkiya Government Medical College, Jalaun, (Orai), Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Manyavar Kanshi Ram Ji Government Allopathic Medical College, Jalaun, Uttar Pradesh now known as Rajkiya Government Medical College, Jalaun, (Orai), Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 17.77 % as detailed in the report.
2. Bed occupancy is 41 % (i.e.. 158/380) on day of assessment.
3. On random verification, out of 8 Major operations shown by the institute, only 3 were found to be done.
4. There were NIL Normal Deliveries & NIL Caesarean Sections on day of assessment.
5. Radiological investigation workload is inadequate. Workload of special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL. Workload of CT Scan is NIL.
6. Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate. Workload of Microbiology, Serology, Histopathology is NIL. Histopathology & Cytopathology work is not done in the department.
7. Casualty: Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not available. Resuscitation equipment is inadequate. Disaster Trolley, Crash Cart, Ventilator are not available.
8. Central Clinical laboratory is not available.



9. O.T.s: 4 O.T.s are available against requirement of 5. Equipment like Infusion Pumps are not available. Emergency O.T. & Septic O.T. are not available.
10. ICUs: There was NIL patient in SICU, PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
11. Labour Room: There is no delivery after 20/09/2015. Eclampsia room is not available.
12. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 3. CT Scan is not available.
13. Audiometry room is not sound proof. Speech Therapy is not available.
14. MEU: It is not available.
15. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: No meeting has been held during the year.
16. Examination Hall: Available capacity is 100 against requirement of 250.
17. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture theater is not available. E class facility is not available in any lecture theater.
18. Central Library: Capacity of Students' reading room (inside) is 100 against requirement of 200. Students' reading room (outside) & Staff reading room are not furnished. Capacity of staff reading room is 10 against requirement of 20. Reading room for Residents is not available. Available books are only 1,700 against requirement of 4,000. Internet nodes are not available.
19. Central Photography Section is not available.
20. Students' Hostel: Building is not yet handed over to college authority. Visitors' room, A.C. study room & Computer room are not available.
21. Residents' Hostel: Building is not yet handed over to college authority. Visitors' room, A.C. study room & Computer room are not available.
22. Nurses' Hostel: Building is not yet handed over to college authority. Visitors' room, A.C. study room & Computer room are not available.
23. Residential Quarters: Quarters for staff are under construction. Quarters for Non-teaching staff are not yet handed over to college authorities.
24. Central Kitchen is not available.
25. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
26. Nursing staff: Only 104 Nurses are available against requirement of 180.
27. Paramedical & Nonteaching staff: Only 30 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 160.
28. Website: It is not updated. Information provided is sketchy.
29. Anatomy department: In museum, there is no seating arrangement. Only 73 specimens are available. Cadavers are less.
30. Pathology department: Only 24 specimens are available. There are NIL catalogues.
31. Microbiology department: Students' Laboratory is small. Facilities are inadequate. There is no museum.
32. Pharmacology department: There is no Clinical Pharmacology laboratory. Museum does not have specimens or models.
33. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students at Manyavar Kanshi Ram Ji Government Allopathic Medical College, Jalaun, Uttar Pradesh now known as Rajkiya Government Medical College, Jalaun, (Orai), Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**24. Election of a Member of MCI under section 3(1)(c) of IMC Act, 1956 i.e. Registered Medical Graduate Constituency Proposal Submitted by Dr. Sudipta Roy, Member, MCI.**

Read: the matter with regard to election of a Member of MCI under section 3(1)(c) of IMC Act, 1956 i.e. Registered Medical Graduate Constituency - proposal submitted by Dr. Sudipta Roy, Member, MCI.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that at its meeting held on 05/08/2015, the following was decided:

*“The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 25.06.2015 of Dr. Sudipto Roy, Member, MCI and approved the following proposal with regard to election of a Member u/s 3(1)(c) of IMC Act 1956 as per Rules framed for this purpose i.e. Indian Medical Council Rules 1957:-*

<i>Existing</i>	<i>Proposed</i>
<i>2(d) ‘Returning Officer’ means nay officer appointed as such by the Central Government for the purposes of these rules;</i>	<i>2(d) ‘Returning Officer’ means any officer appointed as such by the Central Government from a panel of such officers maintained by MCI.</i>

*Before proceeding further, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to take legal opinion from whether MCI is competent to make such a suggestion since Section 32 refers to power of Central Govt. to make Rules which does not require reference to or recommendation from MCI.”*

In this regard, the Executive Committee of the Council perused the opinion of Law Officer as under:

*“... 4. Be that as it may, the Council is a stakeholder in the process of its constitution under section 3 of the IMC Act, 1956. Therefore, in order to ensure that the elections from the State Medical Council for a nominee to the MCI are conducted in free, fair, impartial and transparent manner, the Council is well within its right to make a suggestion in this regard for law reform to the appropriate authorities of the Central Government.”*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the proposed amendment as approved by the Executive Committee be placed before General Body of the Council.

**25. Matter with regard to Ragging at Rajendra Instt of Medical Sciences, Ranchi.**

Read: the matter with regard to ragging at Rajendra Instt of Medical Sciences, Ranchi.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the matter with regard to a complaint of ragging received from various batches of students of Rajendra Instt. of Medical Sciences, Ranchi was considered by the Administration & Grievance Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 08.09.2015 wherein it was decided as under:-

*“...Since the college authorities have failed to curb the menace of ragging i.e. ineffective/non-existent Anti Ragging Committee, resulting in wide spread ragging in the college and acts of indiscipline, like putting different type of flags in the hostel and other anti-social activities by the students, the Committee decided that no application from the college should be entertained for increase of seats received u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 during current year.....”*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain the legal opinion from the Law Officer of the Council.

**26. Renewal of Permission against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2014-15 and 2015-16 of MVJ Medical College and Research Hospital, Bangalore.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of Permission against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2014-15 and 2015-16 of MVJ Medical College and Research Hospital, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed the sequence of events as under:-

1. The college applied for increase of seats from 100-200 vide letter dated 26.11.2010 for the academic year 2011-12. The college vide letter dated 14.03.2011 requested the Council to consider their request for increase of seats from 100-150 for the academic year 2011-12.
2. The same was disapproved by the Council due to various deficiencies pointed out in the assessment reports.
3. The college authorities challenged the letter dated 30.06.2011 issued by the Council disapproving the application for increase of seats before the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka in W.P. No. 27771/2011 (EDN-RES) & 29700-29748/2011. The Hon'ble High Court vide its order dated 22/08/2011 has passed impugned order in W.P. No. 27771/2011 (EDN-RES) & 29700-29748/2011 filed by MVJ Medical College & Research Hospital, Bangalore, which allowed the college to admit 150 students for the academic year 2011-12 subject to the result of the writ petition.
4. As per above Court order, the college admitted 150 students for the academic year 2011-12.
5. The Council office had filed an SLP (C) No. 27315/2011 before the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India against the impugned order dated 22/08/2011 of the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka at Bangalore.
6. The college only admitted 100 students during the academic year 2012-13.
7. The college applied again a fresh application for increase of seats from 100-150 for the academic year 2013-14. Letter of Permission was issued by the Council for increase of seats from 100-150 for the academic year 2013-14.
8. Meanwhile, the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India vide its order dated 16.08.2013 in SLP No. 27315/2011, decided not to disturb the admissions made in obedience to the Order of the Division Bench of the High Court of Karnataka for the academic Year 2011-12 admitting 150 students and also directed to ratify the same in view of the subsequent approval by the Medical Council of India for the enhanced strength of 150 students for the academic year 2013-14.
9. Accordingly, it was decided to assess the college for 3<sup>rd</sup> renewal i.e. 4<sup>th</sup> batch for the academic year 2014-15.
10. However, while communicating the decision of the Executive Committee for renewal of permission for 4<sup>th</sup> batch for increase of seats from 100-150, it was wrongly sent by the Council for renewal of permission for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch for the academic year 2014-15.
11. Accordingly, the renewal was granted to the college for increase of seats for 4<sup>th</sup> batch in 2015-16.
12. However, as per the direction of the Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 16.08.2013, now the college is due for recognition against the increase of seats from 100-150 for the academic year 2016-17.
13. The Central Govt. vide letter dated 27.08.2015 has forwarded the request of the college received through the Registrar, Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 to arrange for the MCI inspection to verify Standard of Examination and other teaching facilities for the purpose of recognition of increase intake from 100 to 150 of UG seats at MVJ Medical College & Research Hospital, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter and decided to carry out assessment of the Institute for recognition of increased intake from 100 to 150 in respect of the batch admitted in 2011 pursuant to order of Hon'ble Karnataka High Court and which was not disturbed by Hon'ble Supreme Court.

**27. Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of lecture theaters is 100 against requirement of 240. 3 lecture halls are not gallery type.
2. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is for 640 students against requirement of 750.
3. Interns' Hostel: Available capacity is 100 against requirement of 200.
4. O.T.s: There are 16 tables in 8 O.T.s which is not as per norms.
5. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
6. Anatomy department: Cold storage facilities are not available. MRI/CT films are not available in museum. Only 10 cadavers are available which is less.
7. Pathology department: Catalogues are not available in museum. IHC is not in working order.
8. Microbiology department: Practical laboratory is not in working order. Only 5 service laboratories are available against requirement of 7.
9. Pharmacology department: Museum facilities are inadequate as detailed in the report.
10. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available. Cold chain equipment is not available.
11. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**28. Recognition/Approval of Karnataka Institute of Medical Sciences, Hubli for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Karnataka Institute of Medical Sciences, Hubli for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21.09.2015) along with assessment reports (05.05.2015, 04.03.2015 and 11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> January, 2014) and decided to recommend recognition/approval of Karnataka Institute of Medical Sciences,

Hubli against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore and decided to recommend to the Central Government for approval u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats at Karnataka Institute of Medical Sciences, Hubli for the academic year 2016-2017.

**29. S.V.S. Medical College, Mahabubnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.V.S. Medical College, Mahabubnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith recalculated sheet also submitted by the Assessors vide letter dated 28.09.2015 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of S.V.S Medical College, Mahabubnagar under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**30. Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundation's Medical College, Ahmednagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundation's Medical College, Ahmednagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundation's Medical

College, Ahmednagar under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for the academic year 2016-17.

**31. Kilpauk Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Kilpauk Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Kilpauk Medical College, Chennai under The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai for the academic year 2016-17.

**32. R.G. Kar Medical College, Kolkata – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to R.G. Kar Medical College, Kolkata – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith compliance dated 12.09.2015 received from the Dean, R.G. Kar Medical College, Kolkata and noted the following:-

1. Radiodiagnosis department: 3 static machines are available against requirement of 6. AERB approval is not available for some machines. PNDDT approval is available for only 1 USG.
2. Anatomy department: Number of Dissection tables are inadequate. Microscopes are less. Lecture hall is in very bad condition. Specimens are less.
3. Overall cleanliness is poor in college & hospital.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of R.G. Kar Medical College, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata for the academic year 2016-17.

**33. Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (10<sup>th</sup> & 11<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad under Krishna

Institute of Medical Sciences University (Deemed University) Karad for the academic year 2016-17.

**34. Narayana Medical College, Nellore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Narayana Medical College, Nellore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Narayana Medical College, Nellore under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**35. Christian Medical College, Vellore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Christian Medical College, Vellore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Christian Medical College, Vellore under The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR University, Chennai for the academic year 2016-17.

**36. Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Amritsar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Amritsar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Amritsar under Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot for the academic year 2016-17.

**37. Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

- Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	Paediatrics	90	60	30
2	General Surgery	150	120	30
3	Orthopaedics	90	60	30
4	O.G.	90	65	25
	TOTAL			115

- In ENT & Ophthalmology, distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m required as per Regulations.
- Bed occupancy on day of assessment is 465 beds out of 605 available beds. When considered against requirement of 720 beds, it is only 64.58 % which is inadequate.
- Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
- OPD: Dressing room is common for males & females
- MRD: Medical Records Officer is not available.
- O.T.: Ophthalmology O.T. has 2 tables which is not as per norms. There is a common Defibrillator amongst the O.T. complex.
- ICUs: Central ABG machine is not located in any of ICUs.
- One 300 mA X-ray machine was non-functional on day of assessment. Resultantly, there is shortage of 2 static X-ray machines.
- Pharmacology department: Charts & models are not available in the museum.
- Forensic Medicine department: Catalogues are not available in the museum.
- Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain under Vikram University, Ujjain for the academic year 2016-17.

**38. Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith compliance dated 10.09.2015 received from the Dean, Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior and noted the following:-

- Deficiency of teaching faculty is 10.60 % as detailed in the report
- Lecture Theater: Capacity of 1 lecture theater in college is 150 against requirement of 180. Capacity of Hospital lecture theater is 120 against requirement of 200. Audiovisual aids are not available.
- Central Library: Available area is 1,200 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. Capacity of Students' reading room (outside) & Students' reading room (inside) is 55 & 65 respectively against 150 required for each.



4. Common Rooms for Boys: Attached toilets are not available.
5. Students' Hostel: Hygiene is not proper. Electrical wires are open which is a potential hazard. Ancillary facilities like Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet are not available.
6. Interns' Hostel is not available.
7. Residents' Hostel: Available accommodation is 51 against requirement of 115. Toilet facilities are inadequate. Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet are not available. Hygiene is not proper.
8. Nurses' Hostel: Available accommodation is 50 against requirement of 53. Toilet facilities are inadequate. Hygiene is not proper.
9. Residential Quarters: Only 25 quarters are available for faculty against requirement of 30. NIL quarters are available for non-teaching staff.
10. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
11. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
12. Physiology department: One Demonstration Room has no furniture & its capacity is less.
13. Pathology department: Library books are few & no recent books & journals are available. Lighting & fans are not sufficient in museum.
14. Microbiology department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2.
15. Pharmacology department: There is no furniture in Demonstration Room. There are no fans & Light is not sufficient in the museum.
16. Forensic Medicine department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. There is no furniture. Lighting in Mortuary is inadequate. There is no visitors' room. Cold storage facility is not available.
17. Community Medicine department: There is no catalogue in the museum.
18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior under Jiwaji University, Gwalior for the academic year 2016-17.

**39. Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree (140 seats).**

Read: the matter with regard to Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree (140 seats).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (18<sup>th</sup> & 19<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith compliance dated 10.09.2015 received from the Dean, Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 10.34 % as detailed in the report
2. OPD: Waiting area for patients is inadequate.
3. Audiologist & Speech Therapist are not available.
4. Wards: Pantry & Demonstration Rooms are not available in many wards.
5. Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	Psychiatry	15	10	05
2	Skin & VD	15	07	08
	TOTAL			13

6. There were only 05 Major & NIL Minor Surgical operations on day of assessment.
7. Workload of CT Scan was NIL on day of assessment.
8. NIL Special investigations like Ba, IVP were performed on day of assessment.
9. MRD is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
10. ICUs: There were 2 patients on 1 bed in PICU.
11. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6.
12. Lecture Theater: One lecture theater of capacity 250 is not available. Hospital lecture theater is not available.
13. Central Library: Available area is 974 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. Budget for 2014-2015 is not received.
14. Central Photography Section is not available.
15. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 374 against requirement of 565.
16. Nurses' Hostel: Available accommodation is 16 against requirement of 75.
17. Anatomy department: Cold storage facility is shared with Forensic Medicine department.
18. Pathology department: Facilities in Practical laboratory (Sink, Taps, Tube Lights) need to be upgraded.
19. Microbiology department: Immunology & Tuberculosis service laboratories need to be upgraded.
20. Community Medicine department: Museum needs upgradation.
21. RHTC: It is not under administrative control of Dean. It is at a distance of 40 km. & commuting time is more than 1 hour. PGs & Interns do not stay there. Mess is not available.
22. UHC: It is not under administrative control of Dean.
23. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140 to 150 as well as continuation of recognition of 140 MBBS seats at Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal under Barkatullah University, Bhopal for the academic year 2016-17.

**40. Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 15.4 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 15 % as detailed in the report.
3. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload is 04 each on day of assessment.
4. Casualty: Separate Casualty for Obstetrics is not available.

5. CT Scan is outsourced.
6. No details of AERB approval are provided.
7. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available in Hospital Lecture Theater.
8. Central Photography Section is not available.
9. Students' & Interns' Hostel: Total accommodation for students & interns available is 324 against total requirement of 390.
10. RHTC: It is not under administrative control of Dean. It is actually a CHC. PGs & Interns are not staying at RHTC. Mess is not available. Separate registers for Survey/MCH/Immunization/Family Planning are not available. CHC registers are shown as RHTC registers which is not as per norms. Family folders are not prepared. No community services are provided. No transport facility is available.
11. UHC: It is not under administrative control of Dean. It is actually a UFWC. Staff from department is not posted at UHC. UHFC registers are shown as UHC registers which is not as per norms. Family folders are not prepared. No community services are provided. No transport facility is available.
12. MEU is not active unit.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa under A.P. Singh University, Rewa for the academic year 2016-17.

**41. MGM Medical College, Indore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to MGM Medical College, Indore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (18<sup>th</sup> & 19<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith compliance dated 08.09.2015 received from the Dean, MGM Medical College, Indore and noted the following:-

1. Lecture Theater: Hospital lecture theater is not of gallery type.
2. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Available area is 1,334 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. Seating capacity of Students' Reading Room (Inside) is 106 against requirement of 150. Capacity of staff reading room is 10 against requirement of 30.
3. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 446 against 565.
4. OPD: Injection Room & ECG room in Medicine OPD are in the same room. There is no separate clinic for Sterility Clinic & Cancer Detection Clinic in O.G. OPD.
5. Casualty: Defibrillator, Ventilator & Mobile X-ray Unit are under lock & key.
6. CT Scan is under PPP mode with SRL Laboratories. Details of PPP mode are not provided.
7. Central Research Laboratory is only space. Facilities are yet to be added.
8. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: 174 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 182.
9. Biochemistry department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against requirement of 2.
10. Microbiology department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against requirement of 2. Service Laboratories are not available.

11. Pharmacology department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against requirement of 2. Experimental Pharmacology Laboratory is under renovation.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140 to 150 at MGM Medical College, Indore under Devi Ahilya Bai Vishwa Vidyalaya, Indore for the academic year 2016-17.

**42. Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad– Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad– Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the matter for the next meeting.

**43. Netaji Subash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Netaji Subash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (18<sup>th</sup> & 19<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) alongwith compliance dated 12.09.2015 received from the Dean, Netaji Subash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 16.07 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 10 % as detailed in the report.
3. OPD was 679 on day of assessment.
4. Radiological investigation workload is inadequate.
5. CT Scan is outsourced. Details of outsourcing are not provided.
6. Separate MRD is not present.
7. Only 2 preoperative beds & 2-4 postoperative beds are available.
8. Lecture Theater: Hospital lecture theater does not have E class facility.
9. Students' Hostels: A.C. study room with Internet & Computer is not available. Hygiene of hostels is not satisfactory.
10. Microbiology department: Capacity of 1 Demonstration Room is less.
11. RHTC: Financial control is with CMHO.
12. UHC: Financial control is with CMHO.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Netaji Subash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur under Rani Durgavati Vishwavidyalaya, Jabalpur for the academic year 2016-17.

**44. Andhra Medical College, Visakhapatnam – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Andhra Medical College, Visakhapatnam – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Examination Hall; A single hall of 500 capacity is available against requirement of 3 of capacity 250 each.
2. Lecture Theaters: Two lecture theaters are of flat type which is not as per Regulations. E class facility is not available. One lecture hall has only seating facility without desks which is not as per norms.
3. Central Library: Available area is less than requirement of 3,200 sq.m. Capacity of Students' Reading Room (Outside) & Students' Reading Room (Inside) is 102 & 138 respectively against requirement of 200 each. Staff reading room has capacity of 4 persons. Internet nodes are less.
4. Residential Quarters: Only 22 quarters are available for non-teaching staff against requirement of 37.
5. OPD: Capacity of teaching area is small.
6. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m as prescribed under the Regulations. Pantry is not available in any ward. Capacity of several Demonstration wards is less.
7. MRD is manual.
8. Intercom is not available.
9. Website: Details of members of Gender Harass Committee are not provided. Toll free number to report ragging is not provided.
10. RHTC: Mess is not available.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 at Andhra Medical College, Visakhapatnam under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**45. Lala Lajpat Rai Memorial Medical College, Meerut – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Lala Lajpat Rai Memorial Medical College, Meerut – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 19.7 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 17.2 % as detailed in the report.
3. Teaching Beds: NIL beds are available in Psychiatry against requirement of 14.
4. O.T.s: O.G. O.T. has 4 tables in 1 O.T., Ophthalmology O.T. has 3 tables in 1 O.T. & 2 tables in another O.T., Orthopaedics O.T. has 2 tables and ENT O.T. has 2 tables in 1 O.T. which is not as per norms.

5. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5. CT Scan is not available.
6. Laparoscopic sterilization is being done without Anaesthesia with the patient shouting which is unsafe & dangerous.
7. Unit composition of Medicine & Surgery departments is not complete.
8. Histopathology workload is only 04 on day of assessment.
9. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available.
10. Central Library: Available area is 1,200 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m.
11. MRD: Staff is inadequate. ICD X classification is not followed for indexing.
12. Nursing staff: Only 179 Nurses are available against requirement of 223.
13. Microbiology department: Service laboratories are inadequate. Museum is not available.
14. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available. Mess is not available. Specialists' visits are not regular.
15. UHC: No students are posted. Specialists' visits are not organized. There is no display board outside.
16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Lala Lajpat Rai Memorial Medical College, Meerut under Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut for the academic year 2016-17.

**46. Govt. Siddhartha Medical College, Vijayawada – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Govt. Siddhartha Medical College, Vijayawada – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 10.59 % as detailed in the report.
2. ICUs: Details of patients in ICCU & ICUs are not provided.
3. Only 4 static X-ray machine are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. IITV & Fluoroscopy are not available.
4. Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m in most of wards. Some of wards do not have Examination room, Pantry, etc. Demonstration room of General Surgery ward is small.
5. Blood component separation facility is not available.
6. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
7. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are not available.
8. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is for 464 students against requirement of 565.
9. There is no separate hostels for Interns.
10. Residential Quarters for faculty & Non-teaching staff are not available.
11. RHTC: It is functioning in a Panchayat community hall. It is not under control of Principal. Residential accommodation is not available. Amongst specialists, visits of only Paediatricians are organized.
12. UHC: It is under control of Municipal Corporation & not under control of Principal.
13. Principal's room is very small.
14. MEU is not as per MCI norms.
15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Govt. Siddhartha Medical College, Vijayawada under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**47. Kannur Medical College, Kannur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Kannur Medical College, Kannur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (28<sup>th</sup> & 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 34.05 % (i.e. 47 /138) as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 49.4 % (i.e. 42/85) as detailed in report.
3. Teaching Beds: Although space for total 650 beds exists, due to renovation, lot of adjustment has been made in various wards.
4. OPD attendance is given by the college as 1353 on day of assessment which appears to be exaggerated. Modest attendance was there.
5. There were only total 71 patients in the whole hospital as per observation of assessors giving bed occupancy of 10.14 % only. The figures given by the institute of 118 admissions & bed occupancy of 93 % on day of assessment are false.
6. There were total 10 major operations listed on day of assessment.
7. There were NIL Normal deliveries & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
8. The figures of Radiological & laboratory investigations look doubtful looking into bed occupancy of 10.14 %.
9. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available.
10. There was NIL patient in ICCU, SICU & NICU/PICU & only 1 in MICU on day of assessment.
11. Only 5 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6 as per Regulations.
12. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6 as per Regulations.
13. Examination Hall: There are 2 examination halls with capacity of 100 each against requirement of capacity of 250.
14. Lecture Theaters: There are 3 lecture theaters of capacity 180 against requirement of 4 as per Regulations.
15. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.
16. Interns' Hostel: Available accommodation is for 64 interns against requirement of 100 as per Regulations.
17. Nursing staff: Only 237 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 372.
18. CSSD was closed at 5 p.m. indicating not much of emergency work.
19. Facility of Videography was not provided to one of assessors.
20. Declaration Forms were not ready. Signatures of the concerned faculty, HOD & Dean were made on the spot in several cases.
21. Several Annexures as detailed in report were not provided in spite of repeated requests.
22. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s

10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Kannur Medical College, Kannur under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur for the academic year 2016-17.

**48. Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (28<sup>th</sup> & 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpaatu under The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai for the academic year 2016-17.

**49. Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal– Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal– Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (28<sup>th</sup> & 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 at Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**50. U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Saifai, Etawah– Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Saifai, Etawah– Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Saifai, Etawah under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur for the academic year 2016-17.

**51. Patna Medical College, Patna - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Patna Medical College, Patna - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.



The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 22.85 % as detailed in the report.
2. Dean Dr. S.N. Sinha has only 4 y experience as Professor against minimum 5 y required as per Regulations.
3. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4.
4. MEU: TOT programme is yet to start.
5. Lecture Theaters: Only 2 lecture theaters of 150 capacity each are available against requirement of 3 of capacity 180 each. Hospital lecture theater is not available.
6. Central Library: Capacity of Students' seating room (outside) is 50 against requirement of 150. Capacity of staff reading room is 25 against requirement of 50. Internet nodes are not available.
7. Common rooms for Boys & Girls are under construction.
8. MRD: It is not computerized.
9. Anatomy department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. There are only 80 specimens. Separate cold storage is not available. Available cadavers are only 6.
10. Physiology department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. Capacity of available Demonstration room is less.
11. Biochemistry department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. Capacity of available Demonstration room is less.
12. Pathology department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. Capacity of available Demonstration room is less.
13. Microbiology department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. Capacity of available Demonstration room is less.
14. Pharmacology department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2.
15. Community Medicine department: Only 1 Demonstration room is available against requirement of 2. Capacity of available Demonstration room is less.
16. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available.
17. Demonstration rooms & teaching areas are lacking in OPD & wards.
18. For PG courses, Teacher: Student ratio is not as per norms.
19. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Patna Medical College, Patna under Aryabhata Knowledge University, Patna for the academic year 2016-17.

**52. S.M.S. Medical College, Jaipur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.M.S. Medical College, Jaipur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of available 4 lecture theaters in the college is 250 against requirement of 300 each. Capacity of available lecture theater in the hospital is 120 against requirement of 300. Facility for E class is available only in 1 lecture theater.
2. Area of Common Rooms for Boys & Girls is smaller than required.

3. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 915 against requirement of 938. There is no A.C. study room with computer & Internet in Girls' hostels. Some rooms are not having adequate furniture.
4. Interns' Hostel is not available.
5. Residential Quarters: 36 quarters are available for teaching faculty against requirement of 38.
6. Wards: Pantry is not available in any ward. Demonstration rooms & Duty room are not available in several wards.
7. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not followed.
8. Casualty: Disaster Trolley is not available.
9. Anatomy department: Dissection Hall is smaller. Demonstration rooms are smaller than required.
10. Physiology department: There is gross deficiency of space in laboratories & Demonstration Rooms.
11. Biochemistry department: There is deficiency of space in laboratories & Demonstration Rooms. Equipment like pH meter, Distillation apparatus, water bath are not available in adequate quantity. Electrophoresis machines are not in working order.
12. Demonstration rooms of Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Forensic Medicine, Community Medicine departments are inadequate in number.
13. RHTC: Mess is not in working order. Paramedical staff like Male Social Worker, Male Health Assistant, Health Educator are not available.
14. UHC: It is not in rented premises. LMO is not available. Specialists' visits are not organized. Paramedical staff like Male Health Worker is not available.
15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 at S.M.S. Medical College, Jaipur under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur for the academic year 2016-17.

**53. Mahatma Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Wardha - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 65-100 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Mahatma Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Wardha - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 65-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 10 % (i.e. 13/128) as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 13.8 % (i.e. 10/72) as detailed in the report  
Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.
3. Histopathology workload is NIL on day of assessment.
4. MRD: It is partly computerized.
5. Casualty: Available beds are 16 against requirement of 20 as per Regulations. Disaster Trolley, Emergency Drug Tray are not available.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 65 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Mahatma Gandhi Institute of Medical

Sciences, Wardha under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nasik for the academic year 2016-17.

**54. R.N.T. Medical College, Udaipur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to R.N.T. Medical College, Udaipur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 10 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 11 % as detailed in report.
3. Examination Hall: Capacity available is 200 against 250 required.
4. Interns' Hostel is under construction.
5. MRD: It is partially computerized.
6. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
7. There is no Medical Social Worker in RHTC.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at R.N.T. Medical College, Udaipur under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur for the academic year 2016-17.

**55. Dr. S.N. Medical College, Jodhpur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Dr. S.N. Medical College, Jodhpur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 11.3 % as detailed in the report.
2. There are only 6 Units in department of General Surgery against requirement of 8.
3. CSSD: It runs only in 1 shift from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.
4. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of 1 lecture theater in the college is 200 against requirement of 300. E class facility is available only in 1 lecture theater.
5. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 559 against requirement of 938.
6. Interns' Hostel: Accommodation available is 64 against requirement of 150.
7. Residential Quarters: Only 17 quarters are available for non-teaching staff against requirement of 38.
8. MRD: It is computerized but not linked with server.
9. RHTC: Specialists' visits include only O.G.
10. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s

10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Dr. S.N. Medical College, Jodhpur under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur for the academic year 2016-17.

**56. Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 16.58 % as detailed in the report.
2. OPD: Computerization of Registration Counters is in process.
3. OPD attendance was only 387 on day of assessment.
4. Bed occupancy is not provided.
5. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification is not followed for indexing.
6. Central Clinical Laboratory: Microbiology section does not exist.
7. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
8. Examination Hall: Two examination halls are functional against requirement of 3.
9. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of 2 lecture theaters is less than required. Hospital lecture theater is not of gallery type. E class facility is available only in 1 lecture theater.
10. Residents' Hostel: Accommodation available is 188 against requirement of 128 Residents + 187 PG = total 315.
11. Residential Quarters: Only 16 quarters are available for teaching faculty against requirement of 38.
12. There is shortage of Demonstration rooms in all the departments; Available Demonstration rooms are of inadequate size & seating capacity. New Demonstration rooms are constructed but non functional.
13. Biochemistry department: Faculty space is inadequate.
14. Pathology department: Infrastructure is inadequate as detailed in the report.
15. Microbiology department: Parasitology laboratory is not available. There is no practical laboratory.
16. RHTC: Residential accommodation is inadequate.
17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur for the academic year 2016-17.

**57. Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (5<sup>th</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 10.41 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of residents is 10.96 % as detailed in the report OPD: Registration counters are not separate for males/females or for OPD/IPD. Injection room is common for males/females. Dressing room is common for males/females. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are common.
3. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5.
4. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur for the academic year 2016-17.

**58. S.V. Medical College, Tirupati - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.V. Medical College, Tirupati - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Central Library: Number of Internet nodes are less (7 available against 25 required)
2. Residential Quarters: Available quarters for Non-teaching staff are 30 against 37 required.
3. OPD: Injection room is common for males & females. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are common. In major clinical departments like General Surgery, Paediatrics, 4 rooms are not available. Teaching areas are not available.
4. There is no separate room for Speech Therapy.
5. MRD is both manual & computerized.
6. Only 5 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6.
7. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
8. Nursing Staff: Only 391 Nurses are available against 464 required.
9. Anatomy department: Only 25 specimens are available.
10. Demonstration rooms are inadequate in departments of Pharmacology, & Forensic Medicine departments.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 at S.V. Medical College, Tirupati under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**59. Burdwan Medical College, Burdwan - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Burdwan Medical College, Burdwan - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at Burdwan Medical College, Burdwan under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata for the academic year 2016-17.

**60. Goa Medical College, Goa - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Goa Medical College, Goa - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at Goa Medical College, Goa under Goa University, Goa for the academic year 2016-17.

**61. Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) alongwith a representation dated 15.10.2015 from the Director-Principal, Government Medical College & Hospital, Chandigarh and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 41 % as detailed in the report.
2. Most of the faculty & Residents of the following departments were not available for signature in attendance sheet upto 11 a.m. on 1 day of assessment; however they were present in the afternoon, but as they had not signed in attendance sheet upto 11 a.m., they were not accepted:
  - (1) Pharmacology;
  - (2) Pathology;
  - (3) Psychiatry;
  - (4) Tb & Chest Diseases;
  - (5) Anaesthesiology;
  - (6) ENT;
  - (7) Orthopaedics;
  - (8) Obst. & Gyn.;
  - (9) Radiodiagnosis;
  - (10) Paediatrics;
  - (11) Ophthalmology;
  - (12) General Medicine.
3. Shortage of Residents is 46.66 % as detailed in the report.
4. Lecture Theaters: Out of 3 lecture theaters required of capacity, only 1 lecture theater is of capacity 120. Rest two are smaller – 1 of 100 & 1 of 60 capacity. Hospital lecture theater is not of gallery type.
5. Central Library: Available area is 1,200 sq.m. against requirement of 1,600 sq.m. Capacity of Students' seating room (Outside) & Students' seating room (Inside) is 50 each against requirement of 100 each.
6. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is for 192 against requirement of 300.

7. Nurses' Hostel: Nurses have been allotted rooms in students' hostels under the plea that there is little demand from students which is not permissible.
8. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
9. Capacity of Demonstration Room is smaller in all the departments.
10. Area of all laboratories & dissection hall are inadequate.
11. Physiology department: Preparation room is not available in laboratories.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Govt. Medical College, Chandigarh under Punjab University, Chandigarh for the academic year 2016-17.

**62. Guru Gobind Singh Medical College, Faridkot - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of Recognition for 50 seats.**

Read: the matter with regard to Guru Gobind Singh Medical College, Faridkot - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of Recognition for 50 seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 16.90 % as detailed in the report.
2. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: Minutes were not produced for verification.
3. Residents' Hostel: Available accommodation is for 57 Residents against requirement of 59.
4. Central Clinical Laboratory: Individual departmental sections are under the control of respective departments which is not as per norms.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Guru Gobind Singh Medical College, Faridkot under Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot for the academic year 2016-17.

The Committee further decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree of Guru Gobind Singh Medical College, Faridkot.

**63. S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Lecture Theaters: Two lecture theaters of capacity 200, 2 of capacity 250 & 2 of capacity 180-200 are available against requirement of 4 of 300 each. Thus none of the lecture theaters has the required capacity.

2. Central Library: Available area is 1,800 sq.m. Capacity of staff reading room is only 20. Internet nodes available are only 10.
3. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are smaller than required.
4. OPD on day of assessment is 2,853 which is less than minimum 3,000 required. It is violative of Qualifying Criterion 6 B (ii) of Part II of Opening -- Regulations also.
5. MRD: Inpatient records are not computerized.
6. O.T.s: Several O.T.s do not have Central O<sub>2</sub> and suction.
7. Website: Citizens' Charter is not available.
8. Anatomy department: MRI & CT films are not available in museum.
9. Capacity of Demonstration Rooms of Physiology, Biochemistry, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Forensic Medicine departments is smaller than required.
10. Pathology department: Specimens are only 160 in museum.
11. In general hygiene & cleanliness were very poor in wards and in kitchen area.
12. In CSSD, separate space for dirty area, packing, sterilization, sterile storage area is not available.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 at S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack under Utkal University, Bhubaneswar for the academic year 2016-17.

**64. Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 11.49 % as detailed in the report.
2. OPD: Orthopaedics OPD has only 3 examination rooms against requirement of 4. Injection room is common for males/females. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are common. Paediatrics OPD does not have specialty clinics.
3. Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	General Medicine	150	128	22
2	Skin & VD	30	20	10
3	Obst. &Gynaec.	90	82	08
	TOTAL			40

4. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
5. O.T.s: Central N<sub>2</sub>O is not available.
6. AERB approval is not available for X-ray machines.
7. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
8. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Only 29 journals are available against requirement of 100.
9. Nursing Staff: Only 322 Nurses are available against requirement of 372.
10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.



In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot under Saurashtra University, Rajkot for the academic year 2016-17.

**65. Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Pune - Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Pune - Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Students' Hostels: Ancillary facilities are inadequate as detailed in the report.
2. Residents' Hostels: Accommodation available is for 126 Residents + PGs against requirement of 214. Residents' Hostel is having common bathrooms while Students' hostels are having attached bathrooms which is incongruous
3. Gayatri hostel in the campus is shown as Nurses' hostel; but on verification it was found that P.G. female Residents & Physiotherapy students are staying in this hostel & in fact no Nurses are staying which is not permissible. No register is available in hostel warden office. No warden was appointed. Recreation room is not available.
4. Interns' Hostel: There is no register of students. There is no warden. Recreation room is not available. One room is allotted to Dental College on duty doctors which is not permissible.
5. There are 64 staff quarters available in the campus in which majority Nursing staff & other non-teaching staff are staying.
6. Residents' Hostels: There is no proper organized Residents' hostel. Some Senior Residents are staying outside campus which is not permissible. As per the list given, some Residents were shown staying on IV floor; on verification it was found that IV floor was not yet ready for occupation.
7. Wards: In some wards, pantry room is empty. No gas/stove facility is available. For some wards, Demonstration room is common between 2 wards. In ENT department, Doctors' duty room is inside Demonstration room. In some wards, in Doctors' duty room, there is only a bed & no other furniture. In a few wards, arrangement of Nursing Station is not proper as Nurses cannot see all the patients.
8. In male Skin & VD ward, patient named Belvate K.V., Age 68, IPD No. IP/15/144597, OPD # 270415, record sheet was blank. Only name of patient was written & no other details like personal details, complaints, past history, etc. were written.
9. In male Tb & Chest ward, both HOD & Staff Nurse have given wrong information regarding number of patients admitted on the day of assessment to the assessor during the round. In female Tb & Chest ward, 14 patients were claimed to be admitted but on taking round only 11 were observed.
10. Psychiatry ward has 30 beds but the department is functioning in 2 Units thus requiring 60 beds @ 30 beds/Unit; resultantly there is deficit of 30 beds in Psychiatry.
11. MRD: It is partly computerized.

12. ICUs: NIL beds were occupied in Burns' ICU, RICU & Obstetric ICU on day of assessment.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Pune under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for the academic year 2016-17.

**66. Kurnool Medical College, Kurnool - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Kurnool Medical College, Kurnool - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (5<sup>th</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Examination Hall: Two Examination Halls of capacity 325 & 250 respectively are available against requirement of 3 of capacity 250 each.
2. Lecture Theaters: Four Lecture Theaters as required are available but the capacity of 2 of them is 208 & 180 against requirement of 240 each. One lecture hall is flat type. Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is 200 against requirement of 300. E class facility is not available.
3. Central Library: It is partially air-conditioned. Capacity of Students' Reading Room (Outside) is only 75 against requirement of 200. Capacity of staff reading room is 25 against requirement of 40. Internet nodes available are 11 against requirement of 25 and that too in MEU Unit & not in Central Library.
4. Residential Quarters: Amongst the faculty, only Principal & Wardens have been accommodated in the campus; for the rest quarters are available in general Govt. pool 1 km. away from college. No accommodation is available for non-teaching staff in the campus.
5. OPD: Several OPDs do not have Demonstration Rooms of adequate capacity (Available capacity being 05-10); in some they are non-existent.
6. Wards: Demonstration rooms of some wards have capacity of 10-15; in some wards they were utilized for other purposes.
7. MRD: ICD X classification of Diseases is not followed for indexing.
8. O.T.s: Two Ophthalmology O.T.s have 3 tables each which is not as per norms. Central O<sub>2</sub> & Central Suction are not available in Emergency & Septic O.T.
9. ICUs: In PICU, 49 patients were placed on 20 beds which is contrary to norms and a great potential hazard for cross infection & cross transmission of other morbidities.
10. CSSD: It is very primitive with only 2 machines. Receiving & Distribution points are not separate. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
11. Nursing staff: Only 379 Nurses are available against 464 required.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 at Kurnool Medical College, Kurnool under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**67. Guntur Medical College, Guntur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Guntur Medical College, Guntur - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Dr. G. Subba Rao, Dean, possesses experience of only 6 y 9 m as Professor i/c & 2 y 2 m as Asso. Prof. –i.e. total 8 y 11 m against requirement of 10 y of experience as Professor + Asso. Prof. Further, his experience of 6 y 9 m is as i/c Professor & not as regular Professor & therefore cannot be considered; resultantly he is not eligible to hold the post.
2. Lecture Theater: Lecture Hall in the hospital is of flat type & its capacity is only 180 against 300 required.
3. Residential Quarters: NIL quarters are available for faculty & for non-teaching staff in the campus.
4. OPD: Teaching areas of General Surgery, Orthopaedics, Obstetrics & Gynaecology OPD were small. Injection room for males & females is common where mainly Anti Rabies Vaccine was given. There was no proper Emergency Tray or ambu bag or emergency injections like Adrenaline were present. .
5. Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	General Medicine	210	194	16
2	Paediatrics	120	69	51
3	Skin & VD	30	22	08
4	General Surgery	210	200	10
5	Orthopaedics	120	99	21
	TOTAL			106

6. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m in all the wards. There was no indoor patient in Ophthalmology. Demonstration Rooms are inadequate in size and in number.
7. MRD: It is [partially computerized.
8. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
9. Anatomy department: Students' Lockers available are 154 against requirement of 200.
10. RHTC: It is under joint control of Principal & DHS which is not permissible. Cold chain equipment is not available. Only TT & Anti Rabies vaccines are given at RHTC.
11. UHC: It is under joint control of Principal & DMHO which is not permissible. Specialists' visits are not organized.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 at Guntur Medical College, Guntur under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

**68. Shri Vasantnao Naik Govt. Medical College, Yavatmal - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Shri Vasantnao Naik Govt. Medical College, Yavatmal - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (12<sup>th</sup> & 13<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 10.9 % as detailed in the report.
2. Lecture Theaters: E class facility is not available. Hospital lecture theater is of flat type.
3. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.
4. Interns' Hostel: Accommodation available is for 96 against requirement of 100 as per Regulations.
5. Speech Therapy is not available.
6. Wards: Demonstration Rooms are smaller than required.
7. Daily average OPD attendance is 1,025 against requirement of 1,200.
8. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is only 01-02/week.
9. Daily average Histopathological & Cytopathological workload is 3-5 & 5-7 respectively which is inadequate.
10. MRD: Statistician is not available.
11. Casualty: Disaster Trolley is not available. Ventilators are inadequate.
12. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations. Only 4 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. PNDT approval is not available for USG machine in O.G. department.
13. Blood component separation facility is not available even though the institute is running PG courses.
14. Anatomy department: Dissection tables are less.
15. Biochemistry department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against 2 required as per Regulations.
16. Microbiology department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against 2 required as per Regulations.
17. Pharmacology department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against 2 required as per Regulations. Museum facilities are inadequate.
18. Community Medicine department: Only 1 Demonstration Room is available against 2 required as per Regulations.
19. RHTC: It is at a distance of > 30 kms. which is not as per Regulations.
20. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Shri Vasantnao Naik Govt. Medical College, Yavatmal under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for the academic year 2016-17.

**69. Report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.**

Read: the matter with regard to Report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

- (1) The sub-committee has accepted plea of several colleges that till CBI proceedings are concluded, proceedings before MCI be kept in abeyance. This is not a correct view as departmental proceedings before MCI and criminal proceedings initiated by CBI are on entirely different platforms and not dependent on one another. Even Hon'ble Supreme Court has held that both can proceed simultaneously.
- (2) The sub-committee has recommended conditional permission, recognition subject to outcome of CBI proceedings. This is not possible. MCI is independent Statutory body. Its recommendations have to be based on merits of assessments carried out by its own assessors. Further, such conditional permission has no legal sanctity as there is no provision for conditional permission in MCI Act. Further, such conditional permission recommendation may not be accepted by Central Govt. Even otherwise, there may be infinite legal complications may arise in cases of students admitted under such conditional permissions. Hon'ble Courts are known to favour students in such circumstances.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that all these cases be referred to Ethics Committee with advice to take up all these cases on priority basis and decide the matter as expeditiously as possible.

**70. Report of the Sub Committee regarding Fake Faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2015-16 where name of doctors appeared in more than one medical college.**

Read: the matter with regard to Report of the Sub Committee regarding Fake Faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2015-16 where name of doctors appeared in more than one medical college.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that there are 246 teachers. In case of Govt. officers on transfer, the Sub-Committee has recommended that no further action is required as they have obeyed transfer orders of Govt. The Executive Committee approved the same but decided to write a letter to the State Government to abstain from transferring faculty from one college to another for the purpose of assessment.

Further, in case of faculty in private colleges, where appearance at first assessment has not been disclosed by the faculty during second assessment, the Sub-Committee has recommended that explanation be sought from the faculty. The Executive Committee decided that instead of seeking explanation from the faculty as recommended by the Sub-Committee, the matter should be placed before Ethics Committee of the Council.

**71. Parliamentary Standing Committee on the welfare of the Schedule Caste and Schedule Tribe – role of MCI in ensuring reservation for SC/ST.**

Read: the matter with regard to Parliamentary Standing Committee on the welfare of the Schedule Caste and Schedule Tribe – role of MCI in ensuring reservation for SC/ST.

The Executive Committee of the Council accepted the report of the Sub-Committee dated 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015 and decided to place before the General Body of the Council.

72. **Approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meetings held on 10.08.2015 and 07/09/2015.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 07/09/2015.

**A: MEETING DT. 10/08/2015:**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting with regard to item Nos. 42,52,53,54,56,57 & 59. For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under pointwise:-

Item No. 40. **Admission of 1st year MBBS students at ICARE Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Haldia, Purba Midanpore for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Approved. Dean be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of the letter should also be marked to affiliating University & State Medical Council.

Item No. 41. **Admission of MBBS student at Burdwan Medical College, Burdwan, West Bengal for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Two candidates be issued discharge notice. Dean be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of the letter should also be marked to affiliating University & State Medical Council.

Item No. 44. **Admission of MBBS student at Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Kozhikode, Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Full details, including ratio of judgement of Hon'ble Supreme Court need to be given by the sub-committee. Referred back with this observation.

Item No. 51. **Admission of MBBS student at Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Nasik for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

The Committee noted the corrigendum submitted by the Section that there had been a typographical error and the matter pertains to MBBS and not PG students and therefore approved the same.

Item No. 55. **Admission of MBBS student at SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nandihills, Dhamangaor-Ghoti, Tal. Igatpuri, Nashik, Maharashtra for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes of this item are inconsistent. Title refers to SMBT Institute, Read pertains to BHU, Varanasi and Minutes pertain to Terna Medical College. This needs to be clarified. Referred back with above observation.

**B: MEETING DT. 07/09/2015:**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting with regard to item Nos.1& 2. For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under pointwise:-

- Item No. 3 **Admission of MBBS student at Perunthurai Medical College and Institute of Road Transport, Perunthurai, Tamil Nadu for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

- Item No. 4 **Admission of MBBS student at Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad Andhra Pradesh for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

- Item No. 5 **Admission of MBBS student at Government Medical College, Jammu for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

- Item No. 6 **Admission of MBBS student at Travancore Medical College, Kollam, Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

- Item No. 7 **Admission of MBBS student at Index Medical College Hospital and Research Centre, Indore, MP for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

- Item No. 8 **Admission of MBBS student at Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu, Tamil Nadu for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

- Item No. 9 **Admission of MBBS student at MES Medical College, Perintalmanna, Malapuram, Distt., Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

Item No.10 **Admission of MBBS student at IQ-City Medical College, Burdwan, West Bengal for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Approved. Further, a copy of the decision may also be communicated to DME with a request to ensure that for the next Academic Year the seats to be filled by Govt. quota are increased by 7.

Item No. 11 **Admission of MBBS student at Rajiv Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Adilabad, Andhra Pradesh for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Minutes are incomplete. Details of explanation given by the institute are not given. Decision of sub-committee is not recorded. Referred back with above observations.

73. **Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Travancore Medical College, Kollam under the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Travancore Medical College, Kollam under the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) along with previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and decided that the Council should process the applications for starting of postgraduate courses for further necessary action.

*The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.*

74. **Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Jorhat Medical College, Jorhat under Srimanta Shankardeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Jorhat Medical College, Jorhat under Srimanta Shankardeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) along with previous assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> & 31<sup>st</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 20.9 %.
2. Shortage of Residents is 29.8 % as detailed in the report.
3. There is scope for further improvement in Boys' hostel.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant 01(One) month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council.



**75. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Gujarat Adani Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhuj under the KSKV Kachchh University, Bhuj.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Gujarat Adani Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhuj under the KSKV Kachchh University, Bhuj.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) along with previous assessment report (14<sup>th</sup> & 15<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and decided that the Council should process the applications for starting of postgraduate courses for further necessary action.

*The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.*

**76. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Govt. Medical College, Akola under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Govt. Medical College, Akola under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) along with previous assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> & 31<sup>st</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 11.3 % as detailed in report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 25.3 % as detailed in the report.
3. Total number of Major operations for the whole hospital is 06 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
4. Total number of Minor operations for the whole hospital is 07 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
5. Central Library: presently only budget is sanctioned for construction of additional space. Area remains as it is at 1,600 sq.m. Deficiency remains as it is.
6. Audiologist is not available.
7. Histopathology workload on day of assessment remains at 05 which is inadequate.
8. MRD: Statistician is not available.
9. Radiodiagnosis department: Deficiency of mobile & static X-ray machines continues to remain as it is. Only purchase procedure has been initiated.
10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant 01(One) month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council.

**77. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Shimoga Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at

Shimoga Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21<sup>st</sup> September, 2015) along with previous assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> & 31<sup>st</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 13.51 % as detailed in report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 31.34 % as detailed in the report.
3. Central Monitors are not available in ICCU/MICU. Deficiency remains as it is.
4. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6. CT is outsourced under PPP mode. Deficiency remains as it is.
5. Intercom is not available.
6. RHTC: It is under the control of Dept. of Health & family Welfare & not under Dean. Deficiency remains as it is.
7. UHC: It is under the control of Dept. of Health & family Welfare & not under Dean. Deficiency remains as it is.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant 01(One) month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council.

**78. Approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 08/09/2015.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 08/09/2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 08/09/2015 with regard to item Nos.1,3,5,8,9,10 & 12(i). For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under pointwise:-

Item No.2 **Submission of Report by team of Members and officials of the Council constituted by Admn. & Grievance Committee in the matter of Complaint of Ragging received from various batches of students of Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences, Ranchi.**

Sub-Committee has not recommended any action against the erring students. Also, whether the action recommended against the college by sub-committee, viz. non consideration of applications u/s 10 A for 1 year is legally feasible or not be examined by Law Officer of MCI. Referred back with above observation.

Item No.4 **Complaint against the management of SGT Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Gurgaon (Haryana).**

Not approved. As already mentioned the college has no role to play in award of grace marks which is exclusively a function of University and therefore to ask for explanation from the college or any of its official is irrelevant.

Item No.6 **Harassment of Dr. Jayesh Prabhakar Waghulde, Associate Prof. in M.V.P.S.S. Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College, Adgoan, Nashik (M.S.) by the hands of Hon'ble President and Hon'ble Secretary of the said Medical College – req.**

Not approved. The matter is between employer and employee and is entirely beyond purview of MCI. Henceforth in future, Administration & Grievance Committee is directed not to entertain any such complaint of any employee against his employer and to restrict its functioning only to complaints of ragging and compliant/grievance of employee of MCI.

Item No.7 **Complaint of Ragging received from Darbhanga Medical College, Laheriasarai,**

(1) The sub-committee has recommended withholding result of the entire 2014 batch. Legality be examined by Law officer of MCI.  
 (2) Approved; if they do not come as directed by the sub-committee, the sub-committee should decide the matter ex-parte and should recommend suitable action in accordance with law.  
 (3) Not approved to the extent that Duty roster of teachers has nothing to do with the incidence of ragging. Principal be called to office of MCI with affidavits of students.

Item No.11 **Setup of facility at MCI for efficient and systematic handling of information sharing volume – Empanelment of a Call Centre Agency.**

Minutes are incomplete. If NICSII was at fault, why should MCI pay additional amount of Rs. 22,916 to the vendor? This be clarified. Further, it is stated that an amount of Rs. 6,18,879 was sent to NICSII for hiring of call center services; however it seems that these services could not start till now. Why no action was taken by MCI till date? These issues be clarified. Referred back to sub-committee with above observations.

Item No.12(ii) **Complaint of ragging in Patna Medical College**

The Principal be directed to submit final report on the incidence of ragging at Patna Medical College; till then the matter be kept pending.

It has been observed by the Executive Committee that the members of Administration & Grievance Committee themselves have been nominated as members of Enquiry Committee to enquire into the complaints of ragging, etc. against medical colleges. Thereafter they, as members of Administration & Grievance Committee also peruse the Enquiry Report and take decision upon such reports. It was felt that this is not proper as no person can be just in his own cause.

In view of above, it was decided by the Executive Committee of the Council to advise the members of Administration & Grievance Committee not to be part of such Enquiry Committees. Whenever such Enquiry Committee needs to be constituted, it should be done only with approval of President.

**79. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings- req.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following proceedings of the Ethics Committee Meeting 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> August, 2015:-

**1. Case No. 01: Appeal filed by Shri Sanjay Aggarwal against order of Delhi Medical Council (Doctors of Rajeev Gandhi Hospital):**

Approved.

**2. Case No. 02: Appeal filed by Shri Sanjay Aggarwal against order of Delhi Medical Council (Doctors of Action Balaji Hospital):**

Approved.

**3. Consideration of CBI, ACU-IX, AC-III, New Delhi – Self Contained Note in respect of National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur Regarding Bogus & False Documents as well as Wrong Information to MCI Pertaining to Faculty Strength, Nursing Staff, beds, etc.:**

Approved.

**4. Provision of MCI to take Action Against ART Clinics Violating Government Instructions**

Approved.

**5. Appeal filed by Dr. (Mrs) Mattu against Dr. Anil Jindal MD (Managing Director) of Saket City Hospital, New Delhi:**

Approved.

For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under pointwise:-

**6. Case No. 01: Issuance of Teaching Experience Certificates to Various Faculty Prior to Starting of PG Medical Courses at Mamata Medical College, Khammam:**

Agenda note is incomplete. At the meeting dt. 10/08 & 11/08/2015, the only decision taken by Ethics Committee is "to refer the matter to Law Officer, MCI for his opinion". (P. 35 of Minutes, Internal Page 5) This is confirmed at meeting of 15/16 September 2015. However, the opinion of Law Officer is not enclosed. Further, no decision taken by Ethics Committee is placed before Executive Committee.

Referred back to Ethics Committee with above observations.

**7. Fake Signatures by Various Faculty Members at new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, U.P. by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society Simultaneously with their Private Practice During Working Hours:**

Ethics Committee has not taken any decision in the matter; it has only stated that the matter be placed before Executive Committee for further action. Also, whether Dr. Faruqui himself brought it to the attention of the assessor that somebody had signed against his name or not, the fact remains that if he had not signed the attendance sheet as claimed by him, somebody else must have signed the attendance sheet and it is for the Dean to explain as to how the attendance sheet with fake signature of Dr. Faruqui was handed over to assessor which the Dean has failed to do in his explanation. Under these circumstances, § 11 of the statement of Dean that "F.I. College has neither submitted any faked or forged form nor any fake or forged declaration" is misleading and false as it fails to explain as to how

attendance sheet containing fake signature of Dr. A.A. Faruqui was handed over to assessors.

Referred back to Ethics Committee with above observations and to take an appropriate decision on merits.

**8. Fake/Forged Documents Submitted by Dr. D. Aruna, Senior Resident at Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad.**

Agenda note is incomplete. At the meeting dt. 10 & 11/08 2015, it was decided that the claim of Dr. D. Aruna that she worked as Junior Resident at MNR Medical College and she was present at 2 inspections needs to be verified by UG Section of MCI. No such status note from UG section is enclosed with the item. Also, this claim is inconsistent with the decision of Executive Committee dt. 21/08/2014 wherein it is recorded that "*in view of submission of Principal, MNR Medical College, the experience certificate dt. 31/07/2008 & subsequent letter dt. 01/08/2008 are fabricated documents.*" It is also pertinent to note that Dr. Aruna has not produced copy of D.F. submitted by her at 2 inspections in which she claims to have remained present at MNR Medical College.

Referred back to Ethics Committee with above observations with a request to take appropriate decision in the matter.

**9. Appeal filed by Dr. Naval Bhatia, New Delhi against order of Delhi Medical Council & Appeal filed by Shri K. Rajiv Gupta against order of Delhi Medical Council:**

Approved.

The Committee however noted that in the following 4 items (# 09 - 12), the nature of offence was similar (i.e. Appearance in 2 departments (in Broad Specialty & another in Superspecialty) in the same session but the punishment awarded by previous Ethics Committee was inconsistent & not uniform as under:

Item	Offence	Punishment	
		Dean	Resident
9	Appearance in 2 departments as faculty in the Department of Surgery & Plastic Surgery at Raja Rajeshwari Medical College, Bangalore in the same session	Debar for 5 years	Exonerate
10	Dr. R. Vedamanickam, Senior Resident, for his Appearance in 2 departments as a faculty, i.e. General Medicine & Cardiology at SreeBalaji Medical College, Chennai in the same session;	Debar Permanently	Removal from IMR for 1 year
11	Dr. Pradeep Kumar, Senior Resident, for his Appearance in 2 departments as a faculty, i.e. General Surgery & Urology at Father Muller Institute of Medical Education & Research, Mangalore in the same session:	Warning	Warning
12	Dr. Venkatesh C.R, Senior Resident, for his Appearance in 2 departments as a faculty, i.e. General Medicine & Cardiology at JSS Medical College, Mysore in the same session:	Debar for 1 year \$	Exonerate \$

\$ This has been approved by E.C. Previously. Hence this pattern can be taken as index for such cases.

**10. Matter of Dr. Naveen N., Senior Resident for his appearance in 2 departments as faculty in the Department of Surgery & Plastic Surgery at Raja Rajeshwari Medical College, Bangalore in the same session:**

Referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to adopt a uniform policy for all such cases and take decision appropriately.

With regard to action to be taken against college, matter is referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to recommend suitable action in accordance with Act & Regulations.

**11. Dr. R. Vedamanickam, Senior Resident, for his Appearance in 2 departments as a faculty, i.e. General Medicine & Cardiology at SreeBalaji Medical College, Chennai in the same session:**

Referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to adopt a uniform policy for all such cases and take decision appropriately.

With regard to action to be taken against college, matter is referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to recommend suitable action in accordance with Act & Regulations.

**12. Dr. Pradeep Kumar, Senior Resident, for his Appearance in 2 departments as a faculty, i.e. General Surgery & Urology at Father Muller Institute of Medical Education & Research, Mangalore in the same session:**

Referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to adopt a uniform policy for all such cases and take decision appropriately.

With regard to action to be taken against college, matter is referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to recommend suitable action in accordance with Act & Regulations.

**13. Dr. Venkatesh C.R, Senior Resident, for his Appearance in 2 departments as a faculty, i.e. General Medicine & Cardiology at JSS Medical College, Mysore in the same session:**

With regard to action to be taken against college, matter is referred back to Ethics Committee with a request to recommend suitable action in accordance with Act & Regulations.

**14. Invalid Appointment of Dr. (Smt) Sangeeta Ajnera as Principal of Medical College, Saharanpur with less than 03 years of experience as Professor & consistently working as HOD of Medical College, Meerut & Illegally showing her name in both medical colleges violating MCI Rules:**

Not approved. Appearance for inspection on 22/08/2013 in LLRM Medical College, Meerut & on 30/05/2014 at SMMH Medical College, Saharanpur cannot be in same Academic Year as probably inspection at Meerut would be for Academic Year 2013-2014 while at Saharanpur would be for Academic Year 2014-2015. Merely showing eMail that "Get my head counting done" cannot be taken as proof as she has categorically mentioned that her presence was neither verified nor did she sign on first day of assessment (i.e. 26/05/2014) on attendance sheet during assessment of LLRM Medical College, Meerut As she is a Govt. Officer, her pay is controlled by Pay & Accounts Officer and mode of payment is beyond her control. It is also not shown whether payment from parent college – i.e. LLRM Medical College – was done in her case or in all such cases. Further it also needs to be verified whether she joined Saharanpur college after getting relieved from Meerut medical college as this aspect has not been shown anywhere.

It also needs to be examined whether a Govt. Officer, can be held responsible for her action when obeying a Govt. order.

Matter is referred back with above observations to take appropriate decision in the matter.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following proceedings of the Ethics Committee Meeting 27<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup> August, 2015:-

1. **Case No. 01: Appeal by Shri Ch. Shankaraiah, Bajaj Allianz General Insurance against order of Karnataka Medical Council:**

Approved.

2. **Case No. 02: Appeal filed by Shri Ajay Kumar Gupta against order of Delhi Medical Council:**

Approved.

3. **Case No. 18: Working of Dr. H.V. Prasad, Professor of General Medicine, Oxford Medical College at more than one Medical Colleges Simultaneously:**

Approved.

4. **Case No. 20: Working of Dr. B.M. Ramyathulasi, Assistant Professor of O.G., Oxford Medical College at more than one Medical Colleges Simultaneously:**

Approved.

5. **Case No. 21: Report of Sub-Committee regarding Fake Declaration Forms for Academic Year 2014-2015 in respect of Dr. Ravi Prakash Agarwal, Assistant Professor of Paediatrics:**

Approved.

6. **Case No. 22: Report of Sub-Committee regarding Fake Declaration Forms for Academic Year 2014-2015 in respect of Dr. Nandeesh M., Assistant Professor of General Surgery:**

Approved.

**Office Note:** Office is directed to confirm that the earlier approval of E.C. with regard to debaring Dr. M. Nandeesh from accepting any teaching assignment for 3 years is communicated to all relevant authorities.

7. **Case No. 23: Report of Sub-Committee regarding Fake Declaration Forms for Academic Year 2014-2015 in respect of Dr. Anitha T.K., Assistant Professor of Microbiology:**

Approved.

**Office Note:** Office is directed to confirm that the earlier approval of E.C. with regard to debaring Dr. T.K. Aneetha from accepting any teaching assignment for 3 years is communicated to all relevant authorities.

8. **Case No. 24: Report of Sub-Committee regarding Fake Declaration Forms for Academic Year 2014-2015 in respect of Dr. Mohammad Shahid, Assistant Professor of Anaesthesiology:**

Approved.

**9. Case No. 27: Appeal filed by Mr. Manish Arya against order of Delhi Medical Council:**

Approved.

For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under pointwise:-

**10. Case No. 30: Order dt. 18/12/2014 of Hon'ble Delhi High Court in WP(C) 2977/2013 & CM-5610/2013 titled as Dr. R.P. Singh v/s MCI & Ors.:**

Not Approved. Date of decision by State Medical Council is long past and suspension for six months w.e.f. that date would not serve any practical purpose as the erring doctor would have practiced during the period of suspension. To be effective, period of suspension should always be prospective.

In view of above, it was decided that period of suspension of six months would be effective from the date on which the order of suspension for 6 months is passed by Delhi Medical Council subsequent to intimation of the present decision of the Executive Committee and communicated to the erring doctor.

The Executive Committee of the Council further approved the following proceedings of the Ethics Committee Meeting 15.09.2015:-

**1. Case No. 03: Irregularities found during Compliance Verification Assessment for Establishment of New Medical College at Israna, Panipat, Haryana by Shanit Devi Charitable Trust, Pitampura, New Delhi:**

Approved.

**2. Case No. 09: Complaints Regarding Sponsorship of Foreign Trip/Hospitality Provided by a Pharma Company to Dr. Vikas Sinha (Gujarat):**

Approved.

**3. Case No. 11: Appeal filed by Sh. Manohar @ Sambhaji B. Mutagekar against order of Karnataka Medical Council:**

Approved.

**4. Case No. 17: Appeal filed by Shri Dinesh Sethi against order of Delhi Medical Council:**

Approved.

**5. Case No. 20: Appeal filed by Shri Ranjeet Kumar Sharma against order of Delhi Medical Council:**

Approved.

For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under pointwise:-

**6. Case No. 02: Appearance in MCI assessment (June 2014) for recognition of M.R. Medical College, Gulbarga for M.S. (O.G.):**

Not approved. In none of the statements – of Dr. B. Mallikarjun, Dean; Dr. Mahananda, concerned faculty & Dr. Rajiv Mahendru, Assessor – it has



been explained as to how the discrepancy in signature arose in the first instance and how such a remark was made in the report. Also, it appears that Ethics Committee itself has not matched or compared the signatures of Dr. Mahananda before coming to a decision. It was also observed that the statement of Dr. Rajiv Mahendru in his report has stated that the signature of Dr. Mahananda is totally different at two places; however during his appearance before Ethics Committee, he has stated that the signatures are same. The Executive Committee observed that no explanation was given by Dr. Mahendru about change of statement about signature of Dr. Mahananda. The Committee is of opinion that Ethics Committee should have examined & verified this aspect of the matter as well.

In view of above, the matter is referred back with a request to reexamine the matter with also observations and resubmit thereafter.

**80. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at KPC Medical College, Jadavpur under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at KPC Medical College, Jadavpur under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:

1. OPD teaching areas are inadequate with 10-15 plastic chairs. No teaching area is available in Paediatrics, Psychiatry, Tb & Chest, Ophthalmology OPD. Deficiency remains as it is.
2. There is no separate Sterility clinic & no register of patients in it. Deficiency remains as it is.
3. Teaching Beds: 7 beds were deficient in Paediatrics (83 shown against 90 required). The distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. in several wards. Out of 83 beds shown in Paediatrics, 77 were vacant. Demonstration rooms are small cubicles with 10-15 plastic chairs.
4. Bed occupancy is 70.3 % (457 out of 650) on day of assessment which is inadequate. All patients admitted in Skin & VD had no significant skin disease justifying their hospitalization. Similarly, in Ophthalmology many patients admitted had no significant Ophthalmological disease justifying their admission.
5. Data of clinical material given by the institute appears to be over exaggerated.
6. MRD is manual. Deficiency remains as it is.
7. Casualty: There is no separate Casualty for O.G. Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Deficiency remains as it is.
8. ICUs: There is no PICU.
9. Lecture Theaters: There is no interactive boards for e-learning. Internet connection is available only in 1 lecture theater. Deficiency is partially rectified.
10. Residents' Hostel is under construction. Deficiency remains as it is.
11. Website: Details of infrastructure are partially provided. Citizens' charter is available but needs improvement. Deficiency is partially rectified.
12. RHTC: It is not under total control of Principal. The letter purportedly shown as handing over the control of RHTC to Principal only mentions that it under the administrative control of Principal for the purpose of

teaching and training of students & interneers which does not imply full control.

13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee noted that the assessment of the KPC Medical College, Jadavpur was conducted on 15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015 and the Executive Committee in view of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and/or Residents and or bed occupancy had recommended to the Central Government to invoke clause 8 (3) (1) (c) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee recalled that a three-judge bench of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in the judgment pronounced on September 29, 2015 in WP (C) 7106/2015 captioned as Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. and WP (C) 8541/2015 captioned as Lord Buddha Siksha Pratisthan & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. has held as under:-

50. On a careful reading of Regulation 8(3)(1), it appears to us that what is provided thereunder is grant of permission to establish a medical college initially for a period of one year and the renewal of the same on yearly basis subject to verification of the achievements of annual targets prescribed by MCI under Regulation 8(2). It is no doubt true that Regulation 8(3)(1) also states that "the Central Government may at any stage convey the deficiencies to the applicant and provide him an opportunity and time to rectify the deficiencies". However, the contention of MCI that by virtue of the provisos (a) to (d), an exception has been carved out to the power conferred on the Central Government to provide an opportunity and time to the applicant to rectify the deficiencies, is fallacious. We are afraid that this is not the import of Regulation 8(3)(1). According to us, the provisos (a) to (d) which imposed a bar on grant of renewal in the circumstances specified therein would only work as an exception to the main part of Regulation 8(3)(1) specifying the process of renewal of permission on yearly basis but not to the requirement of providing opportunity to rectify the deficiencies.

51. Therefore, we are of the view that it is not open to MCI and/or Central Government to deny an opportunity to the applicant/institute concerned to rectify the deficiencies specified by MCI even in cases which fall within the ambit of the provisos (a) to (d) of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations. However, it is essential for both MCI and Central Government to observe the time schedule as held in **Royal Medical Trust (supra)**.

52. For the aforesaid reasons, we hold that the provisos (a) to (d) to Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations shall not in any way circumvent the opportunity of being heard/opportunity to rectify the deficiencies provided under sub-Sections (3) and (4) of Section 10-A of the Medical Council Act. However, the same shall be in strict adherence to the time Schedule fixed in the Regulations and in conformity with the Schedule as laid down in **Royal Medical Trust (supra)**.

The Executive Committee noted that the KPC Medical College, Jadavpur had submitted its compliance on 03.09.2015. This compliance was verified by way of assessment on 5<sup>th</sup> October, 2015. The Executive Committee noted that in this assessment the deficiencies of bed occupancy and teaching beds in addition to various other deficiencies has been found once again. Thus, despite the grant of opportunity to KPC Medical College, Jadavpur it has failed miserably to rectify

the deficiencies of bed occupancy/teaching beds. This seriously affects the maintenance of minimum standards of medical education which adversely affects the quality training of MBBS students.

The Executive Committee also recalled that the Hon'ble Supreme Court vide its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust vs. Union of India & Ors. – WP (C) No. 705/2014 and connected matters has held that:

“(C) Intimation of the result or outcome of the inspection would then be communicated. If the infrastructure and facilities are in order, the concerned Medical College should be given requisite permission/renewal. However if there are any deficiencies or shortcomings, the MCI must, after pointing out the deficiencies, grant to the college concerned sufficient time to report compliance.

(D) If compliance is reported and the applicant states that the deficiencies stand removed, the MCI must cause compliance verification. It is possible that such compliance could be accepted even without actual physical verification but that assessment be left entirely to the discretion of the MCI and the Central Government. In cases where actual physical verification is required, the MCI and the Central Government must cause such verification before the deadline.

(E) The result of such verification if positive in favour of the Medical College concerned, the applicant ought to be given requisite permission/renewal. But if the deficiencies still persist or had not been removed, the applicant will stand disentitled so far as that academic year is concerned.”

In view of the above, the Executive Committee decided that despite grant of opportunity to rectify deficiencies of bed occupancy/teaching beds the KPC Medical College, Jadavpur has failed to rectify it. Accordingly, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government to invoke clause 8 (3) (1) (c) of the Establishment of Medical College, 1999 as inserted by amendment dt. 16/04/2010 which reads as under:

“8 (3)(1)....

(c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of M.B.B.S. degree and/or running Postgraduate Courses:

*If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is < 80 %, such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic Year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for Undergraduate and Postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted Postgraduate courses.”*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to process the applications and return the applications recommending disapproval of the scheme received from the Institute u/s 10A for starting/increase of various postgraduate courses for the academic year 2016-17 and decided to issue a show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata in respect of students being trained at KPC Medical College, Jadavpur should not be made.

**81. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (13<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 5.2 % as detailed in the report.
2. Bed occupancy is 51 % (i.e. 256 out of 500) on day of assessment against 80 % required as per Regulations. Data provided by institute are inflated.
3. There were only 12 Major operations on day of assessment.
4. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment which are inadequate.
5. Number of Plain X-rays on day of assessment was 84 which is inadequate.
6. Histopathological workload on day of assessment was 05 which was grossly inadequate.
7. There is no separate earmarked campus for medical college is available within the whole campus of Sharda University. There is no single signage / identification board on any building. Deficiency remains as it is.
8. Most of patients were admitted with Dengue fever but their temperature chart is showing normal temperature. Most of the patients were admitted with complaints of fever & other vague complaints not requiring admission. These are not useful teaching material.
9. In most of wards, nursing stations are not in proper place & some nursing stations are located in corridor.
10. In Ophthalmology ward, male & female patients are kept together.
11. A male patient named Bhanu was admitted in female medical ward.
12. A patient named Gajendri admitted in FMW had received blood transfusion; but neither Professor nor Intern knew anything about blood transfusion.
13. A patient named Sunitha, age 35 y, (No 217385) was admitted with Dengue fever but her temperature chart showed normal since admission.
14. A patient named Amni (No. 217025) is admitted in FMW. Her age as shown on case sheet is 40 y but as per statement of her son it is 60 y. Thus there is discrepancy in patient details.
15. Students' Hostels: Boys' & Girls' hostels are common for all students of all faculties like Medical, Engineering, Dental, College, management, etc. Deficiency remains as it is.
16. Interns' Hostel: There is no separate female Interns' hostel. They are accommodated in Girls' hostel. Deficiency remains as it is.
17. Residents' Hostel: It is partially furnished. Deficiency remains as it is.
18. Deficiency of Residential Quarters pointed out earlier remains as it is.
19. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee noted that the assessment of the School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida was conducted on 15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015 and the Executive Committee in view of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, Residents and bed occupancy had recommended to the Central Government to invoke clause 8 (3) (1) (c) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee recalled that a three-judge bench of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in the judgment pronounced on September 29, 2015 in WP (C) 7106/2015 captioned as Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. and WP (C) 8541/2015 captioned as Lord Buddha Siksha Pratisthan & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. has held as under:-

50. On a careful reading of Regulation 8(3)(1), it appears to us that what is provided thereunder is grant of permission to establish a medical college initially for a period of one year and the renewal of the same on yearly basis subject to verification of the achievements of annual targets prescribed by MCI under Regulation 8(2). It is no doubt true that Regulation 8(3)(1) also states that "the Central Government may at any stage convey the deficiencies to the applicant and provide him an opportunity and time to rectify the deficiencies". However, the contention of MCI that by virtue of the provisos (a) to (d), an exception has been carved out to the power conferred on the Central Government to provide an opportunity and time to the applicant to rectify the deficiencies, is fallacious. We are afraid that this is not the import of Regulation 8(3)(1). According to us, the provisos (a) to (d) which imposed a bar on grant of renewal in the circumstances specified therein would only work as an exception to the main part of Regulation 8(3)(1) specifying the process of renewal of permission on yearly basis but not to the requirement of providing opportunity to rectify the deficiencies.

51. Therefore, we are of the view that it is not open to MCI and/or Central Government to deny an opportunity to the applicant/institute concerned to rectify the deficiencies specified by MCI even in cases which fall within the ambit of the provisos (a) to (d) of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations. However, it is essential for both MCI and Central Government to observe the time schedule as held in **Royal Medical Trust (supra)**.

52. For the aforesaid reasons, we hold that the provisos (a) to (d) to Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations shall not in any way circumvent the opportunity of being heard/opportunity to rectify the deficiencies provided under sub-Sections (3) and (4) of Section 10-A of the Medical Council Act. However, the same shall be in strict adherence to the time Schedule fixed in the Regulations and in conformity with the Schedule as laid down in **Royal Medical Trust (supra)**.

The Executive Committee noted that the School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida had submitted its compliance on 14.09.2015. This compliance was verified by way of assessment on 13<sup>th</sup> October, 2015. The Executive Committee noted that in this assessment the deficiencies of teaching faculty and bed occupancy in addition to various other deficiencies has been found once again. Thus, despite the grant of opportunity to School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida it has failed miserably to rectify the deficiencies of teaching faculty and bed occupancy. This seriously affects the maintenance of minimum standards of medical education which adversely affects the quality training of MBBS students.

The Executive Committee also recalled that the Hon'ble Supreme Court vide its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust vs. Union of India & Ors. – WP (C) No. 705/2014 and connected matters has held that:

“(C) Intimation of the result or outcome of the inspection would then be communicated. If the infrastructure and facilities are in order, the concerned Medical College should be given requisite permission/renewal. However if there are any deficiencies or

shortcomings, the MCI must, after pointing out the deficiencies, grant to the college concerned sufficient time to report compliance.

(D) If compliance is reported and the applicant states that the deficiencies stand removed, the MCI must cause compliance verification. It is possible that such compliance could be accepted even without actual physical verification but that assessment be left entirely to the discretion of the MCI and the Central Government. In cases where actual physical verification is required, the MCI and the Central Government must cause such verification before the deadline.

(E) The result of such verification if positive in favour of the Medical College concerned, the applicant ought to be given requisite permission/renewal. But if the deficiencies still persist or had not been removed, the applicant will stand disentitled so far as that academic year is concerned.”

In view of the above, the Executive Committee decided that despite grant of opportunity to rectify deficiencies of bed occupancy/teaching beds the School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida has failed to rectify it. Accordingly, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government to invoke clause 8 (3) (1) (c) of the Establishment of Medical College, 1999 as inserted by amendment dt. 16/04/2010 which reads as under:

“8 (3)(1)....

(c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of M.B.B.S. degree and/or running Postgraduate Courses:

*If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is < 80 %, such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic Year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for Undergraduate and Postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted Postgraduate courses.”*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to process the applications and return the applications recommending disapproval of the scheme received from the Institute u/s 10A for starting/increase of various postgraduate courses for the academic year 2016-17 and decided to issue a show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Sharda University in respect of students being trained at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida should not be made.

**82. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal under the Barkatullah University.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal under the Barkatullah University.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (13<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 14.1 % as detailed in the report.
2. Bed occupancy is 42.36 % (i.e. 305 out of 720) on the date of assessment.
3. Data provided by the institute for clinical material is inflated.
4. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment till 12 noon.
5. Neither Major nor Minor operations had started till 10 a.m. on day of assessment.
6. There were only 2 patients in PICU/RICU on day of assessment.
7. Several wards are not as per MSR Regulations as detailed in the report.
8. In ENT ward, male & female patients are kept together.
9. Ancillary facilities are inadequate in several wards as detailed in the report.
10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee noted that the assessment of the L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal was conducted on 15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2015 and the Executive Committee in view of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and Residents had recommended to the Central Government to invoke clause 8 (3) (1) (c) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee recalled that a three-judge bench of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in the judgment pronounced on September 29, 2015 in WP (C) 7106/2015 captioned as Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. and WP (C) 8541/2015 captioned as Lord Buddha Siksha Pratishthan & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. has held as under:-

50. On a careful reading of Regulation 8(3)(1), it appears to us that what is provided thereunder is grant of permission to establish a medical college initially for a period of one year and the renewal of the same on yearly basis subject to verification of the achievements of annual targets prescribed by MCI under Regulation 8(2). It is no doubt true that Regulation 8(3)(1) also states that "the Central Government may at any stage convey the deficiencies to the applicant and provide him an opportunity and time to rectify the deficiencies". However, the contention of MCI that by virtue of the provisos (a) to (d), an exception has been carved out to the power conferred on the Central Government to provide an opportunity and time to the applicant to rectify the deficiencies, is fallacious. We are afraid that this is not the import of Regulation 8(3)(1). According to us, the provisos (a) to (d) which imposed a bar on grant of renewal in the circumstances specified therein would only work as an exception to the main part of Regulation 8(3)(1) specifying the process of renewal of permission on yearly basis but not to the requirement of providing opportunity to rectify the deficiencies.

51. Therefore, we are of the view that it is not open to MCI and/or Central Government to deny an opportunity to the applicant/institute concerned to rectify the deficiencies specified by MCI even in cases which fall within the ambit of the provisos (a) to (d) of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations. However, it is essential for both MCI and Central Government to observe the time schedule as held in **Royal Medical Trust (supra)**.

52. For the aforesaid reasons, we hold that the provisos (a) to (d) to Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations shall not in any way circumvent the opportunity of being heard/opportunity to rectify the deficiencies provided under sub-Sections (3) and (4) of Section 10-A of the Medical Council Act. However, the same shall be in strict adherence to the time Schedule fixed in the Regulations and in conformity with the Schedule as laid down in **Royal Medical Trust (supra)**.

The Executive Committee noted that the L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal had submitted its compliance on 05.09.2015. This compliance was verified by way of assessment on 13<sup>th</sup> October, 2015. The Executive Committee noted that in this assessment the deficiencies of Residents in addition to various other deficiencies has been found once again. Thus, despite the grant of opportunity to L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal it has failed miserably to rectify the deficiencies of Residents. This seriously affects the maintenance of minimum standards of medical education which adversely affects the quality training of MBBS students.

The Executive Committee also recalled that the Hon'ble Supreme Court vide its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust vs. Union of India & Ors. – WP (C) No. 705/2014 and connected matters has held that:

“(C) Intimation of the result or outcome of the inspection would then be communicated. If the infrastructure and facilities are in order, the concerned Medical College should be given requisite permission/renewal. However if there are any deficiencies or shortcomings, the MCI must, after pointing out the deficiencies, grant to the college concerned sufficient time to report compliance.

(D) If compliance is reported and the applicant states that the deficiencies stand removed, the MCI must cause compliance verification. It is possible that such compliance could be accepted even without actual physical verification but that assessment be left entirely to the discretion of the MCI and the Central Government. In cases where actual physical verification is required, the MCI and the Central Government must cause such verification before the deadline.

(E) The result of such verification if positive in favour of the Medical College concerned, the applicant ought to be given requisite permission/renewal. But if the deficiencies still persist or had not been removed, the applicant will stand disentitled so far as that academic year is concerned.”

In view of the above, the Executive Committee decided that despite grant of opportunity to rectify deficiencies of bed occupancy/teaching beds the L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal has failed to rectify it. Accordingly, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government to invoke clause 8(3)(1)(c) of the Establishment of Medical College, 1999 as inserted by amendment dt. 16/04/2010 which reads as under:

“8 (3)(1)....

(c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of M.B.B.S. degree and/or running Postgraduate Courses:

*If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is < 80 %, such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic Year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for Undergraduate and Postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted Postgraduate courses.”*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to process the applications and return the applications recommending disapproval of the scheme received from the Institute u/s 10A for starting/increase of various



postgraduate courses for the academic year 2016-17 and decided to issue a show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Barkatullah University in respect of students being trained at L.N. Medical College and Research Centre, Bhopal should not be made.

**83. Establishment of New Medical College at Paripally Kollam Dist., Kerala (ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam) by Govt. of Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new Medical College at Paripally Kollam Dist., Kerala (ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam) by Govt. of Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Essentiality Certificate as well as other documents such as land document etc. are in the name of ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam and not in the name of the applicant i.e. Government of Kerala.

The Executive Committee of the Council also noted that the Hon'ble Supreme Court in WP (C) No. 705/2014-Royal Medical Trust (Regd.) and Anr. Vs. UOI & Anr. has passed the following order:-

*"...(A) Initial assessment of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage".....*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to disapprove the scheme and return the application for establishment of New Medical College at Paripally Kollam Dist., Kerala (ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam) by Govt. of Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

**84. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Ataria, Sitapur, Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Ataria, Sitapur, Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (16<sup>th</sup> & 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 32.97 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 34.04 % as detailed in the report.
3. Examination Hall: It is under construction.
4. Lecture Theaters: E class facility is available in 1 lecture theater only.
5. Central Library: Reading room for Residents is not available.
6. There were only 06 Major operations on day of assessment which is inadequate.
7. MRD: Though claimed to be computerized, files are kept manually.
8. Central Research Laboratory: Only room is available. There is no research equipment.

9. Departments of Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Forensic Medicine, Community Medicine are under construction and hence non-functional.
10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Ataria, Sitapur, Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**85. Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (13<sup>th</sup> & 14<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar under Shiksha 'O' Anusandhan University, Bhubaneswar for the academic year 2016-17.

**86. Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (16<sup>th</sup> & 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar under Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut for the academic year 2016-17.

**87. Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the matter for the next meeting.

**88. Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Mata Gujri Memorial Medical College, Kishanganj under B.N. Mandal University, Madhepurai for the academic year 2016-17.

**89. GSL Medical College, Rajahmundry– Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.**

Read: the matter with regard to GSL Medical College, Rajahmundry– Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (13<sup>th</sup> & 14<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) alongwith two complaints dated 13.10.2015 and 15.10.2015 from Dr. Ganni Bhaskara Rao, Member of MCI, Associate Professor Dept. of General Surgery, GSL Medical College & General Hospital, Rajahmundry and Principal, GSL Medical College & General Hospital, Rajahmundry and observed that the Principal of the institute had abruptly called off the assessment for renewal of permission. It was also observed that the Dean had failed to submit attendance sheet of faculty & Residents to assessors within stipulated time. Even SAF & Declaration Forms of Faculty & Residents have not been submitted.

It was further observed by the Executive Committee that the assessment report reads as under:

“We the team of following assessors (vide MCI order 370(i)(RI-3)VG/2015-Med; Dated 13-10-15) reached the Dean’s office of GSL Medical College, Rajamundry on 13-10-15 at 9.10 am.

The Dean of the said institution came to his office at 9.20am. We handed over the check list of documents to be submitted and the proforma for recording attendance of the faculties and residences to him with a request to return the attendance sheet duly filled within 11 am or call the faculties/ residents to his office for their signature.

We waited till 11 am for the same to be handed over to us but the Dean was unable to do so; neither could he assure the physical presence of the faculties / residents of the clinical departments till 12.30 pm( viz: unsigned attendance sheet of General Surgery department attached herewith).

At 10 am we attended the central registration counters. The person at the counter could not produce the department wise OPD/IPD records of 13<sup>th</sup> October as well as June '15( chosen arbitrarily). (Srl. No. 1 of verification data)

**CASUALTY WARD**

- 4 patients who had recently received chemotherapy were admitted without any obvious emergency problems.
- No MO was available----only JR’s were present. (Srl. No. 3 of verification data)

- Radiological facilities were poor (i.e. no guard screen / table).
- Records of only 1 to 2 minor operations in the past few days.
- Pain clinic of poor facility(i.e. no drugs)
- Injection room had no proper records ( i.e. name of patient's / drugs not available, neither any facility of resuscitation in case of reactions available) (Srl. No. 5 of verification data) .

#### **OPD**

- Most of the faculties /residents on duty in OPD/ Wards had no college ID proof(Srl. No. 6/7/8/17 of verification data)
- In Gynae OPD no patients / no records found (Srl. No. 9 of verification data).
- Fake records in Obstetrics OPD (i.e. no diagnosis / treatment records, only name of the patients). (Srl. No. 10 of verification data).

#### **LABOUR ROOM**

- Birth register records for onward information to Corporation not available(Srl. No.11 of verification data)
- No duty roster of faculties or residents(Srl. No. 16 of verification data)
- In obstetrics ward unit wise distribution of beds not seen(Srl. No. 12 of verification data)
- No IPD records after 7-10-15. (Srl. No. 15 of verification data)

#### **BLOOD BANK**

- Unable to show separate units supplied to this institute(Srl. No. 13 of verification data)

#### **RADIOLOGY**

- HOD was unable to identify his staff members / residents
- Departmental attendance muster without mention of month (Srl. No. 14 of verification data).

#### **OT COMPLEX**

- Unit wise / monthly operative / anaesthesia records not available(Srl. No. 18 of verification data)

#### **SURGICAL WARDS**

- Only 2 male patients were admitted till 12 noon.
- Data collected at 2.30 pm from the central registration counter regarding the OPD / IPD /Central lab / others were cross checked randomly and we found certain mismatches for example a)casualty admission register showed 22 admissions while central registration data showed 9 (Srl. No. 20 of verification data).
- Central registration showed 6 female admissions in medical ward while physical verification failed to show any admission.
- Central registration showed 2 female surgical admissions while physical verification reveled only 1 (Srl. No. 24 of verification data).
- Central registration showed 7 male admissions on physical verification only 3 admissions were noted.
- No records in IPD admissions on 12-10-15 available in one of the female surgical wards (Srl. No. 26 of verification data).

•Ward records of sending patients to OT not available (Srl. No. 27 of verification data). While the above disparities were being put on record, the Dean unilaterally announced, on behalf of the college authorities, that they were not willing to continue with the inspection process any further. The letter in this regard was submitted at 4.10 pm.

The verified declaration form and other records( as per the check list) were also not handed over to us stating that it does not make any sense as they want to abandon the procedure of inspection, however the Dean had submitted the edited video graphic records in a pen drive."

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of GSL Medical College, Rajahmundry under the Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-2017.

**90. Admission of MBBS student at Government Medical College, Thrissur, Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to admission of MBBS student at Government Medical College, Thrissur, Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that at its meeting held on 05/08/2015, it was decided as under:

*"The Executive Committee of the Council also perused and approved the report of Monitoring Sub-Committee which reads as under:*

*".....The Council vide its letter dated 17/02/2015 had sought clarification regarding the admission of following two candidates with admission less than 50% marks.*

S.No	Name of Student	Date of Birth	Marks Obtained in Entrance Exam	Maximum Marks in Entrance Exam	Entrance Exam Percentage	Admission Date
1	MOHAMMED RAKHEEB C. G.	03/01/1996	559	1200	46.58	22/09/2014
2	UNAISA K.	22/01/1995	574	1200	47.83	22/09/2014

*The Monitoring Sub-Committee of the Council observed that the College in its explanation dated 12/05/2015 has stated that these candidates are under Central Pool allocation (GOI nominee) which is reserved category. These candidates are from GIN (Lakshadweep). The Committee also took note of the Central Govt. letter dated 28/05/2015 wherein it is inter alia stated :-*

*"In this regard you are informed that for the Academic Year 2014-15 relaxation in prescribed qualifying marks in Entrance Examination have not been granted for any category of students including Central Pool Quota students (except for foreign national students nominated by Ministry of External Affairs against Central Pool seats as per their bilateral agreements with the friendly foreign countries. Therefore the eligibility of the above students may be decided by Council as per prevailing Regulations".*

*In view of above, the Monitoring Sub-Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Executive Committee to consider to discharge the aforesaid 2 candidates as these students do not fulfill the criteria of obtaining minimum required percentage of marks in Common Entrance Examination as laid down in Graduate Medical Education Regulation, 1997."*

*In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided as under:*

(1) *To direct the Institute to discharge two students, viz. Mohammed Rakheeb C.G. & Unaisa K. who have obtained marks less than minimum required as per Regulations; & .....*

The Executive Committee of the Council further observed that the said decision was communicated to the College authorities along with other concerned authorities vide Council letter dated: 21/08/2015 with the request to submit the compliance with regard to discharge of two candidates namely Mohammed Rakheeb C.G and Unaisa K.

It was further observed that the Under Secretary to the Government of India, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi, vide his letter dated 14/10/2015 has forwarded copy of Mr. Mohammed Faizal PP, Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha) letter no. LD/MP/HS/15, dated: 05/10/2015 along with copy of order dated 14/09/2015 of the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala with the request to send the comments on the matter and present status of the case to the ministry.

As per the documents submitted by Secretary (Education), Administration of the Union Territory, Lakshadweep vide letter dated 17/09/2014 the said candidates belongs to ST category.

The Committee further observed that these two candidates have more than 40% marks in entrance examination.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to revoke discharge notice issued in respect of above two candidates.

**91. Approval of the minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> September 2015.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> September 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> September 2015.

**92. Establishment of new medical college at Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Society for the Advancement of Environmental Sciences, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Society for the Advancement of Environmental Sciences, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> September 2015) alongwith previous assessment report (9<sup>th</sup> & 10<sup>th</sup> Dec., 2014) and noted the following:

1. Deficiency of faculty is 92 % as detailed in the assessment report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 98 % as detailed in the assessment report. NIL Resident is staying in the campus.
3. Bed occupancy is NIL on day of assessment. There were only 7 patients were shown but they were in Casualty & not in wards. Indication of admissions for some of these patients is doubtful.
4. Students' Hostels: Rooms are not furnished & bathrooms are not fully ready. Deficiency remains as it is.
5. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
6. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.

7. Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload is grossly inadequate and almost zero as detailed in assessment report.
8. MRD: Medical Records Officer & Statistician are yet not available.
9. ICUs: There was NIL patient in ICCU/MICU/PICU/NICU/SICU on day of assessment. Central O<sub>2</sub> was available but closed.
10. Labour Room: Septic room is not yet available. There was no woman in the labour room. Deficiency remains as it is.
11. CSSD: ETO Sterilizer is not available. Receiving & Distribution points are not separate.
12. Anatomy department: Mounted specimens are only 40.
13. OPD attendance was less than 100 on day of assessment. At 10 a.m. there was no patient in OPD & Registration counter was closed.
14. Residents' hostel is occupied by Engineering students.
15. A hostel was shown as quarters for non-teaching staff which was actually occupied by Engineering students.
16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

**93. Renewal of permission for MBBS course of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai, Tamilnadu u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai, Tamilnadu u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> September 2015) alongwith previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup> Dec., 2014) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 15.90 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 91.76 % as detailed in the report. Most of the Residents are not staying in the campus.
3. There is deficit of 128 teaching beds as detailed in the report.
4. Bed occupancy is 59.69 %; even so most of the patients did not require admission.
5. There were fake patients in General Surgery, O.G., Paediatrics departments. In Paediatrics, healthy children were admitted straightaway in wards without first going through OPD. The case papers were taken for photocopying but were returned to wards without permission of assessors. They were not provided later on.
6. All wards except Male & Female Medicine, Orthopaedics Male & O.G. wards are not as per Minimum Standard Requirement Regulations. In departments of Ophthalmology, Tb & Chest, Psychiatry, ENT patients are kept in small rooms. Paediatrics ward is 60 beds. Deficiency remains as it is.
7. At time of visit to O.T. at 10 a.m., no operation was going on.
8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment. Average number of deliveries 1 on alternate day – i.e. 15/month which is grossly inadequate.
9. MRD: It is partly computerized. Deficiency remains as it is.
10. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in ICCU & SICU. Many of the patients in ICUs did not require intensive care.
11. There is no department of Dentistry. Dental College cited by the college in the compliance is also shown for another medical college run by the same trust.
12. Data of clinical material given by the in statute are highly inflated.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

**94. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> Sept., 2015), previous assessment report (6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2015) alongwith the letter/representation dated 30/09/2015 from the college authorities and noted the following:-

1. Dean read the report for 1 hour and then refused to sign it.
2. Deficiency of faculty is 29.51 % as detailed in the report.
3. Shortage of Residents is 53.52 % as detailed in the report.
4. Bed occupancy is 49.4 % on day of assessment.
5. There was NIL Major & 4 Minor operations on day of assessment.
6. There was NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
7. There were only 2 patients in ICCU.
8. Data of clinical material given by the Dean are inflated.
9. Through the whole inspection, Management & Authority had tried by all ways and means to obstruct and delay the inspection. Their approach was totally non cooperative, obstructive and tried to delay the inspection. When the inspection team reached at medical campus, security persons stopped the team at gate for 15 minutes inspite of telling as MCI inspection team from New Delhi. Then at Dean's Office, the team waited for 15 minutes for Dean. After that Dean did not allow and cooperate to start the inspection for another 20 to 25 minutes. After half an hour of inspection, suddenly Dean came forward and informed the inspection team, as per rules, due to Gandhi Jayanti Holiday (scheduled after 2 days) not allowed to conduct the inspection and insulted the inspection team to go back from college campus. So the inspection team asked authority to give written letter for the same. But after 45 minutes, their Secretary of Trust came and asked the inspection team to continue the inspection. Meanwhile they used time to manage/arrange some patients, faculty members and resident doctors for the purpose of head counting.
10. Non Genuine/fake patients
  - (a) Most of indoor patients were admitted with complaints of insignificant problem, headache, vague complaints, body ache, headache etc., which did not require hospitalization at all. Such admitted patients were not carrying any utensils/personal belongings, any medicine, etc. and no relative of any patient was present in the ward.
  - (b) In obstetrics ward no single pregnant woman was present.
  - (c) In most of the wards, proper case sheet of indoor patients were not available.
  - (d) Most of the patients admitted on the day of inspection.
  - (e) In many wards duty doctor and staff nurse did not know the details of admitted patients.
  - (f) In male medical ward, in record sheet of patient named Mr. Pavan Sharma, his age is mentioned as 67 years but his age as per his statement 36 years.
  - (g) In male medical ward patient with registration no. 201509180151, bed no.6 patient name Tarun as per his statement his age is 36 years but in the case sheet it is written as 60 years.



- (h) In male medical ward Mr. Hariram admitted on 19.9.2015 for Gastroenteritis but patient was taking oral medication. Patient did not require admission.
- (i) In medical ward as per records, Mrs. Nimmi admitted on 29.9.2015 with ip no. 9260071. As per staff nurse statement patient was admitted on 30.9.2015. As per ward register, patient admitted on 26.9.2015. It includes fake patient.
- (j) In the male medical ward, Mr. Mithun with regi.no. 20150910031, as per case sheet he was admitted on 19.9.2015. As per the patient's statement, he was admitted 2 days back (i.e. on 28<sup>th</sup>). Doctor treatment notes available from 19.9.2015 to 23.9.2015 but from 24.9.2015 to 29.9.2015 doctor notes was not available.
- (k) In Orthopaedic ward, no post operative case is present and not a single patient with POP (Plaster of Paris) was available. Admitted patients are simple problems like backache and joint pains and these patients did not require admission.
- (l) In entire hospital no seriously ill patients were present.

11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

**95. Recognition/approval of Subharti Medical College, Meerut for awarded of MBBS degree granted by Swami Vivekanand Subharti University, Meerut against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to Recognition/approval of Subharti Medical College, Meerut for awarded of MBBS degree granted by Swami Vivekanand Subharti University, Meerut against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21.09.2015) and assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> & 17<sup>th</sup> March, 2015) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 8.9 % as detailed in assessment report.
2. Hospital lecture theater is only semi gallery type. Elevation steps are only 4"-5". Deficiency is partially rectified.
3. Students' hostels are common for all institutes run by Subharti University. Thus there are no earmarked hostels for medical college. Deficiency remains as it is.
4. Residential Quarters for faculty & non-teaching staff are common for all institutes run by Subharti University. Thus there are no earmarked quarters for medical college. Deficiency remains as it is.
5. In wards, there are cubicles partitioned by 5' wall. Deficiency is not rectified. Nurses cannot have overview of all the patients in many wards as Nursing station is located in a corner of the ward.
6. There were only 07 Major & 10 Minor operations on day of assessment.
7. Presently 11 Residents listed in the assessment report are not staying in the campus; hence they cannot be considered.
8. Data of clinical material provided by the institute are inflated.
9. Bed occupancy is 64 % (i.e. 464 out of 750 beds) on day of assessment.
10. On verification, certain fake patients were observed. In Obstetrics ward one patient by name Hardai Ben was fake. Her age was more than 50 years. No case sheet was available. She has given oral statement that she has no complaints at all and was paid Rs. 200/- per day by Thekedar. The statement signed by Professor of OBG and Staff Nurse on duty is attached.
11. Fake patient: In Paediatric ward-2, one patient, child of labour worker whose original name was Arjun, fathers name Lala Ram and mothers name Mulia Ben was shown. The case paper does not match with this patient's name. In case paper name of the patient was shown as baby

- Preeth Kaur, which was as per case record admitted on 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2015. But patient's mother told that her son was admitted before 5-6 days. .
12. Fake patient: In obsertric ward one patient Prema Ben was fake. Her age was more than 50 years. No case paper was available. She was labour worker. She was made to come and lie down on the bed for the purpose of head counting when the Inspectors went there.
  13. Fake Patient: In Gynaec ward 1 (floor 3) patient by name Mrs. Savita, IP No. 150919027, was admitted on 19<sup>th</sup> Sept.2015. In case record doctors notes of 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> were not written. Directly patient's notes of 21<sup>st</sup> Sept. were written.
  14. Fake Patient: patient by name Jyothi, 22, was supposed to be admitted 8 days back for fever. But the ward Nurse mentioned she underwent D and C, which the patient denied. Case record was not available.
  15. Fake patient: Patient by name Khushbu, 18, was admitted to Obstetric ward 2 days back for simple fever. But no treatment was given. Case record was not made available.
  16. Fake patient: In female Medicine ward-1, patient named Mrs. Preeti, IP No. 150918023 was admitted on 18<sup>th</sup> Sept.2015. In case records no treatment notes of 19<sup>th</sup> Sept. was written.
  17. Fake Statement/data: Three patients named Manisha (IP No. 150919021), Shrishti (IP No. 150916107) and Mahendra (IP No. 150909042) were posted for surgery on the day of inspection (21<sup>st</sup> Sept.2015) as per the list given by the Institute. When the Inspectors went for the hospital rounds in the evening, it was noticed that the surgery was not done on these patients for various reasons. But in the list of Histopathology specimens it was shown that specimens were procured from the above mentioned patients.
  18. Some Nursing staff have no registration numbers.
  19. There is no Day Care Center in the campus.
  20. There is no earmarked boundary for medical college in the campus.
  21. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Subharti Medical College, Meerut for the award of MBBS degree granted by Swami Vivekanand Subharti University, Meerut against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and to grant 01 month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council for further consideration of the matter.

*Dr. Reena Nayyar recused herself from the meeting.*

**96. Complaint of Shri Hemant Kalra regarding appointment of Dr. Davinder Kumar to the post of Deputy Secretary in the office of MCI.**

The Executive Committee of the Council after careful consideration and deliberations recorded its decision in the concerned file.

*Dr. Reena Nayyar re-joined the meeting.*

**97. Recommendations of the MCI under clause 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 for debarment of six medical colleges for two academic years.**

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter alongwith the letter from the Under Secretary to Govt. of India dated 21.09.2015 asking MCI to give a fresh hearing to the Institutions where the Council had recommended to the Central Government for application of clause 8(3)(1)(d) of

Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 before taking action for their debarment for 2 years. The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the legal opinion dated 19.10.2015 from Sh. Gaurav Sharma, Council Advocate which reads as under:-

*"The querist has sought my opinion on the Govt. of India letter dated 21.09.2015, requesting the querist to grant hearing to the medical colleges who were seeking renewal of permission including increase of intake for admitting the next batch of the MBBS students for the academic session 2015-16, before taking action of debarring the college under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 for two academic years.*

*The querist, during inspection of medical colleges for renewal of permission for the academic session 2015-16 including increase of intake, had come across certain medical colleges which were found to have employed teachers with fake / forged documents including declaration forms / attendance registers and other related documents pertaining to their employment. In the case of such medical colleges, once the querist had found that they had indulged in unethical practices in order to secure grant of permission for the academic session 2015-16, the querist, in all such cases had invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, and had recommended to the Ministry of Health, Government of India not to grant renewal of permission (including increase of intake) for admitting the next Batch of MBBS students for the current academic session 2015-16 and the next academic session 2016-17.*

*The Govt. of India, after receiving the recommendations of the querist, had disapproved the applications of the concerned medical colleges seeking renewal of permission (including increase of intake) for admitting the next batch of MBBS students for the current academic session 2015-16 only, whereas as per Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 the medical colleges ought to have being debarred for the current academic session 2015-16 as well as the next academic session 2016-17.*

*Since, it was felt by the querist that there was some omission in the proper and necessary application of the binding and mandatory provision of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, whereby there was neither any jurisdiction nor any permissibility by the Govt. of India to relax the mandatory stipulation for debarring the concerned medical colleges from being considered for two academic sessions, thus the querist vide its letter dated 06.07.2015 had requested the Govt. of India to implement Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) against the concerned medical colleges and bar them for two academic sessions i.e. 2015-16 & 2016-17.*

*The Govt. of India, in response to the querist's letter dated 06.07.2015, vide its letter dated 21.09.2015, in relation to medical colleges which had sought renewal of permission (including increase of intake) for admitting the next batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2015-16 and the cases in which the querist had recommended debarment for two academic sessions i.e. 2015-16 & 2016-17 on account of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999; has now requested the querist to give the said medical colleges a fresh hearing before taking such action.*

*I have gone through the relevant file of the querist along with the provisions of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and before giving any specific opinion in the matter, it would be appropriate to consider the following facts:-*

*In discharge of its statutory obligations towards maintenance of highest standards in medical education in the country, by virtue of provisions of Section 33 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 the querist has been empowered, with the prior approval of the Central Govt., to frame Regulations for laying down minimum standards of infrastructure, clinical material, teaching faculty and other requirements for conduct of medicine courses. In the case of MCI Vs. State of Karnataka- (1998) 6 SCC 131, the Hon'ble Apex Court has held that the regulations of the querist are binding and mandatory. The relevant portion of the judgement is reproduced as under:-*

*".....27..... It is the Medical Council which is primarily responsible for fixing standards of medical education and overseeing that these standards are maintained. It is the Medical Council which is the principal body to lay down conditions for recognition of medical colleges which would include the fixing of intake for admission to a medical college. We have already seen in the beginning of this judgment various provisions of the Medical Council Act. It is, therefore, the Medical Council which in effect grants recognition and also withdraws the same. Regulations under Section 33 of the Medical Council Act, which were made in 1977, prescribe the accommodation in the college and its associated teaching hospitals and teaching and technical staff and equipment in*

various departments in the college and in the hospitals. These regulations are in considerable detail. ....

**28.** ..... Standards have been laid by the Medical Council, an expert body, for the purpose of imparting proper medical education and for maintaining uniform standards of medical education throughout the country. Seats in medical colleges cannot be increased indiscriminately without regard to proper infrastructure as per the regulations of the Medical Council.

**29.** A medical student requires gruelling study and that can be done only if proper facilities are available in a medical college and the hospital attached to it has to be well equipped and the teaching faculty and doctors have to be competent enough that when a medical student comes out, he is perfect in the science of treatment of human beings and is not found wanting in any way. The country does not want half-baked medical professionals coming out of medical colleges when they did not have full facilities of teaching and were not exposed to the patients and their ailments during the course of their study. .... After the insertion of Sections 10-A, 10-B and 10-C in the Medical Council Act, the Medical Council has framed regulations with the previous approval of the Central Government which were published in the Gazette of India dated 29-9-1993 (though the notification is dated 20-9-1993). ....

**30.** ..... Nivedita Jain case<sup>1</sup> does not say that all the regulations framed by the Medical Council with the previous approval of the Central Government are directory or mere recommendatory. It is not that only future admissions will have to be regulated on the basis of the capacity fixed or determined by the Medical Council. The plea of the State Government that power to regulate admission to medical colleges is the prerogative of the State has to be rejected....."

The observations made in the judgment of *MCI Vs. State of Karnataka - (1998) 6 SCC 131*, with reference to medical courses were re-emphasised by the Constitution Bench of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in para 57 of the judgement in the case of *Dr. Preeti Srivastava Vs. State of M.P. - (1999) 7 SCC 120*, wherein it has been laid down as under:-

**".....57. In the case of Medical Council of India v. State of Karnataka a Bench of three Judges of this Court has distinguished the observations made in Nivedita Jain. It has also disagreed with Ajay Kumar Singh v. State of Bihar and has come to the conclusion that the Medical Council regulations have a statutory force and are mandatory. The Court was concerned with admissions to the MBBS course and the regulations framed by the Indian Medical Council relating to admission to the MBBS course. The Court took note of the observations in State of Kerala v. T.P. Roshana (SCC at p.580) to the effect that under the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956, the Medical Council of India has been set up as an expert body to control the minimum standards of medical education and to regulate their observance. It has implicit power to supervise the qualifications or eligibility standards for admission into medical institutions. There is, under the Act an overall vigilance by the Medical Council to prevent sub-standard entrance qualifications for medical courses. These observations would apply equally to postgraduate medical courses. We are in respectful agreement with this reasoning....."**

In exercise of the powers conferred by Section 33 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956, the querist, with prior permission from Central Govt. has framed the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999. These Regulations have been amended from time to time. The provisions of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 were amended vide Notification dated 16.04.2010 under Section 33 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 with the prior approval of the Govt. of India. By way of the amendment dated 16.04.2010, amongst others, the provision of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) was added to the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999. The relevant portion of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) is reproduced as under:-

".....

**8. GRANT OF PERMISSION:**

.....

.....

(3)(1) The permission to establish a medical college and admit students may be granted initially for a period of one year and may be renewed on yearly basis subject to verification of the achievements of annual targets. It shall be the responsibility of the person to apply to the Medical Council of India for purpose of renewal six months prior to

the expiry of the initial permission. This process of renewal of permission will continue till such time the establishment of the medical college and expansion of the hospital facilities are completed and a formal recognition of the medical college is granted. Further admissions shall not be made at any stage unless the requirements of the Council are fulfilled. The Central Government may at any stage convey the deficiencies to the applicant and provide him an opportunity and time to rectify the deficiencies.

PROVIDED that in respect of

.....

.....

(d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked / forged documents:

If it is observed that any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked / forged documents and have submitted the Declaration Form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission / recognition for award of M.B.B.S. degree / processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two Academic Years – i.e. that Academic Year and the next Academic Year also.....”

Regulation 8(3) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment 2010 Part II) deals with the Grant of Permission and Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) deals with a situation where a medical college has tried to play fraud with the querist and / or the Central Govt. by submitting fake / forged documents in relation to teaching faculty employed by it. The conduct of a medical college plays a vital role while evaluating the application of the medical college for grant of renewal of permission. Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) categorically provides that, if during an inspection, a medical college is found to have employed teaching faculty with fake or forged documents, the querist must take a serious view of the conduct of the medical college and medical college will not be considered for permission for the current and the ensuing academic session. These stringent provisions were introduced with the motive to discourage a medical college from indulging in corrupt and unethical practices so as to secure grant of permission / renewal of permission, as well as in order to set as example for the other medical colleges to dissuade them from employing faculty with forged / fabricated documents. In any case, a person who has indulged in forged / fabricated documents does not have any legal or statutory right of hearing.

The Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgement dated 06.09.2013 in the case of Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly Versus Medical Council of India & Another – (2013) 15 SCC 516 has categorically held that the querist can take action under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 if prima facie it is established that fake teachers were shown by the College to seek permission from querist. The relevant portion of the said judgment is quoted as under:-

“...29. We have now to examine the legality of decision of MCI taken on 13-7-2013 in the light of the above factual and legal scenario. We have already indicated that when sanction was accorded on 20-6-2013 it was categorically stated by MCI that the same was accorded subject to certain conditions. It was stated therein that in case false/wrong declaration or fabricated documents have been used for procuring permission of the Board of Governors of the increased intake and if the said misconduct was brought to the notice or comes to the knowledge of MCI, at any stage during the current academic year (2013-2014) the Institution/College would not be liable to be considered for renewal of the permission against the increased intake for the next academic year and that renewal of permission against the increased intake for the academic year 2013-2014 and for the next academic year and the same would be liable to be revoked. Having received the letter of CBI as well as the charge-sheet the impugned order dated 13-7-2013 was issued by MCI revoking the letter of permission granted for the academic year 2013-2014.

30. We are of the view that the above decision taken by the MCI is in accordance with the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulation (Amendment 2010 Part II). The above-mentioned Regulation was issued by the MCI in exercise of its powers under Section 33 of the IMC Act, 1956 with the previous sanction of the Central Government. Clause 8.3 of the Regulation deals with the Grant of Permission, sub-clause 8(3)(1)(d) deals with the

colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged documents.  
Those provisions are extracted herein below:

*"8(3)(1)(d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged documents:*

*If it is observed that any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the Declaration Form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of M.B.B.S. degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two Academic Years – i.e. that Academic Year and the next Academic Year also.*

*However, the office of the Council shall ensure that such inspections are not carried out at least 3 days before upto 3 days after important religious and festival holidays declared by the Central/State Government."*

.....  
**33.** *The petitioners are governed by the 1999 Regulations as amended by the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations, (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), especially Regulation 8(3)(1)(d), in the event of which, when MIC finds that the college has employed fake/forged documents for renewal of permission/recognition for processing applications, etc., that institute will not be able to be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the application for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year. In this case, CBI's letter was received on 11-7-2013 by MCI and it was placed before the Board of Governors on 12-7-2013 and the revocation order was passed on 13-7-2013 revoking the renewal of permission for the 2nd batch of students against the increased intake from 100 to 150 students for the academic year 2013-2014.*

**34.** *We are of the considered view that the MCI need not wait till the culmination of the trial initiated on the basis of the charge-sheet filed by the CBI. The investigation by a premier agency like the CBI has prima facie revealed that the college has used fake and forged materials to get sanction for the intake for the year 2008-09, in our view, that is sufficient for the MCI to take action in accordance with the Regulations 8(1)(3)(d) of Regulations 2013....."*

*It is relevant to point out that the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt., in the case of National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur during a regular inspection had observed that the college had misled the then Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. regarding the teaching faculty as there was a variation in the number of faculty members found during the inspection of postgraduate and undergraduate courses being conducted at the said medical college.*

*The then Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. in view of the college having indulged in employing fake faculty and misleading the MCI assessors, after considering the case of the medical college had under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 decided to bar the college from making admissions for increased admission capacity from 100 to 150 in MBBS course for the academic session 2012-13 & 2013-14.*

*The National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur being aggrieved by the decision of the then Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012, had challenged the said decision before the Hon'ble Supreme Court by way of W.P. (C) No. 272/2012. The Hon'ble Supreme Court after hearing detailed submissions on behalf of the college had declined to entertain the said petition therefore the medical college withdrew the said writ petition and the same was dismissed as withdrawn vide order dated 10.07.2012 without any liberty to the said medical college.*

*Thereafter, National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur had filed W. P. (C) No. 4509/2012 before the Hon'ble Delhi High Court challenging the same decision of the then Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012, when the Hon'ble Delhi High Court also declined to entertain the said writ petition, which was disposed off vide order dated 30.07.2012 with certain directions.*

*In this view of the matter, for the current academic year i.e. 2015-16, during the inspections of various medical colleges, the querist came across certain medical colleges which were found to have employed teachers with fake / forged documents including the Declaration Forms / attendance registers etc. pertaining to such faculty members. The querist, in all such cases, had decided to invoke Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and further recommended to the Govt. of India not to grant permission for establishment of new medical colleges as well as not to grant renewal of permission (including increase of intake) for admitting the next batch of the MBBS students for the current academic session 2015-16 and the next academic session 2016-17.*

Such recommendations were forwarded to the Govt. of India in reference to the following medical colleges:-

Renewal of Permission

1. Malla Reddy Medical College for Women, Jeedimetla, Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh
2. NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Visakhapatnam
3. Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad
4. RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Center, Jatkheddi, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh

Renewal of Permission for Increased Intake

1. Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore
2. Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar

The Govt. of India, after receiving the recommendations of the querist in this regard, had taken a decision to disapprove the applications received seeking renewal of permission (including increase of intake) for admitting the next batch of the MBBS students for the current academic session for the academic year 2015-16 only, whereas as per Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, the applicant medical colleges should have been debarred for the current academic session 2015-16 as well as the next academic session 2016-17.

In view of the above factual matrix, the provisions of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and settled law in this regard, it is clear that, under the binding and mandatory provisions of the IMC Act, 1956 and the Statutory Regulations made thereunder, any college falling within the purview of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, is necessarily required to be debarred for the Statutorily prescribed period of two years and this statutory stipulation being binding and mandatory cannot be relaxed / varied by any authority under the IMC Act, 1956.

In my opinion, neither the querist nor the Central Govt. can take a issue of forgery / fabrication lightly, since the same is not something which can be cured, rectified or answered by a medical college once they were found employing teachers with fake / forged documentation, experience certificates, etc, especially when the college undertakes that they have verified the same. The credibility of a medical college plays a crucial role in maintaining the standard of medical education as the students of the medical college after completing their medical course shall deal with general public and as such the foundation of their medical profession cannot be based on a falsehood. Further, in case a medical college which is found to have employed teachers on the basis of fake / forged documents including having submitted the Declaration Forms of such faculty, is not seriously penalized, the same will not only give them strength to present such faculty again in future inspections but also encourage other colleges to indulge in similar malpractices.

A reading of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, would make it clear that there is no provision for granting any hearing to the medical college after the querist has recommended to the Government of India not to grant renewal of permission including increase of intake for admitting next batch of MBBS students for the current academic session 2015-16 & 2016-17. Further there is no provision of granting any hearing in the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations made thereunder. The Hon'ble Apex Court in the case of Manohar Lal Sharma Vs. Medical Council of India & Ors. (2013) 10 SCC 60, while considering various issues relating to medical colleges, was pleased to observe that the querist while performing their duties as per the provisions of the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations made thereunder, is not performing the functions of a quasi judicial authority and thus the strict principles of natural justice shall not applicable to the functioning of the querist. It was further held by the Hon'ble Supreme Court that once the inspections are conducted by the doctors of unquestionable integrity and reputation, who are experts in their fields, hence there is no reason to disbelieve the assessment report.

Thus, I am of the view that neither any "hearing" is contemplated under the provisions of the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations made thereunder nor can the same be claimed

*as a matter of right by a medical college against which Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 has been invoked.*

*I have nothing further to add at this point of time."*

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to accept the legal opinion and inform the Central Government, Ministry of Health & F.W., accordingly.

**98. Consideration to review performance of members of the Sub-Committee.**

The Executive Committee of the Council reconstituted the following Sub-Committees as under:-

**A. Ethics Sub-Committee**

1. Prof.(Dr.) Dhruva Jyoti Borah, Guwahati, Assam - Chairman
2. Dr. D. Santharam, Chennai - Member
3. Dr. Nanandkar Sudhir Digambar, Mumbai - Member
4. Dr. Nileshbhai V. Parekh, Gujarat - Member
5. Dr. Rajiva Ranjan, Patna, Bihar - Member
6. Dr. Sudipto Roy, Kolkata - Member
7. Dr. Satya Prakash Yadav, Gurgaon - Member
8. Dr. John Zohmingthanga, Mizoram - Member
9. Dr. Vinay Kumar Aggarwal, New Delhi - Member
10. Dr. Jai Vir Singh, Lucknow - Member
11. Dr. Rajendra Airan, Madhya Pradesh - Member
12. Sh. Ruchin Midha, Advocate - New Delhi

**B. Building Sub-Committee**

1. Dr. Vinay Kumar Aggarwal, New Delhi - Chairman
2. Dr. Naraina Venkatesh Bhandare, Goa – Member
3. Dr. S.P. Yadav, Gurgaon – Member
4. Dr. Gurmej Singh Gill, Jalandhar, Punjab - Member

**C. Fake Faculty Sub-Committee**

1. Dr. Vijay Kumar Jain, Rohtak – Chairman
2. Prof. (Dr.) Ashwani Kumar, New Delhi - Member
3. Shri Shikhar Ranjan, Law Officer, MCI
4. Shri Anupam Dhua, Computer Programmer, MCI
5. Mrs. S. Savitha, Asstt. Secretary, MCI

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

(Dr. Reena Nayyar)  
Secretary I/c.

New Delhi, dated  
28<sup>th</sup> October, 2015

**APPROVED**

(Dr. Jayshree Mehta)  
President