

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA

POSTGRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee meeting held on 17th March, 2017 at 11:00 A.M. in the Office of the Medical Council of India, Pocket-14, Sector-8, Dwarka, New Delhi.

Present:

1.	Dr. S.B. Siwach	Chairman, Former Director, Pandit B D Sharma PGI, Rohtak, Haryana
2.	Dr. (Mrs.) Rani Bhaskaran	President, Travancore-Cochin Medical Council, Thiruvananthapuram
3.	Dr. Vora Nitin Sumanchandra	Dean, GMERS Medical College Sola, Near New Gujarat High Court, Sola, S.G. Highway, Ahmedabad, Gujarat-380061
4.	Dr. Deelip Govindrao Mhaisekar	Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik
5.	Dr. Dhruva Jyoti Borah	Principal-cum-Chief Suptd., Jorhat Medical College & Hospital, Jorhat (Assam).
6.	Dr. Datteswar Hota	Professor & HoD, SCB Medical College & Hospital, Cuttack, Orissa
7.	Dr. Bhanu Prakash Dubey	Dean, L N Medical College, Bhopal

Dr. Reena Nayyar – Secretary I/c

The Chairman, welcome the members of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee.

Leave of absence was received from Dr. K S Sharma & Dr. Raja Babu Panwar Members, Postgraduate Medical Education Committee.

1. **Minutes of the last meeting of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee – confirmation of.**

The minutes of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee meeting held on 07/03/2017 were confirmed in the meeting itself.

2. **Minutes of the last meeting of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee – action taken thereon.**

Minutes of the meetings dated 07.03.2017 are still not received from the Oversight Committee Action will be taken on receipt of the Minutes from the Oversight Committee.

The following items are the adjourned items of the last meeting of the Postgraduate Committee held on 07.03.2017.

3. West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata - Recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2014, 01.07.2015 & 10.05.2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 02 seats at North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2014, 01.07.2015 & 10.05.2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MS(ENT) qualification for 02 seats granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata in respect of students being trained at North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

4. Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur - Recognition of MD(Microbiology) qualification against increased intake from 04(Four) to 06(Six) seats in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Thrissur.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2013) and compliance dated 14/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Microbiology) qualification against increased intake from 04(Four) to 06(Six) seats at Government Medical College, Thrissur granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2013) and compliance dated 14/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Microbiology) qualification against increased intake from 04(Four) to 06(Six) seats granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Thrissur be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

5. **Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik - Recognition of MD(Anaesthesia) qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Latur.**

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2014 30.06.2015 & 11.04.2016) and compliance dated 10/06/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Anaesthesia) qualification for 01 seat at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Latur granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2014 30.06.2015 & 11.04.2016) and compliance dated 10/06/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD(Anaesthesia) qualification for 01 seat granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Latur because of the following facts:-

1. With respect to Dr. Sainath K. Sonale, in earlier assessment remark was that "He does not possess 3 years experience as Resident." In the present assessment, experience as Junior Resident from 12/02/2007 to 29/02/2008 i.e. 1 year at this Institute is shown which was not shown in earlier assessment dt. 11/04/2016. Such retrospective changes to make a person eligible are not permissible & he cannot be considered. His total experience as Junior Resident/ House Officer etc. is 2 years and 21 days and not 3 years 1 month. It has been wrongly calculated. Hence, not eligible.
2. With respect to Dr. S.K. Patil, Senior Resident, in the present assessment, experience at LTMC, Mumbai from 15/02/2007 to 31/07/2008 I shown as "House Officer/Junior Resident"; in the earlier assessment dt. 11/04/2016, the same experience was shown as "Tutor". Further, experience from 04/08/2008 to 31/08/2009 is shown as "Junior Resident" which was not shown in earlier assessment. Experience from 08/09/2010 to 03/02/2012 at this Institute is shown as "Junior Resident" which in earlier assessment was shown as "Tutor". Such retrospective changes to make a person eligible are not permissible & he cannot be considered.
3. Dr. B.K. Gomsale, Senior Resident: Registrar is a designation equivalent to Senior Resident. He was Tutor only for 2 years 7 months against the requirement of 3 years. Hence, not eligible.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 1(One) seat after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but

definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

Place before Ethics Committee.

6. **Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur/ Kerala University - Recognition of MD(Community Medicine) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at M E S Medical College , Perintalmanna Malappuram Distt.Kerala.**

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015 & 06.06.2016) and compliance dated 19/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Community Medicine) qualification for 2 seats at M E S Medical College , Perintalmanna Malappuram Distt.Kerala granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur/ Kerala University.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015 & 06.06.2016) and compliance dated 19/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Community Medicine) qualification for 2 seats granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur/ Kerala University in respect of students being trained at M E S Medical College , Perintalmanna Malappuram Distt.Kerala be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

7. **D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur - Renewal of recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification for 4 seats in respect of students being trained at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur.**

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (09/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 17/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification for 4 seats at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur granted by D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (09/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 17/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that the recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification for 4 seats granted by D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur in respect of students being trained at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur be renewed.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of

recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

8. King George's Medical University, U.P. Lucknow (Deemed University) - Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at Command Hospital, Lucknow.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (20.05.2014 & 09.05.2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 01 seat at Command Hospital, Lucknow granted by King George's Medical University, U.P. Lucknow (Deemed University).

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (20.05.2014 & 09.05.2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Pathology) qualification for 01 seat granted by King George's Medical University, U.P. Lucknow (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Command Hospital, Lucknow be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

9. Maharaja Krishnakumarsinghji Bhavnagar University, Bhavnagar - Recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Bhavnagar.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats at Government Medical College, Bhavnagar granted by Maharaja Krishnakumarsinghji Bhavnagar University, Bhavnagar.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Psychiatry) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats granted by Maharaja Krishnakumarsinghji Bhavnagar University, Bhavnagar in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Bhavnagar be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

10. D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur - Recognition of MS(Ophthalmology) qualification against increased intake from 1 to 2 seats and Renewal of recognition for 1 seat in respect of students being trained at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (17/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 17/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MS(Ophthalmology) qualification against increased intake from 1 to 2 seats and Renewal of recognition for 1 seat at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur granted by D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (17/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 17/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MS(Ophthalmology) qualification against increased intake from 1 to 2 seats and not to renew the recognition for 1 seat granted by D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur in respect of students being trained at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur because of the following facts:-

1. With regard to Dr. Sonal Amol, Senior Resident, experience shown in the present assessment and earlier assessment dt. are at variance as under:

Designation	Experience shown in Assessment dt.			
	17/01/2017		17/05/2016	
	From	To	From	To
Junior Resident	01/02/2003	31/07/2003	Not Shown	Not Shown
Junior Resident	01/08/2003	31/01/2004	Not Shown	Not Shown
Junior Resident	01/02/2004	31/07/2004	Not Shown	Not Shown

Such retrospective changes to make a person eligible are not permissible & she cannot be considered. There is no other eligible Senior Resident.

2. No tangible explanation is given for the remark that "*Total number of Minor Operations has decreased from 1,073 in 2015 to 966 in 2015.*" It is also not shown whether it has increased in 2016.
3. OPD, IPD decreased – same census given, as before.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 1(One) seat till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

Admissions done (if any) against these increased number of seats i.e. 1(One) – 2(Two) after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009)

and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

Place before Ethics Committee.

11. **Sri Devraj Urs Academy of Higher Education & Research (Deemed University) - Recognition of MS(Orthopaedics) qualification against increased intake from 03(Three) to 06(Six) seats in respect of students being trained at Sri Devaraj Urs Medical College, Kolar.**

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (28/12/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report ((May, 2013),(December,2013) & (June, 2015), 05.04.2016) and compliance dated 03/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MS(Orthopaedics) qualification against increased intake from 03(Three) to 06(Six) seats at Sri Devaraj Urs Medical College, Kolar granted by Sri Devraj Urs Academy of Higher Education & Research (Deemed University).

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (28/12/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report ((May, 2013),(December,2013) & (June, 2015), 05.04.2016) and compliance dated 03/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MS(Orthopaedics) qualification against increased intake from 03(Three) to 06(Six) seats granted by Sri Devraj Urs Academy of Higher Education & Research (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Sri Devaraj Urs Medical College, Kolar because of the following facts:-

1. Promotion of Dr. Sidharam N. Patil is not as per Regulations. He was promoted Professor on 01/09/2013 after the cut-off date without any publications. Resultantly, Unit-II left with 2 Asst. Professors.
2. Both Senior Residents in Unit II – Dr. Prabhulingareddy Patil & Dr. K.S. Badrinath – possess only 2 y experience as Resident in a medical college affiliated hospital before appointment as Senior Resident; hence not qualified to hold the post. There is no eligible Senior Resident in Unit II
3. Deficiency of promotion of Dr. J.S. Naga Kumar stays. His 2nd publication quoted is a case report and not research publications. It cannot be considered.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. increased intake from 03(Three) to 06(Six) seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as

required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

“This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject.”

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

12. Bharath University, Chennai - Recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification against increased intake from 5 to 6 seats in respect of students being trained at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chennai.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification against increased intake from 5 to 6 seats at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chennai granted by Bharath University, Chennai.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD(General Medicine) qualification against increased intake from 5 to 6 seats granted by Bharath University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chennai because of the following facts:-

1. Promotion of Dr. Anuradha N, Assoc.Prof. is not as per regulations. She was promoted on 01.07.2016, after the cut of date without any publications.
2. Dr. T. Nilavan, Senior Resident in Unit V is shown in continuous employment at this Institute from 05/04/2013 till date in present assessment – upto 03/06/2014 as Junior Resident & as Senior Resident thereafter. However, in the previous assessment dt. 13/06/2016 he was not shown in any capacity whatsoever. Hence the claim of being in continuous employment is doubtful & he cannot be considered. There is no other Senior Resident in the Unit.
3. There are only 5 MRI in the entire hospital on the day of assessment, which is inadequate.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. increased intake from 5 to 6 seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

13. People's University/Barkatulla University, Bhopal - Recognition of MD(Radiodiagnosis) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur, Bhopal.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015 & 09.05.2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Radiodiagnosis) qualification for 02 seats at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur, Bhopal granted by People's University/Barkatulla University, Bhopal.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015 & 09.05.2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Radiodiagnosis) qualification for 02 seats granted by People's University/Barkatulla University, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur, Bhopal be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

14. Sharda University, Greater Noida - Recognition of MD(Microbiology) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at School of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Microbiology) qualification for 2 seats at School of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida granted by Sharda University, Greater Noida.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Microbiology) qualification for 2 seats granted by Sharda University, Greater Noida in respect of students being trained at School of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

15. The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai - Recognition of MD(Anaesthesiology) qualification for 3 seats in respect of students being trained at Mohan Kumaramangalam Medical College, Salem.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (09/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 30/09/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Anaesthesiology) qualification for 3 seats at Mohan Kumaramangalam Medical College, Salem granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (09/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 30/09/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Anaesthesiology) qualification for 3 seats granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Mohan Kumaramangalam Medical College, Salem be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

16. The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai - Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Karpaga Vinayaga Institute of Medical Sciences, Maduranthagam.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (03/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 14/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 2 seats at Karpaga Vinayaga Institute of Medical Sciences, Maduranthagam granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (03/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 14/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Pathology) qualification for 2 seats granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Karpaga Vinayaga Institute of Medical Sciences, Maduranthagam be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

17. Pondicherry University, Puducherry - Renewal of recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification for 03 seats in respect of students being trained at Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (12/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 11/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification for 03 seats at Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry granted by Pondicherry University, Puducherry.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (12/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 11/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of MS(General Surgery) qualification for 03 seats granted by Pondicherry University, Puducherry in respect of students being trained at Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry because of the following facts:-

1. Dr. Jeyraman is promoted as Assoc. Prof. with experience of only 2 m as Asst. Prof. against requirement of 5 y; his experience as Senior Resident cannot be considered for promotion to Assoc. Prof.; hence his promotion is not as per Regulations & he cannot be considered.
2. Resultantly Unit 3 is headed by Asst. Prof. & it cannot be considered as a teaching Unit.
3. It is shown that there are 12 beds in Casualty ICU available for Surgical patients & 5 beds are earmarked as Surgical ICU beds in ICU adjoining in the Specialty O.T. which is managed jointly by General Surgery, Cardiac Surgery & Anaesthesiology. It is not clear whether dedicated SICU of 5 beds being managed by General Surgery is available or not. Deficiency remains to that extent.
4. Bed Occupancy in SICU is 60 % on day of assessment. Deficiency remains as it is.
5. Departmental Museum is not available. Arrangement of specimens in Pathology Museum is not a substitute for Museum in the department as such a Museum would also have, instruments, equipment, suture materials, etc. Deficiency remains as it is.
6. No Blood unit was issued to General Surgery on day of assessment.
7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 3(Three) seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally

decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

18. Ch. Charan Singh University - Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 04 seats in respect of students being trained at Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015 & 04.03.2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 04 seats at Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar granted by Ch. Charan Singh University.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015 & 04.03.2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD(Pathology) qualification for 04 seats granted by Ch. Charan Singh University in respect of students being trained at Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar because of the following facts:-

1. Promotion of Brig. G.S. Manchanda is not as per Regulations. He was promoted Professor on 01/10/2014 after the cut-off date. He has only 2 publications against the requirement of 4. All experience dates and designations of Dr. Manchanda has been changed from report dated 12/05/2015. He was shown Assoc. Professor and Professor in various Military Hospitals, which has now been deleted. This is not permissible. There is no Certificate from DGAFMS about his period and places of posting as Graded/ Classified Specialist and Advisor attached without which, his equated teaching designation cannot be decided.
2. Resultantly, there is a deficiency of Assoc. Professor: 1.
3. No Pathological Postmortems done.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 4(Four) seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

19. The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai - Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (04/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 05/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Pathology) qualification for 2 seats at Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (04/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 05/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Pathology) qualification for 2 seats granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

20. Sharda University, Greater Noida - Recognition of MD (Pathology) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at School of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD (Pathology) qualification for 2 seats at School of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida granted by Sharda University, Greater Noida.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD (Pathology) qualification for 2 seats granted by Sharda University, Greater Noida in respect of students being trained at School of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida because of the following facts:-

1. Workload of CT guided FNAC is very low – only 06 in 2016.
2. Workload of USG guided FNAC is low – 68 in 2016.
3. Deficiency of Dr. Prachi Kumar stays as such. None of her publications is in Pathology Journal. She was promoted Professor on 01/06/2015 after cut off date.
4. Pathological Postmortems not done. No permission needed for this.
5. Deficiency of Dr. Suparna Dubey stays as such. No reference (year, page, volume) of any of her publications quoted.
6. Deficiency of Dr. Rupak Agarwal stays as such. None of the publications quoted is in Pathology Journal.
7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 2(Two) seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and

not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

“This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject.”

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

21. Kerala University of Health Sciences - Recognition of DCH qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Sri Gokulam Medical College Trust & Research Foundation, Trivandrum, Kerala.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015 & 03.06.2016) and compliance dated 18/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of DCH qualification for 2 seats at Sri Gokulam Medical College Trust & Research Foundation, Trivandrum, Kerala granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015 & 03.06.2016) and compliance dated 18/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize DCH qualification for 2 seats granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences in respect of students being trained at Sri Gokulam Medical College Trust & Research Foundation, Trivandrum, Kerala because of the following facts:-

1. Promotion of Dr. Sree Devi N., Professor, Unit-II is not as per Regulations. She was promoted on 23/08/2013 after the cut-off date without any publications.
2. Dr. P.M.C. Nair is appointed as Professor & HOD of Neonatology w.e.f. 03/12/2015; hence he cannot be considered as faculty in Paediatrics.
3. Resultantly, there are only 2 faculty in Unit III & it cannot be considered PG Unit.
4. Bed Occupancy is 28 % on day of assessment.
5. There was only 1 patient on the day of Assessment in the Paediatric Endocrinology Clinic.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 2(Two) seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

“This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject.”

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

22. Datta Meghe Instt. of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Nagpur - Renewal of recognition of MD(Physiology) qualification for 4 seats in respect of students being trained at Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Sawangi (Meghe), Wardha.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2015 & 11.04.2016) and compliance dated 18/06/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MD(Physiology) qualification for 4 seats at Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Sawangi (Meghe), Wardha granted by Datta Meghe Instt. of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Nagpur.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2015 & 11.04.2016) and compliance dated 18/06/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that the recognition of MD(Physiology) qualification for 4 seats granted by Datta Meghe Instt. of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Nagpur in respect of students being trained at Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Sawangi (Meghe), Wardha be renewed.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

23. Ch. Charan Singh University - Recognition of MD(Skin & VD) qualification for 1 seat in respect of students being trained at Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Skin & VD) qualification for 1 seat at Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar granted by Ch. Charan Singh University.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Skin & VD) qualification for 1 seat granted by Ch. Charan Singh University in respect of students being trained at Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

24. Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik - Renewal of recognition of MD/MS(OBG) qualification for 02 seats and recognition of DGO qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at A.C.P.M.Medical College, Dhule.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (12/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (December, 2015 & 11.05.2016) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MD/MS(OBG) qualification for 02 seats and recognition of DGO qualification for 01 seat at A.C.P.M.Medical College, Dhule granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (12/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (December, 2015 & 11.05.2016) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of MD/MS(OBG) qualification for 02 seats and not to recognize DGO qualification for 01 seat granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at A.C.P.M.Medical College, Dhule because of the following facts:-

1. Dr. Shilpa B. Rao, Asst. Prof., passed DNB from Non-teaching hospital, she has no 3 years experience in a teaching hospital at the time of appointment as Asst.Professor.
2. Promotion of Dr. Nitin N. Kulkarni, Assoc. Prof. is not as per regulations. He was promoted on 02.11.2016 after the cut of date without any publications. (No publication attached although the college authorities has stated that he has 2 publications.)
3. OPD attendance is only 91 at 2 p.m. on day of assessment which is inadequate.
4. There were only 2 Major, 2 Minor & 1 Daycare Operations on day of assessment. Average of Major Operation is only 1/day.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 2(Two) seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

Admissions done (if any) against these increased number of seats i.e. 1(One) seat after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

“This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject.”

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

25. Vinayaka Mission's University, salem - Recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats in respect of students being trained at Vinayaka Mission's Kirupananda Variyar Medical College, Salem.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April 2014 & April, 2016) and compliance dated 21/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats at Vinayaka Mission's Kirupananda Variyar Medical College, Salem granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, salem.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (10/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April 2014 & April, 2016) and compliance dated 21/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, salem in respect of students being trained at Vinayaka Mission's Kirupananda Variyar Medical College, Salem because of the following facts:-

1. MRI is stated to be available at Superspecialty hospital. Earlier remark was that it is a separate hospital not under the control of Dean. Presently no proper explanation is given for this. It is also not clearly mentioned whether it is under control of Dean or not.
2. With regard to remark “Patients in VIMS Hospital are managed by Asst. Prof. of Medical College during working hours”, it is stated that VIMS Hospital is a Superspecialty Hospital & faculty from the departments are posted in rotation for attending on patients. This is not permissible. During working hours, faculty from Medical College have to be in College/teaching hospital owned by the college.
3. Explanation of deficiency 4 is absolutely non-convincing. This amounts to providing misleading information. The Postgraduate Committee then decided to seek explanation of Dean & HoD on this.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. increased intake from 02 to 04 seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

26. The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai - Renewal of recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification for 4 seats in respect of students being trained at K.A.P. Viswanatham Govt. Medical College, Tiruchirapalli.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 03/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification for 4 seats at K.A.P. Viswanatham Govt. Medical College, Tiruchirapalli granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 03/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification for 4 seats granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at K.A.P. Viswanatham Govt. Medical College, Tiruchirapalli because of the following facts:-

1. Dr. P.V. Krishnan, Assoc. Professor was not available in in assessment day. Hence, Unit-V left with only 2 Asst. Professors.
2. Promotion of Dr. M. Rajsekharan is not as per Regulations. He was promoted on 24/03/2016 after the cut-off date. Two papers quoted are not research articles. Unit-I has no other Assoc. Professor.
3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 4(Four) seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

“...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.”

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

27. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh - Renewal of recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats in respect of students being trained at Alluri Sitarama Raju Academy of Medical Sciences, Eluru.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (18/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor’s Report (June,2016) and compliance dated 19/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats at Alluri Sitarama Raju Academy of Medical Sciences, Eluru granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (18/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor’s Report (June,2016) and compliance dated 19/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh in respect of students being trained at Alluri Sitarama Raju Academy of Medical Sciences, Eluru because of the following facts:-

1. With regard to Dr. Nagalla Santhi, Senior Resident, experience shown in the present assessment and earlier assessment dt. 20/06/2016 are at variance as under:

Designation	Experience shown in Assessment dt.			
	18/01/2017		20/06/2016	
	From	To	From	To
Junior Resident	01/07/2014	10/08/2015	Not Shown	Not Shown
Senior Resident	11/08/2015	Till Date	01/07/2014	Till Date

Such retrospective changes to make a person eligible are not permissible & she cannot be considered. There is no other eligible Senior Resident. This amounts to supplying misleading information.

2. Dr. Arigela Vasundhara, Professor was not available on the day of assessment.
3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. against increased intake from 02 to 03 seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the

letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

Place before Ethics Committee

28. Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences University(Deemed),karad - Renewal of recognition of MD(Radiodiagnosis) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats in respect of students being trained at Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (18.05.2015) on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MD(Radiodiagnosis) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats at Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad granted by Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences University(Deemed),karad.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (18.05.2015) and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of MD(Radiodiagnosis) qualification against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats granted by Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences University (Deemed), Karad in respect of students being trained at Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad because of the following facts:-

1. Even though assessment is carried out in January 2017, Stipend paid by Institute to I/II/III year Residents is Rs. 42,225; Rs. 42,675 & Rs. 43,125 p.m. to I/II/III year Residents which is less than that paid by State Govt. to I/II/III year Residents & is contrary to PG ME Regulations. Further, it is also stated that the same amount is paid by State Govt. to I/II/III year Residents which is not correct and amounts to provide misleading information.
2. DSA is not performed in this department.
3. Workload of Mammography is < 1/day.
4. Workload of CT guided FNAC is only 08 & of USG guided FNAC is only 55 in 2016 which is very low.
5. Only 3 Senior Residents eligible. Following 3 Senior Residents are not eligible: Dr. Arvind R Shinde, Dr. Subha Dixit & Dr. Virendra V.Patil, are not eligible as per faculty table, they have no three years experience as Jr. Resident in a medical college at the time of appointment as Sr. Resident.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. against increased intake from 02 to 04 seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to

seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

Place before Ethics Committee.

Note: The previous Assessor be removed from the Penal of Assessor.

29. The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai - Recognition of MD (Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (25/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD (Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 2 seats at Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (25/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD (Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 2 seats granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical College University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

30. D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur - Recognition of MD(IHBT) qualification for 1 seat in respect of students being trained at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(IHBT) qualification for 1 seat at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur granted by D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (16/01/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD(IHBT) qualification for 1 seat granted by D.Y. Patil Education Society Deemed University, Kolhapur in respect of students being trained at Dr. D. Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur because of the following facts:-

1. With respect to Dr. Mahadeo A. Mane, Professor & HOD, deficiency of not having 2 y training or qualification in IHBT remains as it is. His experience as Asso. Prof. cannot be a substitute for 2 year training. He is appointed straightaway as Professor in IHBT without any experience in this department.
2. With respect to Dr. Sheetal Desai, Asso. Prof., deficiency of not having 2 y training or qualification in IHBT remains as it is. Her experience as Asst. Prof. cannot be a substitute for 2 y training. She is appointed straightaway as Asso. Prof. in IHBT without any experience in this department.
3. PG degree of Dr. Vilas More, Asst. Prof. is not recognized; hence he cannot be considered.
4. Even though the number of Blood units supplied has increased to 5/day in 2016, it is still inadequate.
5. Workload of Bone Marrow Biopsy is only 10 in 2016.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 1(One) seat after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

31. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh - Recognition of MD(Forensic Medicine) qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at N.R.I. Medical College and Hospital, Guntur.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (24.11.2015) and compliance dated 14/12/2016(Under-taking) submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Forensic Medicine) qualification for 01 seat at N.R.I. Medical College and Hospital, Guntur granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (24.11.2015) and compliance dated 14/12/2016(Under-taking) submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central

Government that MD(Forensic Medicine) qualification for 01 seat granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh in respect of students being trained at N.R.I. Medical College and Hospital, Guntur be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

32. Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad - Recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 2 to 4 Seats and Renewal of recognition of DCH qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Era's Lucknow Medical College, Lucknow.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (August, 2015) and compliance dated 13/06/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 2 to 4 Seats and Renewal of recognition of DCH qualification for 2 seats at Era's Lucknow Medical College, Lucknow granted by Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (13/02/2017) along with the Council Assessor's Report (August, 2015) and compliance dated 13/06/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MD(Paediatrics) qualification against increased intake from 2 to 4 Seats and not to renew the recognition of DCH qualification for 2 seats granted by Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad in respect of students being trained at Era's Lucknow Medical College, Lucknow because of the following facts:-

1. Dr. Shitansh J. Srivastava is promoted as Professor after cut-off date; however the column of "Benefit of publications" in the faculty table is left blank implying NIL publications against requirement of 4; hence his promotion is not as per Regulations & he cannot be considered.
2. Dr. Uma S. Prasad is promoted as Professor after cut-off date; however the column of "Benefit of publications" in the faculty table is left blank implying NIL publications against requirement of 4; hence his promotion is not as per Regulations & he cannot be considered.
3. Dr. Mohd. Islam is promoted as Professor after cut-off date; however the column of "Benefit of publications" in the faculty table is left blank implying NIL publications against requirement of 4; hence his promotion is not as per Regulations & he cannot be considered.
4. Dr. Ahsan Ajaz, Senior Resident in Unit I possesses experience of only 2 y as Resident before appointment as Senior Resident; hence not qualified to hold the post.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

33. Chettinad Academy of Research and Education (Deemed University) - Recognition of MS(Orthopedics) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Chettinad Hospital & Research Institute, Kanchipuram.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (06/05/2015) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2015) and compliance dated 21/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination

and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MS(Orthopedics) qualification for 2 seats at Chettinad Hospital & Research Institute, Kanchipuram granted by Chettinad Academy of Research and Education (Deemed University).

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (06/05/2015) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2015) and compliance dated 21/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize MS(Orthopedics) qualification for 2 seats granted by Chettinad Academy of Research and Education (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Chettinad Hospital & Research Institute, Kanchipuram because of the following facts:-

1. In respect of Dr. G. Balaji, in the present assessment his experience from 17/03/2006 to 16/03/2007 is shown as "Junior Resident"; however in earlier assessment dt. 06/05/2016, the same experience is shown as "Tutor". Hence it was pointed out while considering previous assessment report that *"He possesses experience as Tutor which is not permissible designation for clinical departments."* Such retrospective changes to make a person eligible are not permissible & he cannot be considered.
2. Dr. Prashant Madan Mohan does not possess any experience as Resident in a medical college hospital before appointment as Senior Resident; hence not qualified to hold the post.
3. In respect of Dr. S. Alagesan, in the present assessment his experience from 2010 to 2012 at Madurai Medical College is shown as "Junior Resident"; however in earlier assessment dt. 06/05/2016, the same experience is shown as "Tutor". Hence it was pointed out while considering previous assessment report that *"He possesses experience as Tutor which is not permissible designation for clinical departments."* Such retrospective changes to make a person eligible are not permissible & he cannot be considered.
4. Resultantly there is no eligible Senior Resident in Units I & II.
5. There were only 2 Minor Operations on day of assessment.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 2(Two) seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

34. Dr B R Ambedkar University, Agra, U.P. - Recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Institute of Mental Health and Hospital, Agra.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification for 2 seats at Institute of Mental Health and Hospital, Agra granted by Dr B R Ambedkar University, Agra, U.P.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

35. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, A.P. - Recognition of MS(OBG) qualification against increased intake from 03 to 04 seats in respect of students being trained at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (06/06/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (November, 2014 & July, 2015) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MS(OBG) qualification against increased intake from 03 to 04 seats at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, A.P..

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (06/06/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (November, 2014 & July, 2015) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

36. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, A.P. - Renewal of recognition of DGO qualification for 01 seats in respect of students being trained at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (18/05/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of DGO qualification for 01 seats at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, A.P..

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (18/05/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

37. Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth University, Puducherry - Renewal of recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 02 seats and DMRD qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at Mahatama Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 02 seats and DMRD qualification for 01 seat at Mahatama Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry granted by Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth University, Puducherry.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2016) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

38. Veer Narmad South Gujarat University - Recognition of MD(Immuno Haematology & Blood Transfusion) qualification 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Surat.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Immuno Haematology & Blood Transfusion) qualification 02 seats at Government Medical College, Surat granted by Veer Narmad South Gujarat University.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Immuno Haematology & Blood Transfusion) qualification 02 seats granted by Veer Narmad South Gujarat University in respect of students being trained at Government Medical College, Surat be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

39. Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot - Recognition of MD(Immuno Haematology & Blood Transfusion) qualification for 03 seats in respect of students being trained at Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015) and compliance dated 01/11/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Immuno Haematology & Blood Transfusion) qualification for 03 seats at Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015) and compliance dated 01/11/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Immuno Haematology & Blood Transfusion) qualification for 03 seats granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot in respect of students being trained at Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

40. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh - Recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at Bhaskar Medical College, Yenkapally.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (29/04/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 01 seat at Bhaskar Medical College, Yenkapally granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (29/04/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 26/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Radio Diagnosis) qualification for 01 seat granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh in respect of students being trained at Bhaskar Medical College, Yenkapally be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

41. Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi - Recognition of M.Ch.(CTVS) qualification against increased intake from 02(Two) to 04(Four) seats in respect of students being trained at Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Dr. R. M. L. Hospital, New Delhi.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (12/12/2014) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2013) and compliance dated 20/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of M.Ch.(CTVS) qualification against increased intake from 02(Two) to 04(Four) seats at Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Dr. R. M. L. Hospital, New Delhi granted by Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (12/12/2014) along with the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2013) and compliance dated 20/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to recognize M.Ch.(CTVS) qualification against increased intake from 02(Two) to 04(Four) seats granted by Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi in respect of students being trained at Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Dr. R. M. L. Hospital, New Delhi because the earlier deficiencies are still persistings as there is no joining report with revised/re-designated teaching experience of Dr. V.K. Gupta have been submitted.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. increased intake from 02(Two) to 04(Four) seats after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

42. Manipal University, Manipal - Renewal of recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 04 seats in respect of students being trained at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 04 seats at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore granted by Manipal University, Manipal.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2016) and compliance dated 15/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 04 seats granted by Manipal University, Manipal in respect of students being trained at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore because of the following facts:-

Compliance is not satisfactory.

1. With regard to promotion of Dr. Vijendra Shenoy not being as per Regulations, deficiency remains as it is. Out of 3 publications cited in the list, in 2 publications, he is 3rd author & cannot be considered. Resultantly there is only 1 publication to his credit against requirement of 2 & hence his promotion is not as per Regulations & he cannot be considered. 3rd publication is a Case Report, which cannot be considered. Resultantly, Unit-II left with 2 faculty.
2. No satisfactory explanation is given for decrease in Major Operations during the period 2013-2015. Contention of the Institute to aggregate Major & Minor Operations as one entity & then to show increase cannot be accepted as it conceals the fact of decrease in Major Operations which has a direct bearing on quality of teaching.
3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 4(Four) seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

43. Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth University, Puducherry - Recognition of MD(Biochemistry) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Mahatama Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (09/05/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2012 & 02.07.2015) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Biochemistry) qualification for 02 seats at Mahatama Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry granted by Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth University, Puducherry.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (09/05/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (April, 2012 & 02.07.2015) and compliance dated 27/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

44. Utkal University, Orissa - Recognition of MD(Transfusion Medicine) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at SCB Medical College, Cuttack.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015) and compliance dated 31/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Transfusion Medicine) qualification for 02 seats at SCB Medical College, Cuttack granted by Utkal University, Orissa.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (July, 2015) and compliance dated 31/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Transfusion Medicine) qualification for 02 seats granted by Utkal University, Orissa in respect of students being trained at SCB Medical College, Cuttack be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

45. Dr. NTR. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada - Recognition of MD(Transfusion Medicine) qualification for 01 seat in respect of students being trained at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Transfusion Medicine) qualification for 01 seat at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally granted by Dr. NTR. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Transfusion Medicine) qualification for 01 seat granted by Dr. NTR. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

46. Dr. NTR. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada - Recognition of MD(Emergency Medicine) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally.

Read: the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (02/03/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Emergency Medicine) qualification for 02 seats at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally granted by Dr. NTR. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Compliance Verification Assessment Report (02/03/2016) along with the Council Assessor's Report (May, 2015) and compliance dated 25/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Emergency Medicine) qualification for 02 seats granted by Dr. NTR. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

47. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh - Renewal of recognition of D. Ortho qualification for 03 seats in respect of students being trained at Dr. Pinnammaneni Siddhartha Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Chinnaoutpalli.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 24/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Renewal of recognition of D. Ortho qualification for 03 seats at Dr. Pinnammaneni Siddhartha Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Chinnaoutpalli granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 24/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of D. Ortho qualification for 03 seats granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh in respect of students being trained at Dr.

Pinnammaneni Siddhartha Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Chinnaoutpalli because of the following facts:-

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 24/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend not to renew the recognition of D. Ortho qualification for 03 seats granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh in respect of students being trained at Dr. Pinnammaneni Siddhartha Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Chinnaoutpalli because of the following facts:-

Compliance is not satisfactory.

1. MCI cannot count Dr. S. Suresh Babu as Assoc. Professor. College has to demote him.
2. If Dr. Sunil Kumar is demoted as Asst. Professor then Unit-I has no other Assoc. Professor. Hence, it cannot be considered a PG Unit.
3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

Admissions done (if any) against these seats i.e. 3(Three) seats till renewal of their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of recognition granted u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:

"...the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.

48. Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh - Recognition of MD(DVL) qualification against increased intake from 01 to 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amalapuram.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(DVL) qualification against increased intake from 01 to 02 seats at Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amalapuram granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 13/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

49. Swami Rama Himalayan University - Recognition of MD(Anaesthesiology) qualification against increased intake from 03 to 04 seats in respect of students being trained at Himalayan Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 20/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Anaesthesiology) qualification against increased intake from 03 to 04 seats at Himalayan Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun granted by Swami Rama Himalayan University.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 20/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government that MD(Anaesthesiology) qualification against increased intake from 03 to 04 seats granted by Swami Rama Himalayan University in respect of students being trained at Himalayan Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun be recognized and included in the 1st Schedule to the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further decided that the recognition so granted shall be for a maximum period of 5 years from the date of Notification upon which the Institute shall have to apply for renewal of recognition. Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the Postgraduate Course.

50. Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot - Recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis/Radiology) qualification against increased intake from 04 to 06 seats in respect of students being trained at Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 19/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities on the standard of examination and other teaching facilities for Recognition of MD(Radio Diagnosis/Radiology) qualification against increased intake from 04 to 06 seats at Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (June, 2016) and compliance dated 19/10/2016 submitted by the college authorities and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment.

51. Sikkim Manipal Univ. of Health, Medical & Tech. Scs, Gangtok - Recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

Read: the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (June, 2015) (Feb., 2015) , (April, 2014) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (June, 2015) (Feb., 2015), (April, 2014) and order dated

25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MD(General Medicine) qualification for 2 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok and noted as under:-

1. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Letter of Permission for starting of **MD(General Medicine)** course to the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok was granted by the erstwhile Board of Governors in supersession of the Medical Council of India on **21.03.2011**.

2. The Postgraduate Committee further noted that Regulation 6 (2) and (3) of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulation, 2000 provides as under:

(2) The Institution shall apply for recognition of the post-graduate medical qualification to the Central Government through the affiliating University when the first admitted batch shall be due to appear for the examination to be conducted by the affiliating University.

(3) Failure to seek timely recognition as required in sub-clause (2) shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post-Graduate Course."

3. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further noted that vide Council letters dated **01.04.2015, 26.08.2015 and 09.03.2016** it was informed inter alia to the College as under:

*"Admissions done (if any) against these **seats i.e. 02 seats** after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:*

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats."

4. The Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had applied for recognition on 11.02.2014. Subsequently, the inspection for recognition was conducted on 22.04.2014. Thereafter, the deficiencies had been communicated to the college on 05.08.2014. Compliance received from the college vide letter dated 26.08.2014 was considered by P.G Committee on 30.09.2014 and P.G Committee decided to verify compliance by way of assessment and same was verified on 23.02.2015. Compliance verification assessment report was considered by the P.G. Committee on 19.03.2015. The deficiencies pointed out by the P.G. Committee were communicated to the college on 01.04.2015. Compliance received from college authorities vide letter dated 30.04.2015 was considered by the PG Sub Committee at its meeting held on 26.05.2015 and the committee decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment which was verified on 22.06.2015.

Compliance verification assessment report 22.06.2015 was placed before the P.G Committee at its meeting held on 11.08.2015 and deficiencies pointed out by the PG Committee were communicated to the college authorities on 26.08.2015. Compliance was received from the college authorities vide letter dated 05.10.2015. Compliance dated 05.10.2015 was placed before the P.G. Committee on 01.03.2016 and the deficiencies communicated to college on 09.03.2016.

5. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that aggrieved by the action of the Council in not recommending recognition for four Post-Graduate disciplines offered by it, namely, MD (General Medicine), MD (Pediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) the Sikkim Manipal University and Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had preferred WP (C) No. 24 of 2015. The Institute had prayed before the Hon'ble High Court for following reliefs:-

- (A) *Direct and hold that the deficiencies specified in communications dated 09-07-2015, 14-07-2015, 26-08-2015, 27-08-2015 and 11-09-2015 (as specified in paragraph 351) are either non-existent or stand complied with, and direct that recognition be accorded in terms of Section 11 of the Indian Medical Council Act, to the following courses: MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatric), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry);*
- (B) *In the alternative to [A] above, direct that a fresh time bound inspection be conducted either by an independent expert committee, or by the MCI designated assessors along with eminent independent observers, and such inspection be limited to the deficiencies already pointed out and enlisted and in respect of which compliance has been forwarded by the Petitioner vide letters dated 06-08-2015 (in respect of MS - ENT), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Paediatrics) [sic], 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD -Paediatrics), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Psychiatry) and that pursuant to such inspection a final decision be taken by the Respondent No.2 in a time bound manner;*
- (C) *Confirm the admissions made in the above-said courses in the academic year 2015-16; and*
- (D) *Pass any order or orders as this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in the facts and circumstances of the case as well as in the interest of justice.*

6. The aforesaid petition came to be disposed of on 25.05.2016. The Hon'ble High Court directed as under:

- I. *As the Petitioner has asserted that no deficiency exists after compliance has been made by them, post the impugned communications in all the Post-Graduate Courses, this circumstance has to be gauged by a Compliance Verification. The Respondent No.2 shall carry out fresh inspection of the Petitioner's Institution within two months from today. The Inspection team of the Respondent No.2 shall comprise of two eminent independent observers, apart from the Assessors of Respondent No.2. Needless to add that the inspection shall be carried out in terms of Paragraph 65(v) and (vi) of the Judgment of this Court in WP(C) No.37 of 2011 dated 27-04-2012;*
- II. *Pending such verification, the Petitioners shall deposit a sum of Rs.25,00,000/- (Rupees twenty five lakhs) only, with the MCI, Respondent No.2. The Petitioner shall file an undertaking through its Registrar, within two weeks from today, to the effect that no deficiencies exist in the Petitioner's Institution for the purposes of the Post-Graduate Courses, for which permission had been granted. Copy of undertaking be furnished to Respondent No.1 also. If at the time of inspection the undertaking is found to be incorrect, the deposit shall stand forfeited;*
- III. *Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;*

- IV. *For students who were admitted in the four Post- Graduate Courses in 2011 and have completed their Courses in 2014, qualifying them for the award to recognised medical qualification, the Respondent No.1 shall grant recognition to their Degrees within three months from today; Students pursuing their Post-Graduate Courses in the Academic year 2015-16, vide Orders of this Court dated 29-05-2015 and 07-04-2016, be allowed to continue their education without hindrance; and*
- V. *I have also considered I.A. No.01 of 2016 wherein the Petitioners have sought for an Order of this Court permitting admission to be made to two seats each in MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) for the Academic Year 2016-17. Keeping in mind the welfare of the students and with the concern that they should not be kept at sea as in the instant matter, it is hereby ordered that admissions shall take place for the said Academic Year 2016-17 only after all requisites are found in place by the Respondent No.2, irrespective of the fact that during such exercise the seats may go vacant this Academic Year.*

7. Being aggrieved by the above-mentioned judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, the Council had approached the Hon'ble Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 and the same was listed on 25.07.2016. The Hon'ble Supreme Court, after hearing the parties, vide judgment dated 25.07.2016, was pleased to modify the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim to the extent that assessment team of the Council, which shall carryout the physical assessment of the said medical college, in pursuance of directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, shall include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences and another from P.G.I., Chandigarh. However, the Hon'ble Supreme Court did not interfere with the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, in respect with recognition of degrees of the students admitted in Postgraduate medical courses in the said 4 specialties in the academic year 2011-12. The relevant portion of the judgment dated 25.07.2016, passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 is reproduced herein below:

“

Having heard learned counsel for the parties, we direct the Medical Council of India to include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) and another Professor from P.G.I., Chandigarh, as a part of its “Assessors Team”. This direction, needless to say, annihilates the concept of “independent observer”. We have said so as the Professors, who would belong to A.I.I.M.S. or P.G.I. are supposed to be eminent people and they are expected to be independent.....”

8. Subsequently, as directed by the Hon'ble Apex Court and the Hon'ble High Court by virtue of above referred orders assessment in the subject of General Medicine was carried out by Dr. Naval K. Vikram, Additional Professor (Internal Medicine) on 29.08.2016. The assessment report dated 29.08.2016 alongwith previous assessment reports were considered by the Postgraduate Education Committee in its meeting held on 16.09.2016. The Committee decided that certain clarification regarding appointment/promotion order and service condition of faculty working in STNM Hospital are required for which the Dean may called to clarify and also resolved to obtain opinion of ASG/SG on the order of the Hon'ble High Court dated 25.05.2016 in WP (C) No. 24 of 2015.
9. The Council office vide letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130571, dated 16.09.2016 and letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130686, dated 19.09.2016 sought the following clarification in respect of General Medicine from the college authorities and requested the Dean to appear before the PG Committee on 22.09.2016 with clarification:-

"I am directed to inform you that certain clarifications are required about the appointment/ promotion orders and service conditions of your faculty working in STNM Hospital. You are required to come and clarify the same before the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee on 22nd September, 2016 at 1:00 P.M. Please bring with you the following documents:

1. Original appointment/ promotion orders of the following faculty working in STNM (Hospital):

General Medicine:-

Unit – III

1. Dr. B.N. Sharma, Associate Prof. & Unit Head
2. Dr. Leona Sonam Lepeha, Asstt. Prof.
3. Dr. W.D. Barfunga, SR
4. Dr. Kaden Zangmu, JR

Unit – IV

1. Dr. P.M. Chettri, Associate Prof. & Unit Head
2. Dr. Phurlamu Sherpa, Asstt. Prof.
3. Dr. Sanjay Upreti, Asstt. Prof.
4. Dr. S.M. Rasaily, S.R."

10. Dr. Gurdarshan Singh Joneja, Dean, Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science and Mr. Nihar Ranjan Sahn, System Analyst Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science appeared before the P.G. Committee on 22.09.2016 and in their written statement they stated the following:

1. **Whether the faculty members and residents working in your units located in STNM Hospital are regular, full time employees of Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences or not.**

The faculty members and resident working in STNM hospital are regular and full time employee of Govt. of Sikkim and permitted to work in SMIMS as per MoU. They get honorarium from SMIMS for their services to the students of SMIMS in correspondence with letter no 18/pr.kcy/HCHS& FW dt 06/09/2006, Department of Health, GoS as per the teacher's qualification and associated teaching designation. They are regularly conducting bedside clinics and participate in teaching schedule as provided by the Dean, SMIMS.

Faculties of STNM has been permitted to be counted as part of teaching faculty of SMIMS in pursuant to the High Court Sikkim order of 27.04.2012 on 37 of 2011. MCI had filed an appeal in the Honourable Supreme Court but there is no stay on the order. So the faculty and facilities at STNM has to be considered as was done earlier in 2012-13, 2013-14.

2. **Their salary statement and TDS deduction for the last year be supplied.**

Please find attached the payment of honorium and TDS deduction statement. If so desire, we will request Government of Sikkim to provide the salary statements and will be submitted later.

3. **When the institute entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital for the first time? A copy of the MoU be supplied.**

SMIMS entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital on 16 July 2004."

11. On receipt of Council Advocate opinion the matter was considered in the P.G. Committee meeting held on 13.02.2017 and the Committee in view of the orders of the Hon'ble High Court decided to recommend for recognition of the qualifications in respect of MD(General Medicine) for the students admitted in the Course in the Academic Year 2011-12. The

decision of the P.G. Committee in this respect was communicated to the Central Government with 03 (three) other subjects vide Council letter bearing reference No. MCI-292(22)/2017-Med./169940 dated 14.02.2017.

12. Thereafter, the P.G. Committee in its meeting held on 17.03.2017 noted that the following order has been passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in I.A. No. 4 of 2016 in W.P. No. 24 of 2015 on 23.02.17:-

1. Mr. S.P. Bhutia, learned Counsel for the Respondent No. 2, has filed an Affidavit, seeking to place documents on record being four numbers of correspondence made between the MCI/Respondent No.2 and the Secretary to the Government of India, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi. The learned Counsel specifically points out that in the said correspondence dated 13.02.2017, the common thread is that the Respondent No. 2 has communicated to the Health Ministry that the order of this High Court as far as the issues of recognition of the qualifications awarded to the students in the above mentioned courses on the strength of Letter of Permission are concerned has become absolute. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee decides to recommend to the Central Govt. to recognise the degrees awarded by the affiliating University to the students admitted in said medical institute in the Postgraduate medical courses in the specialities of MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics) and MS (ENT) against the sanctioned intake capacity for the academic year 2011-12 and for MD (Psychiatry) against the sanctioned intake capacity for academic year 2012-13. That, the issue of recognition of students admitted in the subsequent batches in respect of the above-mentioned courses is under consideration. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee also decided to place this decision before the General Body of Council for information.

2. It is with regard to the second statement supra that Mr. Aman Ahluwalia, learned Counsel for the Petitioners, is aggrieved with inasmuch as, according to him there should be a time bound consideration in view of the fact that the deficiencies pointed out for MD (General Medicine) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173646 dated 09.03.16, MD (Paediatrics) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173642 dated 09.03.16, MD (Psychiatry) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/ 2015-Med./108119 dated 11.5.16 and MS (ENT) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./177696 dated 30.03.16, in the letters of the MCI/ Respondent No.2, have already been rectified, as would be evident by the compliance verification carried out by the Experts in August, 2016. Relying on the decision of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Royal Medical Trust (Registered) & Ano. vs. Union of India & Ano. : (2015) 10 SCC 19, it is pointed out that if deficiencies pointed earlier still persists and have not been removed then the applicant would be disentitled for renewal of admission or as in the instant matter recognition of degrees so far as that academic year is concerned. However, in the instant case, the University has rectified all the deficiencies pointed out and nothing remains further to be complied with.

3. Thus, in view of the Assessment Report showing that all deficiencies have been complied with, no fresh deficiencies, if any, should be taken into consideration for recognition of the Post Graduate Degrees pertaining to academic years subsequent to 2011-12, for three courses i.e. MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics) and MS (ENT) and for MD (Psychiatry) for the academic years subsequent to 2012-13. It is fairly admitted that there may have been deficiencies in MS (ENT) on the date of the assessment i.e. on 28.08.2016, however, such deficiencies have not been communicated to the Petitioners by the Respondent No.2 and in any event stand rectified now.

It is, therefore, prayed that Respondent No.2 may be directed to expedite the issue of recognition to the students admitted in the subsequent batches after the academic year 2011-12 for three courses and for MD (Psychiatry) after the academic year 2012-13.

In this regard, learned Counsel for the Respondent No.2 submits that as the matter is under consideration at least two weeks' time be granted.

Having considered submissions and in view of the fact that the compliance verification was completed in August 2016, it is expected that the MCI/Respondent No.2, would reach a decision with regard to the issue of recognition of subsequent batches at least a week prior to 4th April 2017, by which date counselling for Postgraduate courses are likely to commence as submitted by the Petitioners.

7. List on 21.03.2017."

13. The Committee was informed that the Council is preferring a Special Leave Petition before the Hon'ble Supreme Court against the said order.
14. The Postgraduate Committee considered the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 and noted the following deficiencies as under:-

(A) Central Referral Hospital (Own Hospital):

1. Dr. O.P. Dhakal has been promoted as Professor after cut-off date; however in the column of "Benefit of publications" in the faculty table, only 2 publications have been cited against requirement of 4; hence his promotion is not as per Regulations & he cannot be considered.
2. Dr. Mona Dhakal has been promoted as Professor after cut-off date; however in the column of "Benefit of publications" in the faculty table, only 2 publications have been cited against requirement of 4; hence her promotion is not as per Regulations & she cannot be considered. Resultantly, Unit-II left with only 2 faculty and it cannot be considered a PG unit.
3. In view of above, there is deficiency of faculty: (a) Asst. Prof.: 1 at own hospital.
4. The college got first LOP to start MBBS course on 2.9.2001. However, Dr. Bidita Khandelwal, Prof. & HOD have been given teaching experience from 16.8.2000 when the college was not in existence and this is not permissible. Resultantly, she was Asstt. Prof. for 3 years 11 months 15 days against the requirement of 5 years.
5. MRI workload for the whole hospital is only 06 on day of assessment.
6. Annual intake for MBBS is 100 for which 4 Units with 120 beds are required. In own hospital, there are only 2 Units with 60 beds resulting in deficiency of 2 Units & 60 beds in own hospital. The information supplied by the institution that they have sufficient facilities even in their own hospital is incorrect.

(B) STNM Hospital (Govt. Hospital):

1. Blood Component Separation Facility is not available.
 2. MRI workload for the whole hospital is only 04.
 3. Total number of patients in OPD has decreased from 54,428 to 48,417 during 3 year period.
 4. Specialty clinics like Haematology clinic, Neurology clinic are not run.
 5. MICU is not available.
 6. Equipment like Holter is not available.
 7. Investigative facilities like Nerve Conduction, EMG are not available.
 8. There are NIL publications from the department during last 3 years.
 9. Central Library is not available.
 10. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
 11. Departmental Library is not available.
 12. MRD not computerized.
 13. Deficiency of Junior Resident: 1 in Unit-I
 14. Medical ICU – number of Beds Nil.
 15. Leona Sonam Lapcha, Asst. Professor has MD Degree from Kathmandu University, which is not recognized. Resultantly, Unit left with 2 Faculty.
 16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.
15. The above clearly brings out that the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok has despite repeated opportunities failed to fulfill the requirement of the Regulations in respect of clinical material, human resources and infrastructure. Thus, the training of postgraduate students in

the discipline of **MD(General Medicine)** is not possible in the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

16. Further, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in its Order dated 25.05.16 in WP (C) No. 24/2015 has directed as under:-

"Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;"

17. The deficiencies noted above show that the college has even now not complied, despite giving an Undertaking to the effect that there are no deficiencies. Thus, the 25 Lakh rupees submitted by the College in terms of direction II stands forfeited.

18. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee Medical Education Committee decided:-

(i) To recommend to the Central Government not to recognize MD(General Medicine) qualification granted by Sikkim Manipal Univeversity of Health,Medical & Tech. Sciences in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok admitted in the course from academic year 2012-13 onwards;

(ii) To communicate the deficiencies as found in the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 to the college authorities granting them one month's time to rectify the same and submit a compliance within one month from the date of communication; and

(iii) To debar the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok from making any fresh admissions in the MD (General Medicine) course as the Institute has failed to rectify these deficiencies in terms of its undertaking tendered by it.

52. **Sikkim Manipal Univ. of Health, Medical & Tech. Sciences - Recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.**

Read: the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (June, 2015 & April, 2014) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (June, 2015 & April, 2014) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MD(Paediatrics) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok and noted as under:-

1. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Letter of Permission for starting of **MD(Paediatrics)** course to the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok was granted by the erstwhile Board of Governors in supersession of the Medical Council of India on **21.03.2011**.
2. The Postgraduate Committee further noted that Regulation 6 (2) and (3) of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulation, 2000 provides as under:
(2) The Institution shall apply for recognition of the post-graduate medical qualification to the Central Government through the affiliating University when the first admitted batch shall be due to appear for the examination to be conducted by the affiliating University.
(3) Failure to seek timely recognition as required in sub-clause (2) shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post-Graduate Course."
3. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further noted that vide Council letters dated 31.03.2015, 11.09.2015 **and 09.03.2016** it was informed inter alia to the College as under:
*"Admissions done (if any) against these **seats i.e. 02 seats** after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:*

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats."
4. The Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had applied for recognition on 11.02.2014. Subsequently, the inspection for recognition was conducted on 26.04.2014. Thereafter, the deficiencies had been communicated to the college on 21.08.2014. Compliance was received from the college vide letter dated 03.09.2014 was considered by P.G Committee on 19.03.2015 and decision was communicated to the college authorities on 31.03.2015. Compliance received from college authorities vide letter dated 30.04.2015 was considered by the PG Sub Committee at its meeting held on 26.05.2015 and the committee decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment which was verified on 26.06.2015. Compliance verification assessment report 26.06.2015 was placed before the P.G Committee at its meeting held on 28.08.2015 and deficiencies pointed out by the PG Committee were communicated to the college authorities on 11.09.2015. Compliance was received from the college authorities vide letter dated 05.10.2015. Compliance dated 05.10.2015 was placed before the P.G. Committee on 01.03.2016 and the deficiencies communicated to college on 09.03.2016.
5. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that aggrieved by the action of the Council in not recommending recognition for four Post-Graduate disciplines offered by it, namely, MD (General Medicine), MD

(Paediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) the Sikkim Manipal University and Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had preferred WP (C) No. 24 of 2015. The Institute had prayed before the Hon'ble High Court for following reliefs:-

- (A) Direct and hold that the deficiencies specified in communications dated 09-07-2015, 14-07-2015, 26-08-2015, 27-08-2015 and 11-09-2015 (as specified in paragraph 351) are either non-existent or stand complied with, and direct that recognition be accorded in terms of Section 11 of the Indian Medical Council Act, to the following courses: MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatric), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry);
 - (B) In the alternative to [A] above, direct that a fresh time bound inspection be conducted either by an independent expert committee, or by the MCI designated assessors along with eminent independent observers, and such inspection be limited to the deficiencies already pointed out and enlisted and in respect of which compliance has been forwarded by the Petitioner vide letters dated 06-08-2015 (in respect of MS - ENT), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Paediatrics) [sic], 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD -Paediatrics), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Psychiatry) and that pursuant to such inspection a final decision be taken by the Respondent No.2 in a time bound manner;
 - (C) Confirm the admissions made in the above-said courses in the academic year 2015-16; and
 - (D) Pass any order or orders as this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in the facts and circumstances of the case as well as in the interest of justice.
6. The aforesaid petition came to be disposed of on 25.05.2016. The Hon'ble High Court directed as under:
- I. As the Petitioner has asserted that no deficiency exists after compliance has been made by them, post the impugned communications in all the Post-Graduate Courses, this circumstance has to be gauged by a Compliance Verification. The Respondent No.2 shall carry out fresh inspection of the Petitioner's Institution within two months from today. The Inspection team of the Respondent No.2 shall comprise of two eminent independent observers, apart from the Assessors of Respondent No.2. Needless to add that the inspection shall be carried out in terms of Paragraph 65(v) and (vi) of the Judgment of this Court in WP(C) No.37 of 2011 dated 27-04-2012;
 - II. Pending such verification, the Petitioners shall deposit a sum of Rs.25,00,000/- (Rupees twenty five lakhs) only, with the MCI, Respondent No.2. The Petitioner shall file an undertaking through its Registrar, within two weeks from today, to the effect that no deficiencies exist in the Petitioner's Institution for the purposes of the Post-Graduate Courses, for which permission had been granted. Copy of undertaking be furnished to Respondent No.1 also. If at the time of inspection the undertaking is found to be incorrect, the deposit shall stand forfeited;
 - III. Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;
 - IV. For students who were admitted in the four Post- Graduate Courses in 2011 and have completed their Courses in 2014, qualifying them for the award to recognised medical qualification, the Respondent No.1 shall grant recognition to their Degrees within three months from today; Students pursuing their Post-Graduate Courses in the Academic year 2015-16, vide Orders of this Court dated 29-05-2015 and 07-04-2016, be allowed to continue their education without hindrance; and
 - V. I have also considered I.A. No.01 of 2016 wherein the Petitioners have sought for an Order of this Court permitting admission to be made to two seats each in MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) for the Academic Year 2016-17. Keeping in mind the welfare of the students and with the concern that they should not be kept at sea as in the instant matter, it is hereby ordered that admissions shall take place for the said Academic Year 2016-17 only after all requisites are found in place by the

Respondent No.2, irrespective of the fact that during such exercise the seats may go vacant this Academic Year.

7. Being aggrieved by the above-mentioned judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, the Council had approached the Hon'ble Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 and the same was listed on 25.07.2016. The Hon'ble Supreme Court, after hearing the parties, vide judgment dated 25.07.2016, was pleased to modify the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim to the extent that assessment team of the Council, which shall carryout the physical assessment of the said medical college, in pursuance of directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, shall include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences and another from P.G.I., Chandigarh. However, the Hon'ble Supreme Court did not interfere with the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, in respect with recognition of degrees of the students admitted in Postgraduate medical courses in the said 4 specialties in the academic year 2011-12. The relevant portion of the judgment dated 25.07.2016, passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 is reproduced herein below:

“.....

Having heard learned counsel for the parties, we direct the Medical Council of India to include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) and another Professor from P.G.I., Chandigarh, as a part of its "Assessors Team". This direction, needless to say, annihilates the concept of "independent observer". We have said so as the Professors, who would belong to A.I.I.M.S. or P.G.I. are supposed to be eminent people and they are expected to be independent....."

8. Subsequently, as directed by the Hon'ble Apex Court and the Hon'ble High Court by virtue of above referred orders assessment in the subject of MD(Paediatrics) was carried out by. Dr Pankaj Havi, Professor of Paediatrics, AIIMS, New Delhi on 29.08.2016. The assessment report dated 29.08.2016 alongwith previous assessment report was considered by the Postgraduate Education Committee in its meeting held on 16.09.2016. The Committee decided that certain clarification regarding appointment/promotion order and service condition of faculty working in STNM Hospital are required for which the Dean may called to clarify and also resolved to obtain opinion of ASG/SG on the order of the Hon'ble High Court dated 25.05.2016 in WP (C) No. 24 of 2015.
9. The Council office vide letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130571, dated 16.09.2016 and letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130686, dated 19.09.2016 sought the following clarification in respect of MD(Paediatrics) from the college authorities and requested the Dean to appear before the PG Committee on 22.09.2016 with clarification:-

"I am directed to inform you that certain clarifications are required about the appointment/ promotion orders and service conditions of your faculty working in STNM Hospital. You are required to come and clarify the same before the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee on 22nd September, 2016 at 1:00 P.M. Please bring with you the following documents:

2. *Original appointment/ promotion orders of the following faculty working in STNM (Hospital):*

MD(Paediatrics)

Unit – 2

1. Dr. Chandrika Chettri, Associate Professor
2. Dr. Nedup Doma Bhutia, Asstt. Prof.
3. Dr. Jigme T. Bhutia, Asstt. Prof.
4. Dr. Sumita Tamang, Asstt. Prof.

5. Dr. Sanjeev Kr. Prasad, Senior Resident
6. Dr. Ruth Yonzon, Senior Resident
7. Dr. Chandra Kr. Nepal, Senior Resident
8. Dr. Amrita Gurung, Senior Resident

10. Dr. Gurdarshan Singh Joneja, Dean, Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science and Mr. Nihar Ranjan Sahn, System Analyst Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science appeared before the P.G. Committee on 22.09.2016 and in their written statement they stated the following:

1. Whether the faculty members and residents working in your units located in STNM Hospital are regular, full time employees of Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences or not.

The faculty members and resident working in STNM hospital are regular and full time employee of Govt. of Sikkim and permitted to work in SMIMS as per MoU. They get honorarium from SMIMS for their services to the students of SMIMS in correspondence with letter no 18/pr.kcy/HCHS& FW dt 06/09/2006, Department of Health, GoS as per the teacher's qualification and associated teaching designation. They are regularly conducting bedside clinics and participate in teaching schedule as provided by the Dean, SMIMS.

Faculties of STNM has been permitted to be counted as part of teaching faculty of SMIMS in pursuant to the High Court Sikkim order of 27.04.2012 on 37 of 2011. MCI had filed an appeal in the Honourable Supreme Court but there is no stay on the order. So the faculty and facilities at STNM has to be considered as was done earlier in 2012-13, 2013-14.

2. Their salary statement and TDS deduction for the last year be supplied.

Please find attached the payment of honorium and TDS deduction statement. If so desire, we will request Government of Sikkim to provide the salary statements and will be submitted later.

3. When the institute entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital for the first time? A copy of the MoU be supplied.

SMIMS entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital on 16 July 2004."

11. On receipt of Council Advocate opinion the matter was considered in the P.G. Committee meeting held on 13.02.2017 and the Committee in view of the orders of the Hon'ble High Court decided to recommend for recognition of the qualifications in respect of MD(Paediatrics) for the students admitted in the Course in the Academic Year 2011-12. The decision of the P.G. Committee in this respect was communicated to the Central Government with 03 (three) other subjects vide Council letter bearing reference No. MCI-292(22)/2017-Med./169945 dated 14.02.2017.

12. Thereafter, the P.G. Committee in its meeting held on 17.03.2017 noted that the following order has been passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in I.A. No. 4 of 2016 in W.P. No. 24 of 2015

1. Mr. S.P. Bhutia, learned Counsel for the Respondent No. 2, has filed an Affidavit, seeking to place documents on record being four numbers of correspondence made between the MCI/Respondent No.2 and the Secretary to the Government of India, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi. The learned Counsel specifically points out that in the said correspondence dated 13.02.2017, the common thread is that the

Respondent No. 2 has communicated to the Health Ministry that the order of this High Court as far as the issues of recognition of the qualifications awarded to the students in the above mentioned courses on the strength of Letter of Permission are concerned has become absolute. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee decides to recommend to the Central Govt. to recognise the degrees awarded by the affiliating University to the students admitted in said medical institute in the Postgraduate medical courses in the specialities of MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics) and MS (ENT) against the sanctioned intake capacity for the academic year 2011-12 and for MD (Psychiatry) against the sanctioned intake capacity for academic year 2012-13. That, the issue of recognition of students admitted in the subsequent batches in respect of the above-mentioned courses is under consideration. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee also decided to place this decision before the General Body of Council for information.

2. It is with regard to the second statement supra that Mr. Aman Ahluwalia, learned Counsel for the Petitioners, is aggrieved with inasmuch as, according to him there should be a time bound consideration in view of the fact that the deficiencies pointed out for MD (General Medicine) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173646 dated 09.03.16, MD (Paediatrics) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173642 dated 09.03.16, MD (Psychiatry) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./108119 dated 11.5.16 and MS (ENT) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./177696 dated 30.03.16, in the letters of the MCI/ Respondent No.2, have already been rectified, as would be evident by the compliance verification carried out by the Experts in August, 2016. Relying on the decision of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Royal Medical Trust (Registered) & Ano. vs. Union of India & Ano. : (2015) 10 SCC 19, it is pointed out that if deficiencies pointed earlier still persists and have not been removed then the applicant would be disentitled for renewal of admission or as in the instant matter recognition of degrees so far as that academic year is concerned. However, in the instant case, the University has rectified all the deficiencies pointed out and nothing remains further to be complied with.

3. Thus, in view of the Assessment Report showing that all deficiencies have been complied with, no fresh deficiencies, if any, should be taken into consideration for recognition of the Post Graduate Degrees pertaining to academic years subsequent to 2011-12, for three courses i.e. MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics) and MS (ENT) and for MD (Psychiatry) for the academic years subsequent to 2012-13. It is fairly admitted that there may have been deficiencies in MS (ENT) on the date of the assessment i.e. on 28.08.2016, however, such deficiencies have not been communicated to the Petitioners by the Respondent No.2 and in any event stand rectified now.

It is, therefore, prayed that Respondent No.2 may be directed to expedite the issue of recognition to the students admitted in the subsequent batches after the academic year 2011-12 for three courses and for MD (Psychiatry) after the academic year 2012-13.

In this regard, learned Counsel for the Respondent No.2 submits that as the matter is under consideration at least two weeks' time be granted.

Having considered submissions and in view of the fact that the compliance verification was completed in August 2016, it is expected that the MCI/Respondent No.2, would reach a decision with regard to the issue of recognition of subsequent batches at least a week prior to 4th April 2017, by which date counselling for Postgraduate courses are likely to commence as submitted by the Petitioners.

7. List on 21.03.2017."

13. The Committee was informed that the Council is preferring a Special Leave Petition before the Hon'ble Supreme Court against the said order.
14. The Postgraduate Committee noted that following deficiencies are noted in the assessment of the college held on 29.08.2016:

(A) Central Referral Hospital (Own Hospital):

1. Annual intake for MBBS is 100 for which 2 Units with 60 beds are required. In own hospital, there is only 1 Unit with 30 beds resulting in deficiency of 1 Unit & 30 beds in own hospital. Hence, it is wrong to say that they are self sufficient even in their own hospital.
2. MRI workload for the whole hospital is only 06 on day of assessment. From Paediatrics department it was NIL.
3. Parenteral Nutrition services are not fully provided.
4. Departmental Library is not available.

(B) STNM Hospital (Govt. Hospital)

1. Blood Component Separation Facility is not available.
2. Seven Specialty clinics are not run.
3. PICU is not available.
4. Equipment like Paediatric Endoscope, Paediatric Ventilator, Paediatric Bronchoscope, PFT, ABG Analyzer are not available.
5. Functional status & Availability of equipment are not provided.
6. Dialysis beds are not available.
7. Parenteral Nutrition services are not fully provided.
8. MRI workload for the whole hospital is only 04.
9. There are NIL publications from the department during last 3 years.
10. Central Research laboratory is not available.
11. Departmental Library is not available.
12. MRD not computerized.
13. Bed Occupancy in NICU was 45%
14. Academic parameters: Journal Club in last 12 months were 6 and Group Discussions were 8, which are very inadequate.
15. SAF has been altered. In the report of STNM Hospital, at Item No. 12 of Part II Departmental information pertaining to Speciality clinics, out of 10 Speciality Clinics included in the proforma, details of 7 clinics have been deleted to include only 3 clinics which are actually run.
15. The above clearly brings out that the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok has despite repeated opportunities failed to fulfill the requirement of Regulations in respect of clinical material, human resources and infrastructure. Thus, the training of postgraduate students in the discipline of **MD(Paediatrics)** is not possible in the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.
16. Further, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in its Order dated 25.05.16 in WP (C) No. 24/2015 has directed as under:-

"Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;"

17. The deficiencies noted above show that the college has even now not complied, despite giving an Undertaking to the effect that there are no deficiencies. Thus, the 25 Lakh rupees submitted by the College in terms of direction II stands forfeited.
18. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee Medical Education Committee decides as under:-

(i) To recommend to the Central Government not to recognize MD(Paediatrics) qualification granted by Sikkim Manipal University of Health, Medical & Tech. Sciences in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok admitted in the course from academic year 2012-13 onwards;

(ii) To communicate the deficiencies as found in the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 to the college authorities granting them one month's time to rectify the same and submit a compliance within one month from the date of communication; and

(iii) To debar the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok from making any fresh admissions in the MD (Paediatrics) course as the Institute has failed to rectify these deficiencies in terms of its undertaking tendered by it.

53. Sikkim Manipal Univ. of Health, Medical & Tech. Sciences - Recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification for 3 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

Read: the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (March, 2016) (April, 2015) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification for 3 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (March, 2016) (April, 2015) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MD(Psychiatry) qualification for 3 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok and noted as under:-

1. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Letter of Permission for starting of **MD(Psychiatry)** course to the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok was granted by the erstwhile Board of Governors in supersession of the Medical Council of India on **20.04.2012**.
2. The Postgraduate Committee further noted that Regulation 6 (2) and (3) of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulation, 2000 provides as under:

(2) The Institution shall apply for recognition of the post-graduate medical qualification to the Central Government through the affiliating University when the first admitted batch shall be due to appear for the examination to be conducted by the affiliating University.

(3) Failure to seek timely recognition as required in sub-clause (2) shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post-Graduate Course."

3. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further noted that vide Council letters dated 27.08.2015, 11.05.2016, 09.03.2016 it was informed inter alia to the College as under:

*“Admissions done (if any) against these **seats i.e. 03 seats** after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:*

“This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject.”

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats.”

4. The Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had applied for recognition on 20.11.2014. Subsequently, the inspection for recognition was conducted on 27.04.2015. Thereafter, the deficiencies had been communicated to the college on 27.08.2015. Compliance was received from the college vide letter dated 05.10.2015 was considered by P.G Sub Committee on 15.02.2016 and decided to verify the compliance by way of assessment which was verified on 28.03.2016. Compliance verification assessment report 28.03.2016 was placed before the P.G Committee at its meeting held on 06.05.2016 and deficiencies pointed out by the PG Committee were communicated to the college authorities on 11.05.2016.

5. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that aggrieved by the action of the Council in not recommending recognition for four Post-Graduate disciplines offered by it, namely, MD (General Medicine), MD (Pediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) the Sikkim Manipal University and Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had preferred WP (C) No. 24 of 2015. The Institute had prayed before the Hon'ble High Court for following reliefs:-

- (A) *Direct and hold that the deficiencies specified in communications dated 09-07-2015, 14-07-2015, 26-08-2015, 27-08-2015 and 11-09-2015 (as specified in paragraph 351) are either non-existent or stand complied with, and direct that recognition be accorded in terms of Section 11 of the Indian Medical Council Act, to the following courses: MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatric), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry);*
- (B) *In the alternative to [A] above, direct that a fresh time bound inspection be conducted either by an independent expert committee, or by the MCI designated assessors along with eminent independent observers, and such inspection be limited to the deficiencies already pointed out and enlisted and in respect of which compliance has been forwarded by the Petitioner vide letters dated 06-08-2015 (in respect of MS - ENT), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Paediatrics) [sic], 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD -Paediatrics), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Psychiatry) and that pursuant to such inspection a final decision be taken by the Respondent No.2 in a time bound manner;*
- (C) *Confirm the admissions made in the above-said courses in the academic year 2015-16; and*
- (D) *Pass any order or orders as this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in the facts and circumstances of the case as well as in the interest of justice.*

6. The aforesaid petition came to be disposed of on 25.05.2016. The Hon'ble High Court directed as under:

- I. *As the Petitioner has asserted that no deficiency exists after compliance has been made by them, post the impugned communications in all the Post-Graduate Courses, this circumstance has to be gauged by a Compliance Verification. The Respondent No.2 shall carry out fresh inspection of the Petitioner's Institution within two months from today. The Inspection team of the Respondent No.2 shall comprise of two eminent independent observers, apart from the Assessors of Respondent No.2. Needless to add that the inspection shall be carried out in terms of Paragraph 65(v) and (vi) of the Judgment of this Court in WP(C) No.37 of 2011 dated 27-04-2012;*
- II. *Pending such verification, the Petitioners shall deposit a sum of Rs.25,00,000/- (Rupees twenty five lakhs) only, with the MCI, Respondent No.2. The Petitioner shall file an undertaking through its Registrar, within two weeks from today, to the effect that no deficiencies exist in the Petitioner's Institution for the purposes of the Post-Graduate Courses, for which permission had been granted. Copy of undertaking be furnished to Respondent No.1 also. If at the time of inspection the undertaking is found to be incorrect, the deposit shall stand forfeited;*
- III. *Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;*
- IV. *For students who were admitted in the four Post- Graduate Courses in 2011 and have completed their Courses in 2014, qualifying them for the award to recognised medical qualification, the Respondent No.1 shall grant recognition to their Degrees within three months from today; Students pursuing their Post-Graduate Courses in the Academic year 2015-16, vide Orders of this Court dated 29-05-2015 and 07-04-2016, be allowed to continue their education without hindrance; and*
- V. *I have also considered I.A. No.01 of 2016 wherein the Petitioners have sought for an Order of this Court permitting admission to be made to two seats each in MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) for the Academic Year 2016-17. Keeping in mind the welfare of the students and with the concern that they should not be kept at sea as in the instant matter, it is hereby ordered that admissions shall take place for the said Academic Year 2016-17 only after all requisites are found in place by the Respondent No.2, irrespective of the fact that during such exercise the seats may go vacant this Academic Year.*

7. Being aggrieved by the above-mentioned judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, the Council had approached the Hon'ble Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 and the same was listed on 25.07.2016. The Hon'ble Supreme Court, after hearing the parties, vide judgment dated 25.07.2016, was pleased to modify the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim to the extent that assessment team of the Council, which shall carryout the physical assessment of the said medical college, in pursuance of directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, shall include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences and another from P.G.I., Chandigarh. However, the Hon'ble Supreme Court did not interfere with the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, in respect with recognition of degrees of the students admitted in Postgraduate medical courses in the said 4 specialties in the academic year 2011-12. The relevant portion of the judgment dated 25.07.2016, passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 is reproduced herein below:

“.....

Having heard learned counsel for the parties, we direct the Medical Council of India to include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences

(AIIMS) and another Professor from P.G.I., Chandigarh, as a part of its "Assessors Team". This direction, needless to say, annihilates the concept of "independent observer". We have said so as the Professors, who would belong to A.I.I.M.S. or P.G.I. are supposed to be eminent people and they are expected to be independent....."

8. Subsequently, as directed by the Hon'ble Apex Court and the Hon'ble High Court by virtue of above referred orders assessment in the subject of Psychiatry was carried out by Dr. Pratap Sharan, Professor of Psychiatry, AIIMS, New Delhi on 29.08.2016. The assessment report dated 29.08.2016 alongwith previous assessment report was considered by the Postgraduate Education Committee in its meeting held on 16.09.2016. The Committee decided that certain clarification regarding appointment/promotion order and service condition of faculty working in STNM Hospital are required for which the Dean may called to clarify and also resolved to obtain opinion of ASG/SG on the order of the Hon'ble High Court dated 25.05.2016 in WP (C) No. 24 of 2015.
9. The Council office vide letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130571, dated 16.09.2016 and letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130686, dated 19.09.2016 sought the following clarification in respect of MD(Psychiatry) from the college authorities and requested the Dean to appear before the PG Committee on 22.09.2016 with clarification:-

"I am directed to inform you that certain clarifications are required about the appointment/ promotion orders and service conditions of your faculty working in STNM Hospital. You are required to come and clarify the same before the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee on 22nd September, 2016 at 1:00 P.M. Please bring with you the following documents:

3. *Original appointment/ promotion orders of the following faculty working in STNM (Hospital):*

MD(Psychiatry)

Unit – I

1. *Dr. Netra Thapa, Asstt. Professor*
2. *Dr. C.S. Sharma, S.R*
3. *Dr. Geota Gurung, S.R.*

10. Dr. Gurdarshan Singh Joneja, Dean, Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science and Mr. Nihar Ranjan Sahn, System Analyst Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science appeared before the P.G. Committee on 22.09.2016 and in their written statement they stated the following:

1. ***Whether the faculty members and residents working in your units located in STNM Hospital are regular, full time employees of Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences or not.***

The faculty members and resident working in STNM hospital are regular and full time employee of Govt. of Sikkim and permitted to work in SMIMS as per MoU. They get honorarium from SMIMS for their services to the students of SMIMS in correspondence with letter no 18/pr.kcy/HCHS& FW dt 06/09/2006, Department of Health, GoS as per the teacher's qualification and associated teaching designation. They are regularly conducting bedside clinics and participate in teaching schedule as provided by the Dean, SMIMS.

Faculties of STNM has been permitted to be counted as part of teaching faculty of SMIMS in pursuant to the High Court Sikkim order of 27.04.2012 on 37 of 2011. MCI had filed an appeal in the Honourable Supreme Court but there is no stay on the order. So the faculty and facilities at STNM has to be considered as was done earlier in 2012-13, 2013-14.

2. Their salary statement and TDS deduction for the last year be supplied.

Please find attached the payment of honorium and TDS deduction statement. If so desire, we will request Government of Sikkim to provide the salary statements and will be submitted later.

3. When the institute entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital for the first time? A copy of the MoU be supplied.

SMIMS entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital on 16 July 2004."

11. On receipt of Council Advocate opinion the matter was considered in the P.G. Committee meeting held on 13.02.2017 and the Committee in view of the orders of the Hon'ble High Court decided to recommend for recognition of the qualifications in respect of MD(Psychiatry) for the students admitted in the Course in the Academic Year 2011-12. The decision of the P.G. Committee in this respect was communicated to the Central Government with 03 (three) other subjects vide Council letter bearing reference No. MCI-292(22)/2017-Med./169950 dated 14.02.2017.
12. Thereafter, the P.G. Committee in its meeting held on 17.03.2017 noted that the following order has been passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in I.A. No. 4 of 2016 in W.P. No. 24 of 2015

1. *Mr. S.P. Bhutia, learned Counsel for the Respondent No. 2, has filed an Affidavit, seeking to place documents on record being four numbers of correspondence made between the MCI/Respondent No.2 and the Secretary to the Government of India, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi. The learned Counsel specifically points out that in the said correspondence dated 13.02.2017, the common thread is that the Respondent No. 2 has communicated to the Health Ministry that the order of this High Court as far as the issues of recognition of the qualifications awarded to the students in the above mentioned courses on the strength of Letter of Permission are concerned has become absolute. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee decides to recommend to the Central Govt. to recognise the degrees awarded by the affiliating University to the students admitted in said medical institute in the Postgraduate medical courses in the specialities of MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics) and MS (ENT) against the sanctioned intake capacity for the academic year 2011-12 and for MD (Psychiatry) against the sanctioned intake capacity for academic year 2012-13. That, the issue of recognition of students admitted in the subsequent batches in respect of the above-mentioned courses is under consideration. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee also decided to place this decision before the General Body of Council for information.*

2. *It is with regard to the second statement supra that Mr. Aman Ahluwalia, learned Counsel for the Petitioners, is aggrieved with inasmuch as, according to him there should be a time bound consideration in view of the fact that the deficiencies pointed out for MD (General Medicine) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173646 dated 09.03.16, MD (Paediatrics) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173642 dated 09.03.16, MD (Psychiatry) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/ 2015-Med./108119 dated 11.5.16 and MS (ENT) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./177696 dated 30.03.16, in the letters of the MCI/ Respondent No.2, have already been rectified, as would be evident by the compliance verification carried out by the Experts in August, 2016. Relying on the decision of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Royal Medical Trust (Registered) & Ano. vs. Union of India & Ano. : (2015) 10 SCC 19, it is pointed out that if deficiencies pointed earlier still persists and*

have not been removed then the applicant would be disentitled for renewal of admission or as in the instant matter recognition of degrees so far as that academic year is concerned. However, in the instant case, the University has rectified all the deficiencies pointed out and nothing remains further to be complied with.

3. Thus, in view of the Assessment Report showing that all deficiencies have been complied with, no fresh deficiencies, if any, should be taken into consideration for recognition of the Post Graduate Degrees pertaining to academic years subsequent to 2011-12, for three courses i.e. MD (General Medicine), MD (Pediatrics) and MS (ENT) and for MD (Psychiatry) for the academic years subsequent to 2012-13. It is fairly admitted that there may have been deficiencies in MS (ENT) on the date of the assessment i.e. on 28.08.2016, however, such deficiencies have not been communicated to the Petitioners by the Respondent No.2 and in any event stand rectified now.

It is, therefore, prayed that Respondent No.2 may be directed to expedite the issue of recognition to the students admitted in the subsequent batches after the academic year 2011-12 for three courses and for MD (Psychiatry) after the academic year 2012-13.

In this regard, learned Counsel for the Respondent No.2 submits that as the matter is under consideration at least two weeks' time be granted.

Having considered submissions and in view of the fact that the compliance verification was completed in August 2016, it is expected that the MCI/Respondent No.2, would reach a decision with regard to the issue of recognition of subsequent batches at least a week prior to 4th April 2017, by which date counselling for Postgraduate courses are likely to commence as submitted by the Petitioners.

7. List on 21.03.2017."

13. The Committee was informed that the Council is preferring a Special Leave Petition before the Hon'ble Supreme Court against the said order.

14. The Postgraduate Committee considered the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 and noted that following deficiencies:

(A): Central Referral Hospital (Own Hospital):

1. Chronic Psychiatry Care facility is not available.
2. MRI workload for the whole hospital is only 06.

(B): STNM Hospital: (Govt. Hospital):

1. Dr. C.S. Sharma, Senior Resident does not possess any experience as Resident before appointment as Senior Resident; hence not qualified to hold the post.
2. Blood Component Separation Facility is not available.
3. There is only 1 faculty in the Unit; hence it cannot be considered as a teaching Unit.
4. The only Unit has 22 beds against requirement of 30; hence Unit complement is incomplete.
5. OPD attendance on day of assessment is only 30.
6. Bed occupancy is 45 % on day of assessment.
7. NIL Specialty clinics are run.
8. MRI workload for the whole hospital is only 04 on day of assessment.
9. There are NIL publications from the department during last 3 years.
10. Departmental Library is not available.
11. CPC is not held.

15. The above clearly brings out that the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok has despite repeated opportunities failed to fulfill the requirement of Regulations in respect of clinical material, human resources and infrastructure. Thus, the training of postgraduate students in the discipline of **MD(Psychiatry)** is not possible in the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

16. Further, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in its Order dated 25.05.16 in WP (C) No. 24/2015 has directed as under:-

"Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;"

17. The deficiencies noted above show that the college has even now not complied, despite giving an Undertaking to the effect that there are no deficiencies. Thus, the 25 Lakh rupees submitted by the College in terms of direction II stands forfeited.

18. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee Medical Education Committee decides as under:-

(i) To recommend to the Central Government not to recognize MD(Psychiatry) qualification granted by Sikkim Manipal University of Health, Medical & Tech. Sciences in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok admitted in the course from academic year 2013-14 onwards;

(ii) To communicate the deficiencies as found in the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 to the college authorities granting them one month's time to rectify the same and submit a compliance within one month from the date of communication; and

(iii) To debar the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok from making any fresh admissions in the MD (Psychiatry) course as the Institute has failed to rectify these deficiencies in terms of its undertaking tendered by it.

54. Sikkim Manipal Univ. of Health, Medical & Tech. Scs - Recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

Read: the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (Feb., 2016, Feb., 2015 & April, 2014) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the matter along with Assessment Report dated 29.08.2016 carried in pursuance of the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court with One Prof. from AIIMS, New Delhi as well as previous assessment reports (Feb., 2016, Feb., 2015 & April, 2014) and order dated 25.07.2016 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, order dated 25.05.2016 and 23.02.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, Gangtok with and letter dated 03.06.2016 and subsequent letter dated 22.09.2016 received from Registrar, Sikkim Manipal University for recognition of MS(ENT) qualification for 02 seats in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok and noted as under:-

1. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Letter of Permission for starting of **MS(ENT)** course to the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok was granted by the erstwhile Board of Governors in supersession of the Medical Council of India on **21.03.2011**.

2. The Postgraduate Committee further noted that Regulation 6 (2) and (3) of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulation, 2000 provides as under:

(2) The Institution shall apply for recognition of the post-graduate medical qualification to the Central Government through the affiliating University when the first admitted batch shall be due to appear for the examination to be conducted by the affiliating University.

(3) Failure to seek timely recognition as required in sub-clause (2) shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post-Graduate Course."

3. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee further noted that vide Council letters dated 01.04.2015, 09.07.2015, 30.03.2016 it was informed inter alia to the College as under:

*"Admissions done (if any) against these **seats i.e. 02 seats** after the first batch appeared in Examination till their recognition will be irregular/ illegal and not in accordance with MCI regulations (notified with prior permission of Central Government vide notification dated 21/07/2009) and will not be recognized. As per provisions of the Postgraduate Medical Education Regulations, 2000, failure to seek timely recognition as required shall invariably result in stoppage of admission to the concerned Post Graduate Course. This is also clarified in the letter of permission granted u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 issued for these seats, which reads as under:*

"This permission for starting/ increase of seats in the above course and admission of students will be till such time the first batch of students admitted against the above course appears for the first final examination in the subject."

In case, the college authorities desire to submit compliance, same should be received in this office preferably within four weeks of issue of this letter but definitely, prior to next admission so that the matter of recognition can be finally decided. If no compliance is received within this period or compliance/ compliance verification is found unsatisfactory, it will result in stoppage of admission to the postgraduate course against the above mentioned seats."

4. The Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had applied for recognition on 11.02.2014. Subsequently, the inspection for recognition was conducted on **26.04.2014**. Thereafter, the deficiencies had been communicated to the college on 31.07.2014. Compliance received from the college vide letter dated 26.08.2014 was considered by P.G Committee on 30.09.2014 and P.G Committee decided to verify compliance by way of assessment and same was verified on 17.02.2015. Compliance verification assessment report was considered by the P.G. Committee on 19.03.2015. The deficiencies pointed out by the P.G. Committee were communicated to the college on 01.04.2015. Compliance was received from college authorities vide letter dated 30.04.2015, the same was placed before the PG Committee on 23.06.2015 and deficiencies pointed out by the PG Committee were communicated to the college authorities on 09.07.2015. Compliance was received from the college authorities vide letter dated 06.08.2015. Compliance dated 06.08.2015 was placed before the P.G. Sub Committee on 15.02.2016 and decided to verify compliance by way of assessment and the same was verified on 26.02.2016. Compliance verification assessment report was considered by the P.G. Committee on 23.03.2016. The deficiencies as pointed out by the P.G. Committee were communicated to the college on 30.03.2016. Compliance was received from the college authorities vide letter dated 27.04.2016. Compliance received from the college was considered by P.G Committee on 03.06.2016.

5. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that aggrieved by the action of the Council in not recommending recognition for four Post-Graduate disciplines offered by it, namely, MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) the Sikkim Manipal University and Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok had preferred WP (C) No. 24 of 2015. The Institute had prayed before the Hon'ble High Court for following reliefs:-

- (A) *Direct and hold that the deficiencies specified in communications dated 09-07-2015, 14-07-2015, 26-08-2015, 27-08-2015 and 11-09-2015 (as specified in paragraph 351) are either non-existent or stand complied with, and direct that recognition be accorded in terms of Section 11 of the Indian Medical Council Act, to the following courses: MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatric), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry);*
- (B) *In the alternative to [A] above, direct that a fresh time bound inspection be conducted either by an independent expert committee, or by the MCI designated assessors along with eminent independent observers, and such inspection be limited to the deficiencies already pointed out and enlisted and in respect of which compliance has been forwarded by the Petitioner vide letters dated 06-08-2015 (in respect of MS - ENT), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Paediatrics) [sic], 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD -Paediatrics), 05-10-2015 (in respect of MD - Psychiatry) and that pursuant to such inspection a final decision be taken by the Respondent No.2 in a time bound manner;*
- (C) *Confirm the admissions made in the above-said courses in the academic year 2015-16; and*
- (D) *Pass any order or orders as this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in the facts and circumstances of the case as well as in the interest of justice.*

6. The aforesaid petition came to be disposed of on 25.05.2016. The Hon'ble High Court directed as under:

- I. *As the Petitioner has asserted that no deficiency exists after compliance has been made by them, post the impugned communications in all the Post-Graduate Courses, this circumstance has to be gauged by a Compliance Verification. The Respondent No.2 shall carry out fresh inspection of the Petitioner's Institution within two months from today. The Inspection team of the Respondent No.2 shall comprise of two eminent independent observers, apart from the Assessors of Respondent No.2. Needless to add that the inspection shall be carried out in terms of Paragraph 65(v) and (vi) of the Judgment of this Court in WP(C) No.37 of 2011 dated 27-04-2012;*
- II. *Pending such verification, the Petitioners shall deposit a sum of Rs.25,00,000/- (Rupees twenty five lakhs) only, with the MCI, Respondent No.2. The Petitioner shall file an undertaking through its Registrar, within two weeks from today, to the effect that no deficiencies exist in the Petitioner's Institution for the purposes of the Post-Graduate Courses, for which permission had been granted. Copy of undertaking be furnished to Respondent No.1 also. If at the time of inspection the undertaking is found to be incorrect, the deposit shall stand forfeited;*
- III. *Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;*
- IV. *For students who were admitted in the four Post- Graduate Courses in 2011 and have completed their Courses in 2014, qualifying them for the award to recognised medical qualification, the Respondent No.1 shall grant recognition to their Degrees within three months from today; Students pursuing their Post-Graduate Courses in the Academic year 2015-16, vide Orders of this Court dated 29-05-2015 and 07-04-2016, be allowed to continue their education without hindrance; and*
- V. *I have also considered I.A. No.01 of 2016 wherein the Petitioners have sought for an Order of this Court permitting admission to be made to two seats each in MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics), MS (ENT) and MD (Psychiatry) for the*

Academic Year 2016-17. Keeping in mind the welfare of the students and with the concern that they should not be kept at sea as in the instant matter, it is hereby ordered that admissions shall take place for the said Academic Year 2016-17 only after all requisites are found in place by the Respondent No.2, irrespective of the fact that during such exercise the seats may go vacant this Academic Year.

7. Being aggrieved by the above-mentioned judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim, the Council had approached the Hon'ble Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 and the same was listed on 25.07.2016. The Hon'ble Supreme Court, after hearing the parties, vide judgment dated 25.07.2016, was pleased to modify the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim to the extent that assessment team of the Council, which shall carryout the physical assessment of the said medical college, in pursuance of directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, shall include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences and another from P.G.I., Chandigarh. However, the Hon'ble Supreme Court did not interfere with the directions passed by the Hon'ble High Court, in respect with recognition of degrees of the students admitted in Postgraduate medical courses in the said 4 specialties in the academic year 2011-12. The relevant portion of the judgment dated 25.07.2016, passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP (C) No. 19119 of 2016 is reproduced herein below:

"

Having heard learned counsel for the parties, we direct the Medical Council of India to include one Professor from All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) and another Professor from P.G.I., Chandigarh, as a part of its "Assessors Team". This direction, needless to say, annihilates the concept of "independent observer". We have said so as the Professors, who would belong to A.I.I.M.S. or P.G.I. are supposed to be eminent people and they are expected to be independent....."

8. Subsequently, as directed by the Hon'ble Apex Court and the Hon'ble High Court by virtue of above referred orders, assessment in the subject of **MS(ENT)** was carried out by Dr. Rakesh Kumar, Add. Professor, AIIMS, New Delhi on 29.08.2016. The assessment report dated 29.08.2016 alongwith previous assessment reports were considered by the Postgraduate Education Committee in its meeting held on 16.09.2016. The Committee decided that certain clarification regarding appointment/promotion order and service condition of faculty working in STNM Hospital are required for which the Dean may called to clarify and also resolved to obtain opinion of ASG/SG on the order of the Hon'ble High Court dated 25.05.2016 in WP (C) No. 24 of 2015.
9. The Council office vide letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130571, dated 16.09.2016 and letter No. MCI-23(1)/2016/Med./130686, dated 19.09.2016 sought the following clarification in respect of **MS(ENT)** from the college authorities and requested the Dean to appear before the PG Committee on 22.09.2016 with clarification:-

"I am directed to inform you that certain clarifications are required about the appointment/ promotion orders and service conditions of your faculty working in STNM Hospital. You are required to come and clarify the same before the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee on 22nd September, 2016 at 1:00 P.M. with the original MoU with the State Government for use of STNM Hospital as a teaching Hospital."

10. Dr. Gurdarshan Singh Joneja, Dean, Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science and Mr. Nihar Ranjan Sahn, System Analyst Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Science appeared before the P.G. Committee on 22.09.2016 and in their written statement they stated the following:

1. Whether the faculty members and residents working in your units located in STNM Hospital are regular, full time employees of Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences or not.

The faculty members and resident working in STNM hospital are regular and full time employee of Govt. of Sikkim and permitted to work in SMIMS as per MoU. They get honorarium from SMIMS for their services to the students of SMIMS in correspondence with letter no 18/pr.kcy/HCHS& FW dt 06/09/2006, Department of Health, GoS as per the teacher's qualification and associated teaching designation. They are regularly conducting bedside clinics and participate in teaching schedule as provided by the Dean, SMIMS.

Faculties of STNM has been permitted to be counted as part of teaching faculty of SMIMS in pursuant to the High Court Sikkim order of 27.04.2012 on 37 of 2011. MCI had filed an appeal in the Honourable Supreme Court but there is no stay on the order. So the faculty and facilities at STNM has to be considered as was done earlier in 2012-13, 2013-14.

2. Their salary statement and TDS deduction for the last year be supplied.

Please find attached the payment of honorium and TDS deduction statement. If so desire, we will request Government of Sikkim to provide the salary statements and will be submitted later.

3. When the institute entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital for the first time? A copy of the MoU be supplied.

SMIMS entered into Memorandum of Understanding with the State Government about the use of STNM Hospital on 16 July 2004."

11. On receipt of Council Advocate opinion the matter was considered in the P.G. Committee meeting held on 13.02.2017 and the Committee in view of the orders of the Hon'ble High Court decided to recommend for recognition of the qualifications in respect of **MS(ENT)** for the students admitted in the Course in the Academic Year 2011-12. The decision of the P.G. Committee in this respect was communicated to the Central Government with 03 (three) other subjects vide Council letter bearing reference No. MCI-292(22)/2017-Med./169936 dated 14.02.2017.

12. Thereafter, the P.G. Committee in its meeting held on 17.03.2017 noted that the following order has been passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in I.A. No. 4 of 2016 in W.P. No. 24 of 2015

1. *Mr. S.P. Bhutia, learned Counsel for the Respondent No. 2, has filed an Affidavit, seeking to place documents on record being four numbers of correspondence made between the MCI/Respondent No.2 and the Secretary to the Government of India, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi. The learned Counsel specifically points out that in the said correspondence dated 13.02.2017, the common thread is that the Respondent No. 2 has communicated to the Health Ministry that the order of this High Court as far as the issues of recognition of the qualifications awarded to the students in the above mentioned courses on the strength of Letter of Permission are concerned has become absolute. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee decides to recommend to the Central Govt. to recognise the degrees awarded by the affiliating University to the students admitted in said medical institute in the Postgraduate medical courses in the specialities of MD (General Medicine), MD (Pediatrics) and MS (ENT) against the sanctioned intake capacity for the academic year 2011-12 and for MD (Psychiatry) against the sanctioned intake capacity for academic year 2012-13. That, the issue of recognition of students admitted in the subsequent batches in respect*

of the above-mentioned courses is under consideration. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee also decided to place this decision before the General Body of Council for information.

2. It is with regard to the second statement *supra* that

Mr. Aman Ahluwalia, learned Counsel for the Petitioners, is aggrieved with inasmuch as, according to him there should be a time bound consideration in view of the fact that the deficiencies pointed out for MD (General Medicine) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173646 dated 09.03.16, MD (Paediatrics) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./173642 dated 09.03.16, MD (Psychiatry) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/ 2015-Med./108119 dated 11.5.16 and MS (ENT) vide letter bearing Reference No. MCI-292(22)/2015-Med./177696 dated 30.03.16, in the letters of the MCI/ Respondent No.2, have already been rectified, as would be evident by the compliance verification carried out by the Experts in August, 2016. Relying on the decision of the Hon'ble Apex Court in *Royal Medical Trust (Registered) & Ano. vs. Union of India & Ano. : (2015) 10 SCC 19*, it is pointed out that if deficiencies pointed earlier still persists and have not been removed then the applicant would be disentitled for renewal of admission or as in the instant matter recognition of degrees so far as that academic year is concerned. However, in the instant case, the University has rectified all the deficiencies pointed out and nothing remains further to be complied with.

3. Thus, in view of the Assessment Report showing that all deficiencies have been complied with, no fresh deficiencies, if any, should be taken into consideration for recognition of the Post Graduate Degrees pertaining to academic years subsequent to 2011-12, for three courses i.e. MD (General Medicine), MD (Paediatrics) and MS (ENT) and for MD (Psychiatry) for the academic years subsequent to 2012-13. It is fairly admitted that there may have been deficiencies in MS (ENT) on the date of the assessment i.e. on 28.08.2016, however, such deficiencies have not been communicated to the Petitioners by the Respondent No.2 and in any event stand rectified now.

It is, therefore, prayed that Respondent No.2 may be directed to expedite the issue of recognition to the students admitted in the subsequent batches after the academic year 2011-12 for three courses and for MD (Psychiatry) after the academic year 2012-13.

In this regard, learned Counsel for the Respondent No.2 submits that as the matter is under consideration at least two weeks' time be granted.

Having considered submissions and in view of the fact that the compliance verification was completed in August 2016, it is expected that the MCI/Respondent No.2, would reach a decision with regard to the issue of recognition of subsequent batches at least a week prior to 4th April 2017, by which date counselling for Postgraduate courses are likely to commence as submitted by the Petitioners.

7. List on 21.03.2017."

13. The Committee was informed that the Council is preferring a Special Leave Petition before the Hon'ble Supreme Court against the said order.
14. The Postgraduate Committee considered the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 and noted the following deficiencies:

(A) Central Referral Hospital: (Own Hospital)

1. At item § 28 of Summary on P. 10, 2 Associate Professors are shown. However in the faculty table in Part II Departmental Information, on P. 16-17, no Associate Professor is shown in the only Unit. This discrepancy needs to be clarified. Resultantly faculty complement in the only Unit is incomplete & it cannot be considered as PG Unit.
2. Average Bed occupancy of randomly selected days is 70 %.
3. There was only 1 Major Operation on day of assessment against requirement of minimum 3. Average of randomly selected days is only 2 which also is inadequate.

4. Total workload of Major Operations in 2015 was only 160 implying daily average of 0.53 which is grossly inadequate.
 5. Workload of BERA investigation was only 61 in 2015 implying daily average of 0.2.
 6. Workload of Speech Therapy was only 154 in 2015 implying daily average of 0.51.
 7. Workload of Direct Laryngoscopy, Foreign Body Removal, Myringotomy is NIL during preceding last 3 years.
 8. Investigative facilities like Nerve Conduction, EMG are not available.
 9. MRI workload on day of assessment is only 06.
 10. College got first LoP on 31/08/2001. As per earlier report 02/09/2001. Professor & HoD, Dr. Suvamoy Chakraborti has been given experience from November, 2000. Resultantly, he was Asst. Professor for 4 years 2 months. His promotion is irregular.
 11. No Assoc. Professor in the department.
 12. Faculty table not signed by any Faculty.
 13. 3 years clinical material given in Table 8 of summary and in table 10 of SAF Part-II do not tally any parameter. This indicates data is non-genuine.
 14. Academic parameters: Journal Club – 8.
15. The above clearly brings out that the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok has despite repeated opportunities failed to fulfill the requirement of the Regulations in respect of clinical material, human resources and infrastructure. Thus, the training of postgraduate students in the discipline of **MS(ENT)** is not possible in the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok.
 16. Further, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee noted that the Hon'ble High Court of Sikkim in its Order dated 25.05.16 in WP (C) No. 24/2015 has directed as under:-

"Deficiencies, if any, reported by the Assessment Team shall be brought to the notice of the Petitioner extending the opportunity to the Petitioner to rectify it within a time frame deemed fit, of course, for which the amount deposited as already stated, would stand forfeited to the MCI;"
 17. The deficiencies noted above show that the college has even now not complied, despite giving an Undertaking to the effect that there are no deficiencies. Thus, the 25 Lakh rupees submitted by the College in terms of direction II stands forfeited.
 18. Accordingly, the Postgraduate Committee Medical Education Committee decides as under:-
 - (i) To recommend to the Central Government not to recognize MS(ENT) qualification granted by Sikkim Manipal University of Health, Medical & Tech. Sciences in respect of students being trained at Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok admitted in the course from academic year 2012-13 onwards;
 - (ii) To communicate the deficiencies as found in the assessment report dated 29.08.2016 to the college authorities granting them one month's time to rectify the same and submit a compliance within one month from the date of communication; and
 - (iii) To debar the Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok from making any fresh admissions in the MS (ENT) course as the Institute has failed to rectify these deficiencies in terms of its undertaking tendered by it.

105. Starting of DM (Medical Gastroenterology) course at Nizam's Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under NIMS Deemed University, Telangana U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (03/02/2017) and compliance dated 04/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of DM (Medical Gastroenterology) course at Nizam's Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under NIMS Deemed University, Telangana U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (03/02/2017) and compliance dated 04/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities and noted the following:

1. Dr. B. Sukanya not eligible. She is DNB from non teaching. No 3 years teaching experience in a Medical College when appointed as Asst.Prof. She was promoted Assoc.Prof. in 2016 after cut-off date without any publications. 2nd publication is a review article and 3rd a case report. None of them in a research article and hence cannot be considered. Resultantly, there is no Assoc.Professor in the Department.
2. Deficiency of specialty clinic stays as such.
3. Institute is running DNB course in many specialties.
4. Deficiency of EGS stays as such.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report.

In view of the above, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to grant letter of permission for Starting of DM (Medical Gastroenterology) course at Nizam's Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under NIMS Deemed University, Telangana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

106. Starting of DM (Pulmonary Medicine) course at ESI-PGIMER, ESI Hospital, Basaidarapur, New Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, Delhi U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (06/02/2017) and compliance dated 01/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of DM (Pulmonary Medicine) course at ESI-PGIMER, ESI Hospital, Basaidarapur, New Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, Delhi U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (06/02/2017) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for Starting of DM (Pulmonary Medicine) course at ESI-PGIMER, ESI Hospital, Basaidarapur, New Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, Delhi u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act, 1956 prospectively i.e. from the academic session 2017-2018 restricting the number of admissions to 02 (Two) students per year, till the first batch admitted appears in the final examination of the said course. The Teaching Institution be advised to apply for recognition of the qualification at the time of first available examination as per the provision of Section 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

107. Starting of M.Ch. (Surgical Oncology) course at Yenepoya Medical College, Karnataka under Yenepoya University, Road, Deralakatte, Mangalore, Karnataka U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read:the Council Assessor's Report (07/02/2017) and compliance dated 24/02/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of M.Ch. (Surgical Oncology) course at Yenepoya Medical College, Karnataka under Yenepoya University, Road, Deralakatte, Mangalore, Karnataka U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (07/02/2017) and compliance dated 24/02/2017 submitted by the college authorities and noted the following:

1. HOD is Assoc.Prof.
2. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

In view of the above, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to grant letter of permission for Starting of M.Ch. (Surgical Oncology) course at Yenepoya Medical College, Karnataka under Yenepoya University, Road, Deralakatte, Mangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

108. Starting of DM (Neonatology) course at Gandhi Medical College, Secunderabad, Andhra Pradesh under Kaloji Narayana Rao University of Health Sciences, Warangal U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read:the Council Assessor's Report (07/02/2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of DM (Neonatology) course at Gandhi Medical College, Secunderabad, Andhra Pradesh under Kaloji Narayana Rao University of Health Sciences, Warangal U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (07/02/2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities and noted the following:

- 1) No faculty has DM(Neonatology) nor 2 years special training in neonatology, at the time of appointment in neonatology, work experience on a faculty position cannot be counted as special training deficiency stage as such.
- 2) Deficiency 4 & 5 stay as such the only unit has 40 beds & no equipments for parental notification.
- 3) In the faculty table provided. No experience details as Assistant & Associate Professor are given in the case of Professor Dr J Venkateshwar Rao.
- 4) No experience Details as Assistant Professor are given in respect of Dr K Madhusuda, Assoc. Prof. without which his eligibility cannot be decided.
- 5) None of the two SR has 3 years experience as Junior Resident in Neonatology
- 6) Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

In view of the above, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to grant letter of

permission for Starting of DM (Neonatology) course at Gandhi Medical College, Secunderabad, Andhra Pradesh under Kaloji Narayana Rao University of Health Sciences, Warangal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

109. Starting of DM (Nephrology) course at Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University Medical College & Hospital, Sangli, Maharashtra under Bharati Vidyapeeth University (Deemed), Pune U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read:the Council Assessor's Report (31st January 2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of DM (Nephrology) course at Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University Medical College & Hospital, Sangli, Maharashtra under Bharati Vidyapeeth University (Deemed), Pune U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (31st January 2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities and noted the following:

Compliance not satisfactory.

1. There is no Associate Professor in the department.
2. Lithotripsy not available.
3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

In view of the above, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to grant letter of permission for Starting of DM (Nephrology) course at Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University Medical College & Hospital, Sangli, Maharashtra under Bharati Vidyapeeth University (Deemed), Pune u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

110. Starting of M.Ch (Surgical Gastroenterology/G.I. Surgery) course at Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Institute of Medical Sciences, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh under King Georges Medical University,Lucknow U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (30th January 2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of M.Ch (Surgical Gastroenterology/G.I. Surgery) course at Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Institute of Medical Sciences, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh under King Georges Medical University,Lucknow U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (30th January 2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities and noted the following:

1. Dr. Anshuman Pandey Professor and HOD has neither M.Ch. qualification nor 2 years special training in Surgical Gastroenterology. Senior Residency cannot be counted as special training.
2. Workload of procedure like Lino-Renal shunt is very low (only one in 2016). No transplant surgery is being done.

3. None of the Sr. Residents have 3 years experience as Junior Resident in Surgical Gastroenterology.
4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

In view of the above, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to grant letter of permission for Starting of M.Ch (Surgical Gastroenterology/G.I. Surgery) course at Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Institute of Medical Sciences, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh under King Georges Medical University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

111. Starting of M.Ch (Surgical Gastroenterology) course at Seth GS Medical College, Mumbai, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18- consideration of compliance.

Read: the Council Assessor's Report (3rd February 2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities for Starting of M.Ch (Surgical Gastroenterology) course at Seth GS Medical College, Mumbai, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik U/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Council Assessor's Report (3rd February 2017) and compliance dated 03/03/2017 submitted by the college authorities and noted the following:

- (1) There is no Professor in department. It is headed by Addl. Professor which is not as per regulations.
- (2) Bhushan Bhela is DNB from non-teaching hospital. He has no 3 years teaching experience in a medical college when appointment assistant professor. Hence, not eligible
- (3) Experience details of faculty in different ranks not provided in faculty table without which their eligibility cannot be decided.
- (4) Bed Strength in department is 40, which is not as per regulations.
- (5) Institute is running DNB course simultaneously in the department with same staff.
- (6) Other deficiencies as pointed out in the Assessment Report

In view of the above, the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee decided to recommend to the Central Government not to grant letter of permission for Starting of M.Ch. (Surgical Gastroenterology) course at Seth GS Medical College, Mumbai, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The minutes of this item is read and confirmed in this meeting itself.

112. Increase of PG seats in Govt. Medical Colleges – recommended for increase of seats – req.

Read: the letter dated 03/03/2017 received from the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi with regard to increase of seats in postgraduate courses in respect of remaining eligible Government Medical Colleges.

The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee considered the Central Government letter No. U.12011/25/2016-ME-I (FTS.3090566) dated 03/03/2017

requesting the Council therein to consider the increase of seats in postgraduate courses in respect of remaining eligible Government Medical Colleges, the Medical Council of India vide Circular dated 03/03/2017 had communicated to the Dean/ Principal of all the Government Medical Colleges; the Director of all the Postgraduate Medical Institutes and the Director, Medical Education of all the states to submit department-wise information with regard to details of teaching faculty i.e. Professor and Assoc. Professor with their designation-wise teaching experience, the number of units as well as unit-wise bed strength of only clinical degree courses, which are recognized/ permitted by the MCI/ MOHFW.

All the information received from the Government Medical Colleges/ Govt. PG Institutes till 09/03/2017 have been considered by the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee at its meeting held on 17/03/2017. The Postgraduate Medical Education Committee had considered all the applications, which were received as per format sent by MCI and which contained information about faculty/ units/ beds in every unit/ Declaration Forms of faculty with supporting documents, etc. and decided to recommend to the Central Government, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi as under:

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
1	Andhra Pradesh	Andhra Medical College, Visakhapatnam	MD (General Medicine)	16 to 20
2			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	8 to 10
3			MD (Psychiatry)	7 to 10
4			MS (General Surgery)	11 to 19
5			MS (ENT)	6 to 7
6			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	1 to 3
7		Guntur Medical College, Guntur	MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 5
8		Kurnool Medical College, Kurnool	MD (General Medicine)	12 to 20
9			MD (Paediatrics)	5 to 8
10			MD (Anaesthesia)	6 to 7
11			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	3 to 6
12			MS (General Surgery)	10 to 20
13			MS (Orthopaedics)	8 to 11
14			MS (ENT)	4 to 5
15			MS (OBG)	6 to 7
16		Rajiv Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa	MD (General Medicine)	3 to 12
17			MS (OBG)	3 to 7
18			MS (ENT)	1 to 3
19			MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 3
20		Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada	MD (General Medicine)	10 to 20
21			MD (Paediatrics)	5 to 6
22			MS (Ophthalmology)	6 to 8
23			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	1 to 3
24			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 3
25		S V Medical College, Tirupati	MD (DVL)	2 to 4
26			MS (General Surgery)	12 to 19

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended	
27			MD (Anaesthesia)	3 to 8	
28			MS (OBG)	9 to 16	
29		Siddhartha Medical College, Vijayawada	MD (General Medicine)	8 to 14	
30			MD (Anaesthesia)	5 to 12	
31			MS (General Surgery)	4 to 14	
32			MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 8	
33			MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 8	
34			Sri Venkateswara Institute of Medical Sciences, Tirupati	MD (General Medicine)	4 to 9
35				MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	2 to 7
36		MD (Radio-Therapy)		2 to 3	
37		MD (Nuclear Medicine)		2 to 4	
38		MD (Anaesthesia)		8 to 9	
39	Assam	Assam Medical College, Dibrugarh	MD (General Medicine)	12 to 23	
40			MS (General Surgery)	14 to 22	
41			MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 11	
42			MS (OBG)	8 to 9	
43			MS (Ophthalmology)	8 to 9	
44			MD (Paediatrics)	7 to 9	
45			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	5 to 9	
46			MD (Anaesthesia)	5 to 9	
47			MD (Psychiatry)	3 to 4	
48			Gauhati Medical College, Guwahati	MD (General Medicine)	17 to 22
49		MS (General Surgery)		15 to 19	
50		MS (Orthopaedics)		5 to 11	
51		MS (OBG)		13 to 18	
52		MS (Ophthalmology)		6 to 7	
53		MD (Radio-Diagnosis)		6 to 8	
54		MD (Anaesthesia)		6 to 10	
55		MD (DVL)		4 to 5	
56		MD (Psychiatry)		5 to 6	
57		MD (Respiratory Medicine)		2 to 4	
58			Lokopriya Gopinath Bordoloi Regional Institute of Mental Health, Tezpur	MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 7
59		Silchar Medical College, Silchar		MD (General Medicine)	7 to 12
60				MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 7
61				MD (DVL)	1 to 4
62				MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 3
63				MS (General Surgery)	8 to 14
64				MS (Orthopaedics)	4 to 8
65				MS (OBG)	3 to 4
66				MS (Ophthalmology)	3 to 4
67		Bihar	Darbhanga Medical	MS (OBG)	8 to 12

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended		
68		College, Lehriasarai	MD (Paediatrics)	5 to 7		
69			MS (Orthopaedics)	4 to 7		
70			MD (General Medicine)	13 to 18		
71		Indira Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Sheikhpura, Patna	Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur	MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 17	
72				MD (General Medicine)	3 to 9	
73				MS (General Surgery)	2 to 9	
74				MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 5	
75				Nalanda Medical College, Patna	MS (OBG)	3 to 9
76					MS (General Surgery)	4 to 15
77					MS (ENT)	2 to 4
78					MD (DVL)	2 to 3
79				Patna Medical College, Patna	MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 3
80				Chhattisgarh	Pt. J.N.M. Medical College, Raipur	MS (OBG)
81	MD (General Medicine)	12 to 17				
82	MS (General Surgery)	9 to 14				
83	MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 9				
84	MD (Radio-Therapy)	1 to 6				
85	Delhi	Institute of Human Behaviour & Allied Sciences (IHBAS)	MD (Psychiatry)	4 to 8		
86			Kasturba Hospital, New Delhi	MS (OBG)	6 to 8	
87		Lady Hardinge Medical College, New Delhi	MD (DVL)	4 to 5		
88			MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 5		
89			MD (Paediatrics)	20 to 25		
90		University College of Medical Sciences & GTB Hospital, New Delhi	MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	6 to 11		
91			MD (Anaesthesia)	12 to 23		
92			MS (Ophthalmology)	4 to 5		
93			MD (Paediatrics)	9 to 15		
94		Vardhman Mahavir Medical College & Safdarjung Hospital, Delhi	MD (DVL)	4 to 5		
95			MD (Anaesthesia)	11 to 65		
96			MD (General Medicine)	20 to 24		
97			MD (Sports Medicine)	4 to 5		
98			MS (General Surgery)	7 to 21		
99			MS (Orthopaedics)	12 to 15		
100			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	7 to 21		
101	Gujarat	Ahmedabad Municipal Coporation Medical Education Trust Medical College, Ahmedabad	MD (General Medicine)	5 to 13		
102			MS (General Surgery)	5 to 16		
103			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	1 to 4		
104			MS (ENT)	1 to 4		
105			MS (Ophthalmology)	1 to 4		
106			MS (OBG)	3 to 11		

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
107			MD (DVL)	1 to 4
108			MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 10
109		B.J Medical College, Ahmedabad	MD (Emergency Medicine)	2 to 4
110			MD (Paediatrics)	11 to 15
111			MS (General Surgery)	24 to 28
112			MS (Orthopaedics)	13 to 16
113			MD (Radio-Therapy)	4 to 9
114			MD (General Medicine)	23 to 28
115			MD (Anaesthesia)	44 to 45
116			MD (IHBT)	2 to 4
117		GMERS Medical College, Sola, Ahmedabad	MS (OBG)	3 to 8
118		Govt. Medical College, Surat	MD (DVL)	2 to 3
119			MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 3
120			MS (Ophthalmology)	5 to 7
121			MS (General Surgery)	13 to 15
122		Medical College, Baroda	MD (Anaesthesia)	11 to 15
123			MD (Psychiatry)	3 to 4
124			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 3
125			MS (Orthopaedics)	7 to 13
126			MS (General Surgery)	15 to 21
127			MD (Paediatrics)	7 to 8
128			MS (OBG)	6 to 14
129		Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot	MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 5
130			MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 8
131			MD (DVL)	3 to 4
132			MD (Psychiatry)	3 to 4
133		Smt. N.H.L.Municipal Medical College, Ahmedabad	MD (General Medicine)	27 to 32
134			MS (General Surgery)	27 to 32
135			MD (Emergency Medicine)	2 to 6
136			MS (OBG)	24 to 32
137			MS (Orthopaedics)	13 to 16
138		Surat Municipal Institute of Medical Education & Research, Surat	MD (Respiratory Medicine)	3 to 4
139			MS (General Surgery)	5 to 16
140	Himachal Pradesh	Dr. Rajendar Prasad Government Medical College, Tanda, H.P	MS (ENT)	2 to 3
141			MS (OBG)	3 to 15
142	Jammu & Kashmir	Government Medical College, Jammu	MS (OBG)	9 to 12
143			MS (ENT)	6 to 9
144			MD (DVL)	3 to 5
145			MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 5
146			MS (General Surgery)	16 to 19
147		Government Medical College, Srinagar	MD (Paediatrics)	8 to 13
148			MS (General Surgery)	13 to 17
149		Sher-I-Kashmir Instt. Of Medical Sciences, Srinagar	MS (OBG)	5 to 6
150			MS (Orthopaedics)	2 to 5

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
151			MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 3
152			MD (Anaesthesia)	14 to 20
153			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	7 to 16
154	Jharkhand	Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences, Ranchi	MS (General Surgery)	16 to 24
155			MS (ENT)	4 to 5
156	Karnataka	Bangalore Medical College & Research Institute, Bangalore	MD (General Medicine)	19 to 32
157			MS (General Surgery)	24 to 28
158			MS (OBG)	7 to 11
159		Belgaum Institute of Medical Sciences, Belgaum	MD (DVL)	2 to 3
160			MD (Paediatrics)	1 to 5
161		Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Bangalore	MS (General Surgery)	6 to 12
162			MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 10
163			MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 6
164			MS (OBG)	6 to 9
165		Government Medical College, Mysore	MD (General Medicine)	11 to 17
166			MS (Orthopaedics)	4 to 5
167			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	5 to 10
168		Indira Gandhi Institute of Child Health, Bangalore	MD (Paediatrics)	9 to 19
169		Karnataka Institute of Medical Sciences, Hubli	MD (General Medicine)	12 to 16
170			MS (OBG)	5 to 6
171			MS (Orthopaedics)	4 to 6
172			MS (ENT)	4 to 5
173			MD (Paediatrics)	6 to 7
174		Kidwai Memorial Institute of Oncology, Bangalore	MD (Radio-Therapy)	4 to 6
175		Mandya Institute of Medical Sciences, Mandya	MD (DVL)	1 to 4
176			MS (ENT)	1 to 4
177			MS (Ophthalmology)	1 to 4
178			MD (General Medicine)	4 to 11
179		Sanjay Gandhi Institute of Trauma & Orthopaedics, Bangalore	MS (Orthopaedics)	1 to 10
180		Vijaynagar Institute of Medical Sciences, Bellary	MS (OBG)	6 to 12
181			MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 11
182			MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 8
183			MD (DVL)	2 to 4
184			MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 4
185	Kerala	Govt. Medical College, Kozhikode	MD (DVL)	5 to 7
186			MS (General Surgery)	16 to 19
187			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	5 to 8
188			MD (Radio-Therapy)	2 to 4
189		Medical College, Thiruvananthapuram	MS (Orthopaedics)	6 to 14
190			MD (DVL)	5 to 6
191			MD (Paediatrics)	9 to 21
192			MD (Psychiatry)	3 to 11

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
193			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	3 to 7
194			MD (Radio-Therapy)	3 to 6
195			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	4 to 6
196			MS (OBG)	11 to 27
197		T.D. Medical College, Alleppy (Allappuzha)	MD (General Medicine)	7 to 16
198			MD (Paediatrics)	4 to 5
199	Madhya Pradesh	Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal	MS (Orthopaedics)	5 to 11
200			MD (Paediatrics)	7 to 8
201			MD (General Medicine)	14 to 18
202			MS (General Surgery)	12 to 16
203			MD (Anaesthesia)	8 to 13
204			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	2 to 3
205		MGM Medical College, Indore	MD (General Medicine)	12 to 14
206			MS (General Surgery)	12 to 20
207			MS (Orthopaedics)	5 to 8
208			MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 6
209		Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur	MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 7
210			MS (Ophthalmology)	3 to 4
211		Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa	MD (General Medicine)	8 to 11
212		Maharashtra	B.J. Govt. Medical College, Pune	MD (Respiratory Medicine)
213	MS (Orthopaedics)			6 to 8
214	MD (Paediatrics)			5 to 7
215	MD (Anaesthesia)			10 to 11
216	MS (General Surgery)			15 to 17
217	MS (Ophthalmology)			3 to 4
218	Dr Vaishampayan Memorial Medical College, Solapur		MS (OBG)	5 to 6
219	Dr. Shankarrao Chavan Govt. Medical College, Nanded		MS (General Surgery)	3 to 9
220			MS (OBG)	3 to 4
221			MS (Orthopaedics)	1 to 6
222			MS (Ophthalmology)	1 to 2
223			MS (ENT)	2 to 3
224			MD (General Medicine)	2 to 9
225	Government Medical College, Akola		MS (OBG)	2 to 7
226			MD (DVL)	2 to 3
227	Government Medical College, Aurangabad		MS (General Surgery)	7 to 20
228		MS (ENT)	2 to 3	
229	Government Medical College, Latur	MS (Ophthalmology)	1 to 3	
230		MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	1 to 4	
231	Government Medical College, Miraj	MS (General Surgery)	7 to 12	
232		MS (OBG)	4 to 6	

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
233			MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 8
234		Government Medical College, Nagpur	MS (General Surgery)	13 to 22
235			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	4 to 5
236			MS (OBG)	7 to 13
237			MD (DVL)	3 to 5
238			MD (Paediatrics)	5 to 8
239			MD (General Medicine)	11 to 24
240			Grant Medical College, Mumbai	MD (General Medicine)
241		MS (Ophthalmology)		6 to 12
242		MS (General Surgery)		14 to 27
243		MD (Paediatrics)		9 to 11
244		MD (Psychiatry)		2 to 4
245		MD (Radio-Diagnosis)		3 to 5
246		Indira Gandhi Medical College & Hospital, Nagpur	MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 4
247			MS (ENT)	2 to 3
248			MD (General Medicine)	6 to 12
249			MS (OBG)	4 to 7
250			MS (Orthopaedics)	1 to 6
251			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	2 to 3
252			MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 4
253		Lokmanya Tilak Municipal Medical College, Sion, Mumbai	MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	5 to 10
254			MD (General Medicine)	17 to 22
255			MS (General Surgery)	16 to 20
256			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	3 to 4
257		Seth G. S. Medical College, Mumbai	MS (General Surgery)	12 to 21
258			MS (ENT)	4 to 5
259		SRTR Medical College, Ambajogai	MS (ENT)	2 to 3
260			MD (Anaesthesia)	3 to 4
261		Topiwala National Medical College, Mumbai	MD (General Medicine)	14 to 18
262			MD (Paediatrics)	9 to 11
263			MS (Ophthalmology)	4 to 6
264			MS (OBG)	7 to 8
265			MD (Anaesthesia)	14 to 17
266	Manipur	Jawaharlal Nehru Institute of Medical Sciences, Porompat, Imphal	MD (Anaesthesia)	5 to 6
267			MS (OBG)	2 to 9
268			MS (General Surgery)	4 to 10
269	Odisha	MKCG Medical College, Berhampur	MS (Ophthalmology)	7 to 9
270		SCB Medical College, Cuttack	MD (General Medicine)	20 to 29
271			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	5 to 6

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
272			MD (Psychiatry)	4 to 5
273			MD (DVL)	5 to 6
274			MS (General Surgery)	19 to 24
275			MS (Orthopaedics)	6 to 14
276			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	5 to 6
277			MS (Ophthalmology)	6 to 9
278		Veer Surendra Sai Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Burla	MD (Paediatrics)	6 to 9
279			MS (General Surgery)	13 to 18
280			MS (Ophthalmology)	4 to 6
281			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	4 to 5
282	Punjab	Govt. Medical College, Patiala	MS (OBG)	9 to 12
283			MS (Ophthalmology)	5 to 6
284			MD (Psychiatry)	2 to 3
285		Guru Govind Singh Medical College, Faridkot	MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 7
286			MS (ENT)	2 to 6
287			MD (General Medicine)	3 to 10
288			MS (General Surgery)	4 to 11
289			MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 5
290			MD (DVL)	3 to 7
291			MD (Psychiatry)	3 to 4
292			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	1 to 3
293			MS (Orthopaedics)	2 to 5
294			MD (Anaesthesia)	2 to 12
295			Rajasthan	Dr. S.N. Medical College Jodhpur
296	MD (DVL)	4 to 5		
297	MS (ENT)	2 to 4		
298	MS (Orthopaedics)	5 to 11		
299	MS (OBG)	10 to 20		
300	Govt. Medical College, Kota	MD (General Medicine)		8 to 22
301		MD (Psychiatry)		4 to 5
302		MD (Respiratory Medicine)		3 to 5
303		MS (ENT)		2 to 3
304		MS (Orthopaedics)		6 to 10
305	Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer	MD (Anaesthesia)		6 to 14
306		MS (ENT)		3 to 5
307		MS (Ophthalmology)		4 to 6
308		MD (Paediatrics)		6 to 11
309	Jhalawar Medical College, Jhalawar	MD (General Medicine)		4 to 16
310		MS (OBG)		2 to 10
311		MS (Orthopaedics)		2 to 10
312		MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 8	
313		MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 15	
314	RNT Medical College, Udaipur	MD (DVL)	3 to 5	
315	Sardar Patel Medical	MD (General)	14 to 24	

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
		College, Bikaner	Medicine)	
316			MS (Ophthalmology)	4 to 6
317			MD (Radio-Therapy)	4 to 9
318		SMS Medical College, Jaipur	MD (General Medicine)	24 to 45
319			MD (DVL)	4 to 6
320			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	9 to 18
321			MD (Paediatrics)	21 to 33
322			MS (General Surgery)	23 to 24
323			MS (Orthopaedics)	18 to 30
324			MS (OBG)	30 to 48
325			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	6 to 12
326			MD (Anaesthesia)	34 to 70
327			MD (Radio-Therapy)	2 to 6
328			MD (Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation)	4 to 8
329	Tamil Nadu	Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu	MD (General Medicine)	3 to 10
330			MD (DVL)	1 to 4
331		Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore	MD (Paediatrics)	3 to 4
332			MS (OBG)	4 to 8
333			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	2 to 5
334			MS (Orthopaedics)	6 to 8
335		ESI-PGIMSR, ESI Hospital, K.K Nagar, Chennai	MD (Anaesthesia)	3 to 6
336		Government Vellore Medical College, Vellore	MD (General Medicine)	4 to 10
337		Kanyakumari Government Medical College, Kanyakumari	MD (Anaesthesia)	2 to 6
338		KAP Viswanatham Government Medical College, Trichy	MD (General Medicine)	4 to 14
339			MS (OBG)	2 to 9
340			MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 13
341			MD (Psychiatry)	1 to 4
342		Mohankumaramangalam Medical College, Salem	MS (General Surgery)	6 to 12
343			MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 10
344			MS (OBG)	3 to 6
345		Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar	MS (General Surgery)	15 to 18
346			MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 4
347			MS (ENT)	3 to 4
348		Stanley Medical College, Chennai	MD (General Medicine)	20 to 23
349			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	3 to 6
350			MS (Orthopaedics)	3 to 9
351			MS (ENT)	4 to 5
352		Thanjavur Medical College, Thanjavur	MS (OBG)	5 to 8
353			MS (Ophthalmology)	2 to 4

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended
354		Theni Govt. Medical College, Theni	MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 6
355		Tirunelveli Medical College, Tirunelveli	MS (General Surgery)	10 to 20
356			MS (ENT)	1 to 4
357			MS (Ophthalmology)	1 to 4
358			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 4
359			MD (Psychiatry)	1 to 4
360	Telangana	Gandhi Medical College, Secunderabad	MS (General Surgery)	14 to 20
361			MS (ENT)	4 to 6
362			MS (Ophthalmology)	4 to 5
363		Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal	MD (General Medicine)	11 to 22
364			MS (General Surgery)	10 to 19
365			MS (Orthopaedics)	6 to 12
366			MS (Ophthalmology)	4 to 5
367			MS (OBG)	4 to 10
368			MD (Paediatrics)	6 to 9
369		Uttar Pradesh	BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur	MD (Paediatrics)
370	MS (OBG)			3 to 7
371	MD (Anaesthesia)			3 to 6
372	GSVM Medical College, Kanpur		MD (Radio-Therapy)	2 to 4
373			MS (ENT)	3 to 6
374	Institute of Medical Sciences, BHU, Varanasi		MD (General Medicine)	16 to 17
375			MD (Paediatrics)	8 to 10
376			MS (General Surgery)	16 to 20
377			MS (Ophthalmology)	6 to 8
378			MD (Radio-Therapy)	3 to 5
379	Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Aligarh		MD (Radio-Therapy)	1 to 2
380			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 6
381			MD (Anaesthesia)	7 to 9
382			MS (General Surgery)	14 to 21
383			MS (Orthopaedics)	4 to 6
384			MD (Psychiatry)	1 to 3
385			MD (DVL)	2 to 5
386	King George's Medical University, Lucknow		MD (Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation)	2 to 4
387			MS (OBG)	11 to 21
388	Maharani Laxmi Bai Medical College, Jhansi	MD (General Medicine)	4 to 11	
389		MS (General Surgery)	6 to 12	
390		MS (OBG)	5 to 6	
391		MS (Ophthalmology)	3 to 4	
392		MS (ENT)	1 to 2	
393	S. N. Medical College, Agra	MD (Radio-Therapy)	2 to 3	
394	West Bengal	Bankura Sammilani Medical College, Bankura	MS (General Surgery)	7 to 17
395			MS (OBG)	6 to 15

S. No.	State	Name of the College	Name of the Course	Seats recommended	
396			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	2 to 6	
397			MD (DVL)	2 to 3	
398			MD (Anaesthesia)	6 to 11	
399		Burdwan Medical College, Burdwan	MS (General Surgery)	6 to 18	
400			MD (Anaesthesia)	6 to 11	
401			MD (General Medicine)	6 to 13	
402			MS (Orthopaedics)	6 to 10	
403			MD (Paediatrics)	5 to 13	
404			MD (DVL)	2 to 3	
405			MS (OBG)	10 to 13	
406			MD (Radio-Therapy)	2 to 5	
407			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 3	
408			MD (Radio-Diagnosis)	4 to 5	
409			Calcutta National Medical College, Kolkata	MS (OBG)	10 to 16
410				MS (ENT)	2 to 5
411		MD (DVL)		2 to 3	
412		Chittaranjan Seva Sadan Hospital, Kolkata	MS (OBG)	2 to 10	
413			MD (Paediatrics)	2 to 4	
414		Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education & Research, Kolkata	MD (General Medicine)	13 to 15	
415			MD (Paediatrics)	7 to 9	
416			MD (Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation)	3 to 6	
417		Medical College, Kolkata	MS (OBG)	15 to 22	
418			MD (Paediatrics)	9 to 12	
419			MS (Ophthalmology)	13 to 22	
420			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	2 to 6	
421			MD (Psychiatry)	1 to 3	
422			MS (ENT)	4 to 6	
423			MD (Radio-Therapy)	6 to 8	
424		Nilratan Sircar Medical College, Kolkata	MD (Radiodiagnosis)	2 to 9	
425			MD (Radio-Therapy)	2 to 6	
426			MS (Ophthalmology)	5 to 6	
427			MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 12	
428		North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling	MD (Anaesthesia)	4 to 11	
429		RG Kar Medical College, Kolkata	MS (Ophthalmology)	1 to 6	
430			MD (DVL)	1 to 3	
431			MD (Psychiatry)	3 to 4	
432			MD (Respiratory Medicine)	6 to 10	
433			MS (ENT)	4 to 6	
434			MS (OBG)	14 to 25	
435			MD (Radio-Therapy)	4 to 6	

Agenda Item No. 3 to 104 of 17th March, 2017 is adjourned for next meeting of the Postgraduate Medical Education Committee.

Meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

(Dr. Reena Nayyar)
Secretary I/c

**New Delhi, dated the
17th March, 2017**

APPROVED

(Dr. Siri Bhagwan Siwach)
Chairman

